VOICES OF HAITIAN TEACHERS: TEACHER PERCEPTION OF PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN HAITI
AN INTERPRETIVE PHENOMENOLOGICAL ANALYSIS

A thesis presented
by
Sarah-Jane Quessa Coupet
to
The School of Education

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Education

in the field of Education

The College of Professional Studies
Northeastern University
Boston, Massachusetts
March 2015
ABSTRACT

Developing quality teachers is at the center of education reform around the world and researchers concur that quality in-service teacher professional development can lead to improved instruction and student learning. Currently, though, there is no empirical research on in-service professional development in Haiti. This qualitative study explores the experiences and perceptions of teachers in Haiti using an Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) model. Because this population’s experience has not been well represented in the literature, this study explored how teachers in Haiti experience and perceive their professional development. Grounded in theory of andragogy, and framed in Critical Race Theory (CRT). The researcher conducted semi-structured interviews with nine teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti. The interviews were translated, transcribed, coded and analyzed; in addition, a reflexivity journal was maintained to capture the researcher’s biases. The study reveals that teachers in Haiti perceive professional development as an opportunity for self-improvement, an avenue for improving students learning through content knowledge and instructional practice, and a way to contribute to colleagues’ development.

This study suggested that teachers are both extrinsically and intrinsically motivated to participate in professional development seminars and to pursue higher education. This was noted to be for the improvement of student learning and to support their colleague’s development. This study lends to research on teacher motivation, teacher learning and collaborative learning communities. Additional research is needed to address the type of professional development that is most beneficial to teachers in rural regions of Haiti.

Keywords: in-service teacher professional development, teacher professional development in Haiti, Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis, critical race theory, theory of andragogy
Dedication

This work is dedicated to my first teacher, mentor and inspiration, my mother Carmelite Pierre.

Thank you, because without your strength, inspiration and encouragement I would not be me.
Thank you for creating a foundation for me and being the potomitan for our family.

Meci pou tout sacrific ou fe pou mwen rive la!
Acknowledgement

“I can do all things through Christ who strengthens me” 2-Corinthians 5:17

I thank God for the gift and ability to learn and grow. It is only through the grace of God that I am able to work towards achieving my purpose in life.

To my husband Dr. Sidney Coupet: Thank you for your unrelenting support, dedication to my success and always believing in me.

To my siblings and their spouses: I thank you for being role models and life mentors. Thank you for teaching me the value of education and holding high standards for me. To my niece, and nephews, you are all such amazing people; I strive to live my purpose so I too can serve as a role model in your life journey.

To the friends and mentors who ignited this fire in me and saw my potential: They saw something in me when I did not see it for myself. Thank you for believing in me and reminding me who I really am when I forget. Thank you to the ladies of Just a Sister Away (JASA) and Young Black Woman’s Society (YBWS). Thank you to Genevieve Simon for lending me your eyes and ears, and to all the friends who voiced “You go girl, get it done!” “You got this!” I thank you all.

God gives us family and friends for love, support and guidance. In addition, in our journey we come across angels who God graces us with to help us in times of doubt and fear. Dr. Marie Guerda Nicolas, I thank you for allowing God to work through you. I thank you for your selfless dedication to me and to my academic development. Thank you for sharing the Haiti Legacy Project (HLP), thank you for your candor and challenging me to achieve more then I could have ever anticipated. “I am because we are.” I can only wish to live this powerfully in my lifetime but you do this daily.

Thank you to Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters and Dr. Karen Reiss Medwed for your time, direction, patience and commitment to this work.

Thank you to TEAM UNITY! Thank you for opening your hearts and sharing your experiences. I can only pray that I am able to reciprocate what you have done for me. Your stories will not go untold.

Ultimately, I owe all that I have accomplished here and so much more to Ayiti.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## I. CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION

- Statement of the Problem ................................................................. 9
- Significance of Research Problem .................................................. 14
- Positionality Statement .................................................................. 15
- Central Research Question .............................................................. 19
- Theoretical Framework ..................................................................... 19
- Conclusion/Forward ........................................................................ 26

## II. CHAPTER 2 – LITERATURE REVIEW

- In-service Teacher Development in the U.S. ........................................ 30
- International Teacher Development .................................................. 45
- Teacher Development in Haiti ............................................................ 50

## III. CHAPTER 3 – METHODS

- Methodology ..................................................................................... 58
- Research Design .............................................................................. 60
- Research Tradition ........................................................................... 62
- Participants & Context ..................................................................... 63
- Recruitment & Access ...................................................................... 64
- Data Collection ................................................................................ 69
- Data Storage ..................................................................................... 70
- Data Analysis .................................................................................... 71
- Trustworthiness ............................................................................... 77
Reciprocity .................................................................78
Limitations .....................................................................79
IV. CHAPTER 4 -- REPORT OF RESEARCH FINDINGS .................80
Teacher Voices ..............................................................80
Themes ........................................................................95
V. CHAPTER 5 -- ANALYSIS, IMPLICATIONS AND
RECOMMENDATIONS ..........................................................124
Contributions to Research ................................................125
Theory of Andragogy .......................................................137
Exposing Colonial Legacies Through Critical Race Theory ........142
Contributions to Practice & Practical Implications .................149
Implication for Practice ...................................................149
Implication for Policy .....................................................152
Implication for Research .................................................152
Limitations and Recommendation for Future Research ..........153
Conclusion .....................................................................154
APPENDICES (A) ............................................................158
APPENDICES (B) ............................................................159
APPENDICES (C) ............................................................164
APPENDICES (D) ............................................................174
APPENDICES (E) ............................................................177
REFERENCES ................................................................178
Chapter 1: Introduction

*If you are planning for a year, sow rice; if you are planning for a decade, plant trees; if you are planning for a lifetime, educate people.* ~ Chinese Proverb

Education is an instrument of development, which can provide social and economic progress for individuals and nations. A country’s advancement is contingent upon the quality of its public education system and its ability to strategically and continually develop a qualified teaching force to educate their population (Sclafani, 2008). Haiti has struggled to develop and maintain a qualified teaching force because of complex political and economic factors. Researchers have found that successful school reform efforts depend on the development of high quality and effective teachers (Darling-Hammond, 2006; Garet, Porter, Desimone, Birman & Yoon, 2001; Ladson-Billings, 1999).

The Topic

Researchers conclude that in-service teachers must be involved in professional development (PD) to improve their instructional practices and, in turn, improve student-learning outcomes (Akiba, LeTendre & Scribner, 2007). The teacher development process exists on a spectrum moving from pre-service training to continual in-service professional development. This study focuses on in-service teacher professional development. The spectrum is addressed because of the lack of literature and programing at all levels of the teacher development process in Haiti (Salmi, 2000).

Pre-service teacher development and in-service teacher professional development exists as two distinct bodies of literature in an American context. However, both theoretical and empirical research on teacher development works in Haiti is absent from the literature. This
research touches upon both topics to provide a context for the study in Haiti. The focus and emphasis of this study is in-service teacher professional development. More specifically, the researcher aims to understand how in-service teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development.

For the purpose of this research, teacher professional development is defined as a process that in-service teachers go through with the goal of acquiring and developing knowledge and pedagogical skills needed for planning and implementing experiences that support student learning (Evans, 2002). Teacher professional development is the cornerstone of student success and the development of human capital. In Haiti, the spectrum of teacher development has been neglected in practice and by the Haitian government’s Ministry of Education (Doucet, 2012, Salmi, 2000).

**Statement of the problem.** The problem addressed in this study focuses on the lack of initial and in-service teacher professional development in Haiti and how that leads to a lack of qualified teachers (Hebblethwaite, 2012; Demombynes, Holland & León, 2010; Doucet, 2012, Salmi, 2000). The absence of in-service professional development programs perpetuates a poorly trained teaching force, which, in turn, perpetuates larger societal problems.

**Context of teacher training and in-service development.** According to the writers of the 1987 Haitian Constitution,

“Education is the responsibility of the State… free of charge, and to ensure that public and private sector teachers are properly trained…. The first responsibility of the State and its territorial divisions is education of the masses, which is the only way the country can be developed” (Art. XXXII).

Unfortunately, Haiti’s education system does not adhere to these constitutional ideals
Additionally, the Haitian government has failed to uphold the constitution by ensuring that teachers are adequately trained and the population has access to primary education.

Roughly 75% of teachers in Haiti do not have adequate initial training (Hebblethwaite, 2012). A number of these teachers, particularly in rural areas barely have a secondary school education, and have no preparation to enter the teaching profession (Doucet, 2012). Salmi (2000) explained that the one-third of teachers who are graduates of teacher training colleges in Haiti teach in the few, elite, better paying schools. The less qualified teachers teach in what are pejoratively called lekòl bòlèt (lottery schools), private schools that operate without state accreditation and without accountability (Doucet, 2012). Overall, these teachers do not have content and pedagogical knowledge and lack adequate credentials to be considered qualified to teach (Hebblethwaite, 2012). Hebblethwaite further explained that as of 2000, 53 percent of public sector teachers and 92% of private sector teachers did not graduate from a teacher-training institute and did not hold teaching diplomas.

To clarify this point, about 90% of primary and secondary schools are private and charge tuition (Cone, Buxton, Lee, & Mahotiere, 2013; Demombynes et al., 2010). These schools are operated by religious institutions, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), or private operators without any oversight or quality control. The higher quality schools are only accessible to the elite 5% of the country (Salmi, 2000), leaving less appealing schools for more than 75% of the population (Salmi, 2000), who scarcely can afford the tuition. The few public schools that remain are also inaccessible to the poor because they charge additional exam and supply fees and require uniforms. As of 2005, an estimated 76% of the country lived in poverty and the 2010 earthquake exacerbated those conditions (Amuedo-Dorantes, Georges, Pozo, 2010; Brown & Brown-Murray, 2010). As a result of poor living conditions, only about 60% of elementary aged
children attended school (Salmi, 2000). Brown & Brown-Murray (2010) further explain that only 67% of primary school aged children are enrolled, yielding a sixth grade graduation rate of 30%.

These paltry statistics can partially be attributed to the lack of initial teacher training and in-service professional development programs. The few programs that exist for teacher education and professional development are driven by a combination of private and public sector Haitian organizations, coupled with a “plethora of international humanitarian and non-governmental organizations (NGOs)” (Doucet, 2012, p.121). Unfortunately, many of these entities do not have government credentials, “which certifies that minimum facility and quality standards are met (Demombynes et al., 2010), particularly in rural regions. Lack of regulation allows the privatization of education, with no accountability measures.

Poor outcomes and lack of initial teacher training and in-service teacher professional development can be attributed to complex reasons, one being a weak central government. Years of political and economic instability have produced more than 30 successive ministers of education since 1979 (Prou, 2009), roughly a new minister every year, which does not allow sufficient time for creating sustainable educational policy reform, systems of accountability or plans for the restoration of educational services encumbered by natural disasters or budgetary constraints. Decades of dictatorship, corruption, external pressures and unstable political and economic structures have stunted teacher development efforts, leaving an under-qualified teaching force lacking necessary supervision and supports.

Improving the teacher professional development experience and, ultimately, the overall educational experience in Haiti is an equity and social justice issue perpetuated by the weak central government’s lack of resources and regulations. The lack of structural supports perpetuates high illiteracy, high drop out and low enrollment rates (Cone, et al., 2013; Salmi,
Teachers are the ultimate change agents (Allerdyce, 2011) and systemic attention and resources must be allocated to in-service teacher professional development.

**Purpose statement.** The purpose of this research is to understand how teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive in-service professional development. This study examines how Haitian teachers reflect on their experience participating in professional development.

**Justification for the research problem.** Though the research reveals that quality instruction and qualified teachers are a vital component in producing successful student outcomes (Darling-Hammond, 2006; Ladson-Billings, 1999), minimal attention has been devoted to the notion of in-service teacher professional development or its implications on student academic achievement (Bhatti, 2010; Evans, 2002; Vegas, 2007), particularly in developing countries such as Haiti. This is due to the systemic neglect and marginalization of developing nations. While there is a slowly growing body of literature about Haitians in the United States and the preparation of American educators to teach diverse groups of students (Cone et al., 2013), theoretical and empirical research about the education system and teacher development in Haiti remains in its infancy (Hebblethwaite, 2012).

**Deficiencies in the evidence.** Research on Haiti’s education system emphasizes the language dichotomy and impacts of specific reform efforts. This reveals an absence of both theoretical and empirical research on in-service teacher professional development in Haiti.

**Relating the discussion to audiences.** This study is relevant to stakeholders and researchers in Haiti and in the United States. Foremost, the teacher leaders participating in the study and their teaching colleagues benefit from the Haiti Legacy Program (HLP) and the reciprocal dialectic qualities of this study. It lends itself to improving instructional practices for
the teacher participants and illuminates the current teacher development realities through teacher voices. Additionally, this study informs stakeholders such as: policy makers and the Haitian Ministry of Education about the teachers’ current experiences in professional development actualities. The study also contributes to theory and research by building upon the current literature on in-service teacher professional development. More specifically, it contributes to the scholarship in Haiti and the international community about the teacher development experience of Haitian educators.

**The Haiti Legacy Project.** Sustainable improvements in the Haitian education depend on quality in-service teacher professional development programs, necessitating programs such as the Haiti Legacy Project. This program aims to create sustainable teacher professional development programming emphasizing teachers’ content knowledge in history, as well as pedagogical knowledge. The Haiti Legacy Project is a collaborative effort, which encompasses various stages. The project’s overarching goal is to centralize resources in an online format that educators can access to enrich their curriculum about Haiti’s history and its global impact. Stakeholders in the project provide training in Haiti to a group of teacher leaders, utilizing the online resources to support teacher learning, reflection, and application. I am a Curriculum Developer for the Haiti Legacy Project and have worked in collaboration with the HLP team and its partners to conduct professional development in Haiti.

The project is sustainable because its teacher leaders serve as trainers in Haiti to develop other cohorts. The purpose of these activities is to increase teachers’ content knowledge of Haitian history, to improve their ability to utilize resources online, to enhance history instruction, and to improve pedagogical effectiveness. The significance of this study’s research problem emphasizes a need for sustainable and continual in-service teacher development programs, which
will be addressed in the next section.

**Significance of Research Problem**

This problem is significant in both a local and global context. Roughly 80% of the world’s children reside in developing countries (Glewwe & Kremer, 2006). These countries face difficulties to staff their classrooms with qualified teachers (Vegas, 2007). The consensus among researchers is that teacher quality is directly correlated to improving student achievement, (Bhatti, 2010; Darling-Hammond, 1998; Hargreaves, 2008) and to improving a nation's standing and ability to develop a working class thereby enabling it to compete in a global economy (Akiba, et al., 2007; Cohen, 1995; Prou, 2009).

Haiti requires education reform to begin to alleviate poverty. McMillan (2010) explained, “the attainment of primary education can be tied to poverty reduction, as poorer households tend to have the least access to education” (p. 537). Nearly 5 million school-aged children in Haiti live in poverty and have either never attended school or attended inconsistently because their families could not afford the school fees. Systemically reducing poverty and increasing literacy requires a sustainable model to develop the education system, beginning with the topic of this study, teacher professional development.

On an individual level, Cohen (1995) explained, “literacy related activities give new literates opportunities to use their new skills in order to make important economic and political transactions that will lead to their own development” (p. 11). Overall, education should be perceived as a vehicle for an individual’s, a community’s, and a nation’s development. This partnership relies on teachers’ expertise and change requires a commitment to teacher professional development.

**Positionality Statement**
**Intersectionality.** I am in a unique position to address this issue considering the intersectionality of my identity. I am an educator, researcher, and Haitian immigrant. My family migrated to the U.S. from Haiti when I was in elementary school. I was raised in an academically driven, middle-class household. My mother taught my siblings and myself to have a strong work ethic and she revered academic success. As the youngest of five college graduates who are all successful in their respective fields, I grew up knowing I would graduate from high school, attend college, and if I chose, I continue my academic development with the unwavering support of my family. After attending one of the best Catholic private schools in Haiti and then migrating to urban public schools in the U.S., I was among the lucky few to be granted acceptance to a high-performing public high school in Boston. I later became a history teacher in an urban school. As a result of my personal experience as an English language learner and as an educator, I developed a profound understanding of the disparities that exist in how children are educated in the U.S. and in my own native Haiti.

My positionality derives from my work as a history teacher. I witnessed the exclusion of the history of people of the African diaspora from historical canons. When these histories are represented they are altered and misappropriated to appease dominant narratives. As a history teacher I have worked to create a counter narrative to ensure that my students have a proud and profound understanding of their histories and their roles as productive global citizens.

My academic and personal experiences forged my ideological worldviews on the importance of access to equitable education for all. Briscoe (2005) explained, “critical researchers of all sorts take such an ideological position and seek to help create greater equity for all social groups” (p. 33). This critical view drives my desire to contribute to the improvement of students’ experiences through educational development. It motivates my role as a participatory
researcher and my desire to work with educators in Haiti to improve the academic experience of Haitian students.

It is my desire to contribute to the improvement of the Haitian education system that propelled me to join the Haiti Legacy Project team as a Curriculum Developer. This work is being done in collaboration with teacher leaders in Haiti. Though I traveled to Haiti with an institutional affiliation as a doctoral student affiliated with Northeastern University, my work as a participatory researcher and consultant with the Haiti Legacy Project ensured involvement and genuine collaboration with Haitian teachers.

**Bias.** Because I am Haitian and an educator, I share an affinity with Haitian teachers. My path veered, however, when I migrated to the U.S., became acclimated to a new culture, and acquired a new language, I am aware, therefore, that I do not share the same experiences as students and teachers in Haiti. Briscoe (2005) indicates, “being part of the group studied does not necessarily mean that one is free from biases” (p. 32). My intersectionality allows me to share particular commonalities; however, I am equally aware that bias exists because of our different life experiences.

Researcher bias can never completely be removed (Machi & McEvoy, 2012), however biases must be identified and named. Participatory researchers must be cognizant of their biases throughout the research process, from the development of the study, to collecting and analyzing data, and presenting research findings. Machi & McEvoy (2012) suggest that researchers must first intentionally be introspective. Villenas (1996) explained that “…when we fail to question our own identities and privileged positions…” (p. 76) our writing perpetuates “othering.” Identifying biases can be done through researcher journaling and reflective processes. I used reflective journaling to illuminate my prejudices, misconceptions, discomforts, and assumptions
about the participants. Finally, I made sure to interpret the voices of the teachers, without imposing my own perspective.

Engaging with participants. Scholar-practitioner is a layer of my positionality that privileged and legitimized my voice and contributed to my understanding of the intersection and cyclical relationship of theory and practice. Nevertheless, this role can be a disadvantage in the research process. Briscoe (2005) explained that, “how participants respond and act depends on how they view the researcher… participants may decide that the researchers are not to be trusted” (p. 25). Villenas (1996) explained that researchers could be perceived as outsiders, however with insight they could establish relationships and reflective processes that would allow them to become insiders (p. 84).

I identify with Villenas’ (1996) description of her experiences as the “educated, marginalized researcher, recruited and sanctioned by the privileged dominant institution…” (p. 77). Though I entered the research as a Northeastern University doctoral student, my focus as a participatory researcher was co-constructing with the participants’ ways of improving educational realities in Haiti and contributing a counter narrative to the literature. Briscoe (2005) expounds on this notion stating, “some scholars choose to align themselves with those who have been oppressed and seek to end oppression and suffering it causes” (p.33). The solution to representing the “other” in ways that are respectable and humanizing is to, “change the way in which we as academics use and work with ideas…it must be willing to move away from such existing systems of knowledge to permit exchanges between speaker and listener” (Fennell & Arnot, 2008, p. 532). Ultimately, I must allow the voice of the teachers to infuse the work.

The dialectic interaction (Freire, 2000) allows researcher and participant to equally participate in the study. “Qualitative research is one of the methods in which the other is treated
as a “you” rather than as an object” (Briscoe, 2005 p. 34), who explained that engaging in discourse and incorporating the voice of the participant “is key to transforming social relations that bring about suffering and the stunting of human potential” (p.34). In addition to engaging in dialectic interactions, this research embeds the notion of reciprocity. I present the marginalized voices of the teachers and contribute this counter narrative to the literature. Educational development is a political activity and educational researchers must embrace social change as part of their role (Cochran-Smith, Shakman, Jong, Terrell, Barnatt & McQuillan, 2009). As a researcher I must not only be introspective but also be an activist and change agent who is involved in the community I am researching (Villenas, 1996). Along with being aware of my positionality and biases, I have taken measures to ensure that I have not objectified the participants by conducting a qualitative participatory research study.

I realize that as a researcher, I must use the tool of the educationally privileged if I want my voice to be heard, (Briscoe, 2005; Villenas, 1996). However, my intersectionality positions me both as the researcher and as someone who belongs to the group I am researching (Villenas, 1996). As a researcher using the educational tools and languages of the privileged I am positioned in a space of privilege, (Villenas, 1996) As a participatory researcher, however, my goal is to open spaces for teachers’ voices as a tool to help improve their educational realities. As a scholar-practitioner, I am introspective as I deconstruct, reconstruct, and construct (Ladson-Billings, 1998) internalized biases and prejudices that exist in my positionality. As a participatory researcher, I can leverage my researcher privilege and take actions to be a change agent. It is my life experiences and research interests that inspired my desire to improve educational experiences of underserved communities that brought me to the following question.

**Research Question**
The main research question of this Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) qualitative study is: How do teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development? This question is addressed using two theoretical perspectives: Knowles (1972) theory of andragogy and a Critical Race Theory (CRT) framework.

Theoretical Frameworks

Anfara and Mertz (2006) propose that a useful theoretical framework is one that “tells an enlightening story about some phenomenon. It is a story that gives you new insights and broadens your understanding of the phenomenon” (p. xvii). This study is embedded in two theoretical frameworks that, together, reveal the narrative behind the multiple layers explored. Knowles (1972) theory of andragogy provides a frame for adult learning, which informs the in-service teacher professional development process and experience. Critical Race Theory frames the overall research.

Andragogy Theoretical Framework

This IPA qualitative study explores the professional development experience of in-service teachers in Haiti using Knowles as an approach to understanding adult learning. Andragogy is the art and science of helping adults learn, as distinct from pedagogy, the art and science of teaching children. For the purpose of this research, Knowles theory provides a guide for understanding teacher professional development in Haiti and establishing criteria for exploring the adult experience (Merriam, 1987, 2008). Knowles, the seminal andragogy theorist bases his adult learning theory on five assumptions:

Changes in self-conception. Andragogy is concerned with the “…the point in which individuals achieve a self-conception of self-direction” (Knowles, 1972, p. 34). Knowles suggests that as children mature into adulthood; they reach a level of awareness that
moves them from being dependent to being self-directed.

**The role of experience.** Knowles second assumption is that as individuals mature they acquire “an expanding reservoir of experience that cause [them] to become an increasingly rich resource for learning, and at the same time provides [them] with a broadening base to which to relate new learning” (Knowles, 1972, p. 35). Though it should not be assumed that children are blank slates, as they too have background knowledge, Knowles distinguishes the vast amount of experiences accumulated by adults from that of children and that the mature learner processes and interacts with experiences differently.

**Readiness to learn.** The third assumption of andragogy is “that learners are ready to learn those things they need to because of the developmental phases they are approaching in their roles” (Knowles, 1972, p. 35), in their profession, and in their personal contexts. This suggests that adults learn what they need to because of the requirements of their lives.

**Orientation to learning.** Knowles forth assumption suggests that adults tend to have a problem-centered orientation toward learning. An immediate need to meet life’s requirements propels the adult to learn and directly apply new skills or knowledge.

**Motivation to learn (Knowles, 1980).** As the theory of andragogy evolved, Knowles (1980) added the motivation to learn as the fifth assumption, elaborating on the notion that adult learners are internally and intrinsically motivated to learn because to life circumstances and needs.

There are overlaps in pedagogy and the andragogy because many of these assumptions are not unique to adults; however, this research emphasizes Knowles (1972) theory as a
foundation by which teacher learning through professional development can be explored and understood.

Knowles theory of andragogy offers a context for the in-service teacher development process and is apropos to the Haiti Legacy Project. HLP aims to provide training in Haiti to a group of teacher leaders, utilizing online resources to support teacher learning, reflection, and application. The theory of andragogy is ideal for this research because it provides a framework and language for understanding the adult learning experience. Although theory of andragogy is useful in understanding the process of in-service teacher development the implications of culture as it pertains to the focus of the study is paramount. In the next section, CRT will be discussed in addition to its application in a Haitian context.

**Brief History of CRT**

CRT developed in the mid-1970s through the seminal works of Derrick Bell, Alan Freeman and other legal scholars who shared similar apprehensions about the slow pace of racial reform during the U.S. civil rights movement (Bell, 1976; Ladson-Billings, 1998). Bell, a seminal CRT scholar, critiqued the legal landscape calling for fresh approaches and a new framework to address institutional racism. Bell (2000) explained the root of his discontent contending that racial discrimination stabilized society, by employing “white supremacy as a catalyst to negotiate political difference” and to ensure that whiteness is “recognized and upheld by the court and society like all property rights…” (Bell, 2000, p.72). Furthermore, lawyers, activists and, legal scholars argued “the traditional approaches of filing amicus briefs, protests, marching, and appealing to the moral sensibilities of decent citizens produced smaller and fewer gains than in previous times” (Ladson-Billings, 1998, p. 11). Bell (1976), for example, points to the *Brown v. Board of Education* court decision, which was stunted by the “all deliberate speed”
component of the *Brown II* mandate. This loophole in the law allowed school districts and states to resist compliance and deterred genuine school integration across the U.S. Crenshaw (1987) agrees with Bell, arguing that societal colorblindness and failure to recognize the uncertainty of civil rights laws perpetuates racial disparities.

The foundations of CRT came out of radical feminism and critical legal studies (CLS), which challenged traditional legal scholarship. Ladson-Billings (1999) explained that the root of “CLS ideology emanates from the work of Gramsci (1971) and depends on the Gramscian notion of hegemony, to describe the continued legitimacy of oppressive structures in American society” (p. 212). Furthermore, Ladson-Billings (1998) explained, “CLS scholars critiqued mainstream legal ideology for its portrayal of U.S. society as a meritocracy but failed to include racism in its critique. Thus, CRT became a logical outgrowth of the discontent of legal scholars of color” (p. 12). CRT as a concept argues that racism is a normal construct enmeshed within the foundation and structures of society, including educational institutions.

CRT is appropriate for the study because it brings to light the silencing, exclusion, and marginalization of people of the African diaspora that has occurred throughout history. DeCuir and Dixson (2004) suggested that CRT is a framework focusing on the impact and implication of race and racism, while addressing the power dynamics associated with whiteness. Ladson-Billings (1998) defined Critical Race Theory as “…Deconstruction of oppressive structure and discourses, reconstruction of human agency, and construction of equitable and socially just relations of power.” (p.10). Delgado and Stefancic (2001) explained that CRT is a movement engaging “scholars and activist who are interested in studying and transforming the relationship among race, racism, and power” (p. 2). The activist dimension of CRT aims to comprehend social situations and transform our racial stratification for the better (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001,
Some researchers base their work on five tenets of CRT: counter narratives (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001); the permanence of racism; whiteness as property (Bell, 1976; Harris, 1992); interest convergence; and critique of liberalism (Bell, 1976; Crenshaw, 1987; DeCuir & Dixson, 2004, 2009; Ladson-Billing, 1999; Young, 2011). The first two tenets, the permanence of racism and counter narratives, are used as theoretical and analytical frameworks in this study.

**CRT in Haitian context**

To frame this study, CRT is utilized to historicize two layers of the Haitian societal context that reveal the importance of teacher development programs implemented by the Haiti Legacy Project. The permanence of racism explained that racism is an embedded part of society (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001, p. 7), enmeshed in the fabric of the social order. A goal of CRT is to reveal and expose that racism (Ladson-Billing, 1999, p. 231). In a Haitian context, the permanence of racism in can be traced to the country’s colonial roots and the foundations and development of Haitian society. A consequence of colonization is an embedded desire to mimic the colonizer; Western culture in today’s Haiti. This desire perpetuates the separation between the elite class and the masses, resulting in a dual society with stark divisions in social, linguistic, political, educational, economic, and geographic areas of life.

**Colorism**

A legacy of colonization is the entrenched and ubiquitous colorism. Colorism permeates Haitian society, revealing the permanence of racism, through internalized racism. Colorism is “the allocation of privilege and disadvantage according to the lightness or darkness of one’s skin” (Burton, Bonilla-Silva, Ray, Buckelew & Hordge, 2010, p. 440). In the Haitian context colorism advantages individuals based on their appearance, favoring those with white phenotype features (i.e. Skin tone, hair texture, eye color, facial features) (Burton et al., 2010). Colorism
indicators impact and can deter access to education, school, employment, and other societal advancement opportunities.

**Silencing voices of color**

The second point focuses on the need for counter narratives, to illuminate the effects of the exclusion of Haiti from the global historical canon by capturing the voices of narrating their experiences. This tenet emphasizes the upholding and empowering of voices of color through narratives. Delgado and Stefancic (2001) explain that people of color have unique histories and experiences with oppression and urges them to contribute their narratives to create change and to be empowered. An IPA theoretical framework allows this study to capture the voices of Haitian teachers.

The need for counter narratives intertwines with the need for the Haiti Legacy Project history curriculum. The curriculum that is utilized for the professional development focuses on three historical contexts relating to Haiti: the history of colonization, the Haitian Revolution and the global impacts of Haiti. Haitian narratives and Haitian history have been strategically omitted from world history, revealing, for example, how whiteness is leveraged in the world history canon, by focusing on only the French and American revolutions. The aim of the Haiti Legacy Project’s teacher development curriculum is to provide a counter narrative, as discussed by CRT theorists. For example, the 1804 Haitian Revolution was the second successful revolution in the Western Hemisphere, after the American Revolution. However, this occurrence is omitted from most world history books and its impacts are minimized. The Haitian Revolution’s impact was felt throughout the Americas, giving hope to others who were still enslaved, triggering revolts throughout the Americas, and weakening colonial powers’ economic and social reality.

CRT tenets can help frame the exclusion of such a crucial component of history from
global historical narratives. It is through the teachers that historical narratives are transmitted. The Haiti Legacy Project provides educators with the counter narrative by providing educators in Haiti access to historical content knowledge and creating space for their narratives. I interviewed teachers in order to capture their experiences.

**Synthesis of theoretical framework**

Though CRT and Knowles (1972) theory of andragogy are two distinctive theoretical frameworks, they are utilized collectively to illuminate the relevance and implementation of this study. CRT frames the significance of the study in a global and regional context. Deconstructing oppressive structures requires confronting colonial legacies and the bringing to light the systemic exclusion of Haiti from historical canons. Knowles theory of andragogy frames the professional development of educators in Haiti in an effort to reconstruct human capacity and the construction of equitable and socially just educational opportunities.

**Qualitative Inquiry**

Employing a qualitative research design is influenced by Creswell’s’ (2013) explanation, “Qualitative inquiry begins with the assumption and the use of interpretive/theoretical frameworks that inform the study of research problems that address the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem” (Cresswell, 2013 p. 44). The aim of this inquiry was to explore a social problem in Haiti’s education system through a Knowles (1972) theory of andragogy and CRT framework. This study’s focus on the ways a group of Haitian teachers experience and perceive professional development. It lends itself to a qualitative approach because it is a complex human problem that has historically been neglected in both theoretical and empirical works (Creswell, 2013, p. 48). Furthermore, the question and nature of this study requires the Interpretive Phenomenology Analysis (IPA) methodological approach to capture the
shared experience of the teachers.

**IPA/ Data Collection & Participants**

Creswell (2012) explained, “a phenomenological study describes the common meaning for several individuals who share a lived experience of a concept or a phenomenon” (p.76). IPA is a phenomenological approach that allows a researcher to explore and make sense of the teachers’ major life experiences and focus on making meaning of them (Smith, Flowers, & Larkin, 2009). In accordance with that definition, this study illuminates the lived experience of Haitian teachers in in-service professional development programs. Due to the overall absence from current literature regarding in-service teacher development of teachers in Haiti, I bring to light and contribute to the literary cannon the voice and current reality of Haitian teachers.

Smith et al., (2009) suggest that IPA requires purposeful sampling and small sample sizes. I selected individuals whose experience and perspective inform and center on a central phenomenon (Creswell, 2012). Fifteen teachers participated in the Haiti Legacy Project at the Musée Ogier-Fombrun. I conducted semi-structured in-depth interviews with nine of these teacher participants.

**Conclusion/ Forward**

Chapter 1 introduced and specified the research problem, the significance of the research problem, revealed the need to develop an understanding of in-service teacher professional development experiences in Haiti, as well as discussing my positionality, the research question, and the theoretical frameworks needed to capture the voices of teachers. Chapter 2 expands on the absence of Haitian voices in the literature. Chapter 3 reviews the qualitative methods for this study. Chapter 4 discusses the research data, findings, and themes. Chapter 5 concludes with an analysis of the research findings and implications.
Chapter 2: The Literature Review

This literature review is organized in three segments: an overview of in-service teacher professional development in the U.S.; pre-service teacher education and in-service professional development (PD) on a global scale with a funneled emphasis on developing nations; and finally a more specific focus on the literature on Haiti. The themes that resonated in the literature are grounded in such constructivist theories as learner-centered theory (Kayler, 2009), situative theory (Borko, 2004) and Knowles 1972 theory of andragogy. Themes that resonated in the empirical studies showed that successful in-service teacher development situates teachers as learners, focusing on teacher disposition, developing pedagogical skills and content knowledge. The literature suggests that such structural aspects of professional development as form and duration should be taken into consideration when developing professional development programing. The implications of these findings also suggest that in-service professional development should encourage the creation of sustainable learning communities that support collaborative practices, co-construction of knowledge, and reflective practices that are continuous throughout the teachers’ tenure.

Over the past two decades there has been a growing body of literature on teacher education and professional development in the U.S. revealing that if implemented well can lead to improved instruction and student learning (Borko, 2004; Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005; Musanti & Pence, 2010; Penuel, Fishman, Yamaguchi, & Gallagher, 2007). However, teacher professional development is a complex and intricate topic with many variables to consider; factors such as developing in-service teachers, teacher and student racial, socioeconomic, gender diversity and so forth must be kept in the forethought.

Seminal researchers define in-service teacher professional development implicitly and
explicitly as both a process and a product (Evans, 2002; Hargreaves & Shirley, 2012). However, there is much to learn about professional development, particularly what and how teachers learn and specifically how in-service professional development impacts instruction and student learning (Borko, 2004; Doherty & Hilberg, 2010; Evans, 2002; Penuel et al., 2007).

Although effective teacher professional development has been a topic of research for decades (Penuel et al., 2007), it became a focal point in the national and the international community with the creation of policies, mandates and initiatives such as The United Nations Millennium Goals (MDGs) in 2000 (Sinyolo, 2010), the 2002 No Child Left Behind (NCLB) initiative (Dean, Lauer, & Urquhart, 2005) and more frequent use of high-stakes testing. NCLB requires states to ensure the high-quality professional development for all in-service teachers (Borko, 2004); however, the language of the mandate does not address what high quality professional development is nor does it specify how it should be implemented. Researchers are increasingly exploring the “linkage between the design and conduct of professional development and subsequent improvement to both teacher practice and student achievement” (Penuel et al., 2007, p. 922). In-service teacher professional development is utilized as a tool to improve instruction and ultimately, improve student academic outcomes; additionally it is used as a tool to introduce curriculum and pedagogical reform (Petrie & McGee, 2012, p. 59).

Borko (2004) explained “professional development is the most serious unsolved problem for policy and practice in American Education today” (p.3). This is not only a U.S. problem but also a global issue as countries around the world work to improve their education systems. Though they are at various stages in the process, some developing countries are expanding access to primary school for their citizens (Stewart, 2010), while others are working hard to help their citizens develop skills they need to compete in a technologically driven global market. The
literature reveals that a major component of the process is improving in-service teacher professional development (Stewart, 2010; Sinyolo, 2010). The following bodies of literature will be discussed in this literature review: teacher professional development in the U.S, teacher professional development internationally, teacher professional development in Haiti and current efforts. Furthermore, overarching themes and implications will be addressed.

I. Teacher Professional Development in the U.S.

Defining Teacher Professional Development

For the purpose of this literature review, the term teacher professional development refers to in-service teachers. Pre-service teachers programs are also briefly discussed because teacher learning is continued throughout a teacher’s career. The typical teacher development process is: enrollment in a teacher preparation program, academic training, an internship or practicum, graduation, certification through an assessment process, in-service professional development, and advanced certifications. A holistic approach to quality teacher development suggests that teachers need extensive initial teacher education and comprehensive and continuous professional development throughout their career.

Evans (2002) suggests that a clear and agreed upon definition of in-service teacher development has been absent from the literature. Furthermore, Evans (2002) argues, that defining teacher professional development increases construct validity, adds clarity to the field, and reduces confusion among researchers and practitioners (p. 129). Fullan & Hargreaves (1992) agree understanding teacher development is crucial to the improvement of the field for both researchers and practitioners (Evans, 2002). Hence, in order to establish validity and parameters in this field of study, identifying a shared understanding of the in-service teacher development process is imperative.
Though seminal researchers have failed to establish a coherent definition, Evans (2002) suggested that in-service teacher development should be defined as the process of developing professionalism and professionality and teacher professional development as the process of enhancing professionalism and professionality. Within this overarching definition, role development and cultural development are crucial components within teacher development (Evans, 2002, p. 132). Evans (2002) proposed that professional development “is a process by which, alone and with others, teachers review, renew and extend their commitment as change agents to the moral purposes of teaching; and by which they acquire and develop critically the knowledge, skills, planning and practice with children, young people and colleagues through each phase of their teaching lives” (p. 4). There is a consensus in the literature around what teachers should know and be able to do in the professional development process. More importantly, the literature supports the finding that quality and effective teachers are directly correlated to student success (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005).

No matter what the process, Hargreaves & Shirley (2012) found that teaching is a lifelong profession requiring rigorous training, not a short-term engagement. Petrie & McGee (2012) stated “teachers need to experience ongoing sessions of learning, collaboration, and application, accompanied by school and classroom based support, over an ample time period …to incorporate new behaviors fully into the teacher’s repertoire” (p. 59). The constructivist theories discussed in the next section, lend to this notion discussed by Petrie & McGee (2012), about the teacher as learner process.

**Theories of Professional Development Approaches**

**Constructivist paradigm.** The literature on in-service teacher development draws upon a constructivist approach (Darling-Hammond, 1998; Kayler, 2009; Petrie & McGee, 2012;
Mukeredzi, 2013), revealing that knowledge construction is a social process, which should be grounded in reflective, inquiry-based action that should transform practice (Kayler, 2009, p. 59). Mukeredzi explained, “teachers are viewed as active learners for whom there is an active meaning-making process of transforming understandings” (p. 5). Kayler’s (2009) research with 63 K-12 teachers was embedded in a constructivist learner-centered theory. The goal of this study was to utilize the learner-centered theory to “support the creation of a learning community that focused on reflective practices, critical dialogue, and teacher-researcher collaboration with the aim towards continued improvement” (Kayler, 2009, p. 58). Musanti & Pence (2010) said collaborative learning “is at the core of communities of practice involving co-construction of meaning and mutual relationships through a shared enterprise” (p. 74). This study found that the PD developers infused learner-centered theory into their curriculum by allowing teachers to co-construct knowledge during PD sessions and establish collaborative communities. The facilitators created opportunities for teachers to learn by utilizing a learner-centered approach; they created PD sessions in which their colleagues could participate. The facilitators also allowed opportunities for teachers to critically reflect on their role as learners, teachers of peers, participants, and, ultimately, teachers of students. This multilayer approach both supported teacher learning and allowed teachers to take ownership of their own learning. The teachers self-reported that they valued peer expertise, they appreciated the opportunities to learn practical knowledge from colleagues, enjoyed the opportunity to engage in critical dialogue with peers, and grew as experts in content and theory as they co-facilitated their own sessions (Kayler, 2009). Such collaborative practices are central to professional development because they establish opportunities for teachers to create networks and relationships that will nurture and support their practices; engage in critical dialogue about instruction, teaching and learning; and continue to co-
construct knowledge (Musanti & Pence, 2010, p. 74). Musanti and Pence (2010) explained further that teacher development should be positioned in the context of “learning communities in which teachers as learners create environments that integrate a common vision and their reflections on learning processes and practices” (p. 74). Overall, learning communities create a space to situate the teacher as learner.

**Situative theory.** In a comparable approach Borko, (2004) utilized a situative theoretical framework to illustrate the elements of the professional development system and to show that in-service teacher professional development has positive impacts on teacher learning (p. 5). In this study, Borko (2004) stated that, “Situative theorists conceptualize learning as changes in participation in socially organized activities, and individual’s use of knowledge as an aspect of their participation in social practice.” (p. 4). This places the teacher in the space of learner for the individual construction and a part of the acculturation process in the larger context and community. Borko (2004) explained, “From a situative perspective, teacher learning is usefully understood as a process of increasing participation in the practice of teaching, and through this participation, as a process of becoming knowledgeable about teaching” (p. 4). Borko’s (2004) study revealed that teachers increase knowledge and alter their instructional practice through in-service professional development that focuses on subject matter, understanding student learning and instructional practices.

Similarly, Petrie & McGee’s (2012) study on the design and delivery of professional development emphasizes the importance of teacher as learner within particular contexts. Effective PD must take into account the needs of the school community and its two groups of learners: teachers and students (Petrie & McGee, 2012, p. 61). The teachers in this study reported that they were able to immediately transfer their learning to the classroom when they were
placed in the role of students, their diverse learning needs were taken into consideration, and they were provided the resources to implement their curriculum and new pedagogical practices (Petrie & McGee, 2012). Likewise, Darling-Hammond (1998) explained “teachers learn by studying, doing and reflecting; by collaborating with other teachers; by looking closely at student work; and by sharing what they see” (p. 8). This contradicts traditional in-service professional development programs at which teachers are assumed to learn and transfer their learning to students by listening to lectures (Petrie & McGee, 2012).

These studies reveal that it is not enough for teachers to read about educational theory during their initial training and their in-service professional development, they must experience teaching and learning as learners (Kayler, 2009, p. 68). Researchers, practitioners, and policy makers agree that professional development should influence teacher learning, teacher instructional practices and ultimately improve student learning, however, the traditional models of professional development have not improved teaching (King & Newmann, 2000, p. 577). Furthermore, traditional models do not prepare teachers to implement the teaching practices expected and required to be effective (Garet, Porter, Desimone, Birman, & Yoon, 2001).

Because traditional professional development models have not been effective, policy makers, practitioners and researchers have considered theoretical models that understand and support teacher learning, as well as models for planning, conducting and evaluating in-service professional development programs (Guskey, 2002; Huber, 2011; Muijs & Lindsay, 2007). Researchers concur that andragogic principles (Knowles, 1972) must be taken into account when developing professional development for educators (Guskey, 2002; Huber, 2011). Knowles (1972) claimed that there are four assumptions for his adult learning theory (a) changes in self-conception, (b) the role of experience, (c) readiness to learn, and (d) orientation to learning.
Guskey (2002) grounded his theoretical model on Knowles (1973) andragogic principals and suggests five levels of developing and evaluating professional development:

- Participants’ reaction
- Participants’ learning
- Organization support and change
- Participants’ use of new knowledge and skills
- Students’ learning and outcomes.

Components of these theoretical models have been applied in various studies focusing on professional development programs as discussed in the next section.

In an empirical study, Muijs & Lindsay (2007) utilized Guskey’s (2002) theoretical framework to understand the use and usefulness of continuing professional development on a large scale. Surveys completed by 416 professional development coordinators and teachers shed light on their PD experiences and supported the usefulness of Guskey’s (2002) theoretical model as a tool to gather insights on varies levels of professional development. Muijs & Lindsay’s (2007) application of this theory contributed to literature and practice. For cost-effective purposes, policy makers and school leaders require efficient ways of assessing professional development models. Muijs & Lindsay (2007) suggested “creating a collaborative professional learning environment for teachers is the single most important factor for successful school improvement and the first order of business for seeking to enhance effectiveness of teaching and learning” (p. 209). Establishing this professional learning environment requires first taking into account as previously discussed Knowles (1972) andragogic principles and understanding who the educators are.

**Who are the Teachers?** Individuals entering the teaching profession come from various
academic, professional, cultural, and social backgrounds. Teacher educators and professional development programs must meet the educator’s diverse learning needs and cultural backgrounds. Some enter the profession having mastered a specific content area, but lack pedagogical skills and how to apply their content knowledge to support learning (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005). Others lack content knowledge, however, they may have a background working with children in various capacities and understand how students learn (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005; Garet et al., 2001). Some may be career changers who must fulfill various prerequisites to become effective teachers. Another factor that teacher educators and professional developers must take into account is the role age, race, gender and socio-economics play into the teaching profession.

**Do Age, Race, Gender & Socio Economic Status Matter?** The National Center for Educational Statistics (NCES) reports that in the 2011-2012 school year, 58% of high school teachers are females and that 83% of these teachers are white. Gunn, Bennett, Evans, Peterson & Welsh (2013) report that, overall, K-12 public school teachers are predominately white, monolingual, middle-class females (p. 2). Many of these teachers enter schools in urban, rural and suburban schools with diverse populations of students. Urban districts have predominantly Black and Latino populations and Taylor (2005) states that Black and Latino students are more likely to be enrolled in high poverty schools, defining “high poverty” as schools where 75% or more of the student body qualifies for free- or reduced-cost lunch programs (p. 1). Black and Latino students have higher dropout rates; lower scores on standardized assessments; are more likely to be designated as having special needs or requiring remediation services; are less likely to be placed in advanced placement or gifted programs; and have lower college acceptance and graduation rates (Howard, 2003). Gunn et al. (2013) further points out that these mostly white,
female, pre-service teachers are taught by mostly white professors who lack urban teaching experience.

The contrasting teacher-student demographic permeating public schools across the U.S. has propelled changes in practice and a growing body of research on teaching pre-service and in-service teachers how to work with and teach diverse student populations through multicultural education (Gunn et al., 2013; Olneck, 2000), culturally responsive teacher training (Bond, 1998; Garcia, Arias, Murri & Serna, 2010; Howard, 2003; Ladson-Billings, 1995), and social justice education (Cochran-Smith, et al., 2009). These changes in teacher preparation challenge the status quo of traditional socially efficient education (Yosso, 2010) or “banking method” (Friere, 2000), which has served to “prepare white students and upper/middle class students to make decisions and problem solve so that they can become leaders in the workplace” (Yosso, 2010, p. 96). In contrast, the traditional structure “prepares students of color and low-income students to take directions without question, memorize without critical analysis, and focus on remedial, manual labor focused curriculum rather than a college-bound curriculum” (Yosso, 2010, p. 96). Teaching educators at both pre-service and in-service levels to be culturally proficient improves teaching and learning and has an impact on student outcome (Gunn et al., 2013). Overall, the literature reveals that effective teachers are culturally responsive and able to teach students from diverse learning, SES and ethnic populations (Cochran-Smith et al., 2009; Yosso, 2010).

**Developing Effective Teachers.** Hargreaves & Fullan (2012) explained that society has misconceptions of what effective teachers and effective teaching are. Some believe quality teachers are just gifted, while others think teaching is a craft that takes mastery but no scholarly support. Others suggest that teaching can be boiled down to a laundry list of to do’s, and some believe that teaching is a precise science that is formulaic. The current popular movement
suggests that teaching is a data enterprise that, like a business, can be evaluated with key performance indicators (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2012). Hargreaves & Fullan (2012) suggested that though these stereotypes are grounded in truths, they do not explain and do not give justice to the complexities of teaching or the intricate skills and knowledge required by teachers. Effective teachers must not only master content and pedagogical knowledge, but also adapt curricula to meet various learning needs; engage students through interactive learning lessons and interactions; establish a respectful classroom culture; engage and include diverse student populations; establish positive and trusting relationships with students and families; and collaborate and take on leadership roles within the school community and with colleagues to enhance a school’s culture (Darling-Hammond, Bullmaster, & Cobb, 1995; Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005; Garet et al., 2001). The list of tasks that an effective teacher must master, make look seamless, and, at times, perform simultaneously is complex and must be intentionally taught and learned. The literature reveals various teacher professional development models and practices that have been attempted for in-service and pre-service teachers.

Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, (2005) explained that traditional in-service programs historically have been overly theoretical. Traditional PD is fragmented, irrelevant to teachers, and fails to take into account the best practices to support teacher learning (Colbert, Brown, Choi, & Thomas, 2008). The 1980’s teacher education reform efforts focused on “producing program designs representing more integrated, coherent programs that emphasize a consistent vision of good teaching” (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005, p. 119). As these programs evolved, Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, (2005) proposed a framework for learning to teach, which teacher development programs can adapt. This framework is embedded in a learning community, with a vision focused on good instructional practices. The
framework for learning to teach also entails, (a) Knowledge, (b) Practices, (c) Disposition and (d) Tools (p. 121). Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, (2005) explained that Knowledge includes content, pedagogy, students and social context. Practices they describe as a repertoire of instructional strategies. Disposition refers to habits of mind and actions about teaching and children. Finally, Tools are the theoretical and practical resources that teachers use to support instruction. Like other studies, this research suggests that teachers learn to teach when they are immersed in the school context, and utilize a hands-on, interactive, collaborative, and practical approach (Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005, p. 122). Petrie & McGee (2012) reported a study revealing that PD needs to be more responsive teachers’ learning needs, based in schools, and include context specific learning opportunities, which allow teachers to create connections and apply new information. Establishing these structures in teacher development program models allows this learning process to occur, as will be discussed in the next section.

**Teacher Development Program Models**

Although research on pedagogies of teacher in-service professional development is in its infancy, researchers have made strides supported by theory and implemented by practice on how to improve instructional performance, (Birman, Desimone, Porter, & Garet, 2000; Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005; Kedzior & Fifield, 2004; Petrie & McGee, 2012). Upon reviewing the existing literature, Kedzior & Fifield (2004) found that most effective models of professional development included (a) mentoring, (b) content-based collaborative inquiry, and (c) lesson plan studies (p. 3). Though no one size fits all, these three activities revealed that teachers could learn, be supported in their learning by their communities, and reflect on their growth.

Likewise, a study of over 1,000 teachers conducted by Birman et al., (2000) found that
three structural features and three core features produced learning experiences for teachers and allowed them to apply their new knowledge to improve instruction. Birman et al., (2000) found that form, duration and participation are structural components that support quality professional development. They explained that form include such activities as study groups, intentionally created teacher networks, internships, and mentorship and research projects. Duration focused on the amount of time teachers spent on each activity and professional development as a whole. Extended professional development revealed in-depth exploration, engagement and learning (Kedzior & Fifield, 2004). The last component, participation, refers to collaborative efforts. Birman et al. (2000), suggested that, professional development that includes teachers from the same school, department, and grade are more likely to produce coherent experiences that lead to improved instructional practices and that establish collaborative professional culture (p. 30). The core features that characterize processes occurring during professional development are content focus, active learning, and coherence. It is reiterated throughout the literature that content knowledge is an essential component effective teaching (Birman et al., 2000; Darling-Hammond & Baratz-Snowden, 2005; Kedzior & Fifield, 2004). Quality professional development programs therefore focus on content development, focus on the teacher as a learner through engaging teaching, and focus on learning activities that comport with state standards and other benchmarks relevant to the teachers’ practice.

Garet et al. (2001) further explained the three structural pieces discussed by Birman et al. (2000) Forms in the Birman et al. (2000) study referred to activities that teachers traditionally participate, such as structure workshops led by an expert in a specific topic. However, Garet et al. (2001) explained that, though these workshop models are common, they are ineffective because they do not provide teachers with time and relevant, engaging activities, nor do they cater to the
teachers’ prior knowledge and provide content that they can transfer into the classroom (p. 920). Furthermore, they lack the necessary follow-up support implementation. Garet et al. (2001) suggested that professional development activities at the school site such as study groups, mentor, peer-observation and coaching are more applicable to classroom instruction and better support teacher learning. Garet et al. (2001) also found that time spent on professional development not only allows teachers to obtain more content and pedagogical knowledge but also to apply new strategies and receive feedback. Finally, Garet et al. (2001) argued that collective participation in professional development is an opportunity for teachers to share knowledge, discuss student learning, and establish a professional culture. Garet et al. (2001) conducted a study using a national probability sample of 1,027 teachers. Their survey used three core components of professional development identified in the literature that influence teacher learning: (a) Focusing on content, (b) Fostering coherence, and (c) Teacher outcomes. The teachers reported their perceptions of several forms of professional development. The survey revealed that sustained and intensive professional development is more likely to have an impact (p. 935); Professional development that emphasized content knowledge allowed for engaging activities and allows teachers to be active learners and create connections to their classrooms. The findings indicated that collective participation and features such as content, active learning and coherence lead to teacher learning (Garet et al., 2001, p. 936).

Penuel et al. (2007) extended this literature, building upon foundations of the Garet et al. (2001) study, suggesting, “new research is needed to illuminate how particular programs’ designs and requirement of teachers might influence what make professional development effective for promoting curriculum implementation” (p. 923). This gap led to a study that Penuel et al. (2007) conducted with 454 teachers participating in a professional development program
preparing them to implement material from the GLOBE Program, an international earth-science education curriculum (p. 923). The researchers utilized multiple sources such as surveys and reflections to study what makes professional development effective. The results supported the previous studies, emphasizing factors such as form, content, duration, and coherence as contributing to the impact of professional development on teachers’ self-reported changes (Penuel et al., 2007). Not only does professional development improve teacher learning and instructional practices, researchers found correlations in improved student learning and overall school capacity, however further research is needed (Kedzior & Fifield, 2004; King & Newman, 2000).

**Professional Development Impact on Student Learning and School Capacity**

Education reformers understand that “teachers have the most direct, sustained contact with students and considerable control over what is taught and the climate of learning, improving teacher knowledge, skills and dispositions through professional development is a critical step in improving student achievement” (King & Newman, 2000, p. 576). Nevertheless, the literature on the effects of teacher professional development on student learning is limited and much of the data in these studies are teacher’s self-reporting and not actual student-growth data (Kedzior & Fifield, 2004). For example, King & Newman (2000) reported on two low-performing urban schools that improved the quality of instruction by providing teachers with professional development focusing on three dimensions of school capacity: (1) teachers’ knowledge, skills and disposition, (2) establishing a professional learning community and (3) program coherence sustained and supported over time. The Lewis School adopted Success for All (SFA), a reading and math curriculum. The teachers reported that the PD supported and improved their own instructional practice and, in turn, their students’ learning improved. Teachers at Renfrew
Elementary School participated in professional development, which was also embedded in these three dimensions of school capacity. Teachers were reflective and revealed how the PD transformed their understanding and interactions with their students. King & Neumann (2000) stated teachers reported that their “focus on inequity had helped them to understand the importance of not using student’s social background as an excuse to relax expectation for high levels of achievement” (p. 580). Professional development embedded in the three dimensions of school capacity transformed instructional practices and the school culture and ultimately student success as reported by teachers. Nonetheless, further research is needed on all levels of the teacher development process.

Conclusion & Gaps in the Professional Development Literature

There is a void and a call for further research in the literature on the training of teacher developers both at the pre-service and in-service level (Cochran-Smith, 2003; Russell & McPherson, 2001). Though U.S., teacher educators at the university level have advanced degrees in their disciplines, they emphasize abstract teaching theories and traditional transmission models of teacher preparation, which have been overtaken by the expansion of knowledge bases required for effective teachers (Cochran-Smith, 2003; Russell & McPherson, 2001). Replacements for the traditional models have included expanding teacher preparation beyond traditional classroom instruction, engaging pre-service teachers in practicum experiences, and helping in-service teachers to become teacher developers (Cochran-Smith, 2003). What is absent in the literature between preparation and practice for new teachers remains a dilemma, which “perpetuates the belief that the real business of learning to teach occurs with one’s own students, far away from the university’s apparently impractical and theoretical approach to the realities of the classroom” (Russell & McPherson, 2001, p. 3). The literature shows collaboration to be a successful model,
collaboration between universities and schools (Russell & McPherson, 2001), within student-
teacher cohorts, and among teachers and mentors (Cochran-Smith, 2003).

Other gaps can be found at various levels of the teacher development process. Van Zandt Allen (2014) explained that gaps exist in the literature to support learning experience at pre-service and induction levels (Cochran-Smith, 2003). Teacher turn-over rates are higher during the first three years of instruction and pre-service and induction processes are crucial in developing confident and well-equipped educators (Cochran-Smith, 2003).

In summary, there is consensus that improvement to public school systems and education reform relies greatly on teachers. Researchers and teacher educators must therefore take into account the magnitude of this conclusion and assess, apply, and improve on components of professional development that have contributed to teacher and student learning. The theoretical and empirical studies discussed in this literature review reveal a pattern that a holistic approach, engaging teachers in professional development at all stages of their careers is effective (Kayler, 2009). Furthermore, the three theories discussed: learner-centered (Kayler, 2009), situative (Borko, 2004) and Knowles (1973) andragogic principle (adult learning theory) all lend themselves to empirical research. They support the findings that establishing learner-centered, collaborative learning environments are effective ways of improving teacher instructional practices. These practices allow teachers to be reflective, have access to mentor teachers, collaborate with colleagues, and immediately apply their learning in the classroom. The themes in the empirical studies reveal that in-service teacher development situates teachers as learners and focuses on teacher disposition, developing pedagogical skills, and content knowledge. Furthermore, the literature suggests that structural aspects of professional development such as form and duration should be taken into consideration when developing professional development
II. Literature on Teacher Development at the International Level

These theoretical and empirical works discussed to this point have dealt mostly with teacher professional development in the U.S., however; there is much to learn from the international community. Countries such as Singapore and Finland have invested resources and time into developing the capacity of their teaching forces. These efforts have proven to be effective because, according to standardized assessment measures such as the Trends in International Math and Science Survey (TIMMS) and the Program for International Student Assessment (PISA), students in Finland and Singapore are out performing their counterparts, in the U.S. and other development nations.

Developing a quality teaching force has become a priority for countries around the world (Stewart, 2010; Wang, Coleman, Coley, & Phelps, 2003), particularly with the motivations of standardized indicators such as PISA (Paine & Schleicher, 2011), which create competitive comparisons of students mathematics, science, and reading scores in various nations, as well as results from the TIMMS. Paine & Schleicher (2011) suggested that the improvement of school systems depends on improving the learning experiences of students and that can only occur with improving instructional practices. Paine & Schleicher’s work found that countries which consistently perform better on these assessments have professionalized teaching as a high status occupation, established rigorous standards for hiring and developing educators and establish professional practices that supports and nurtures teachers (Paine & Schleicher, 2011). Countries such as Singapore and Finland have made such consistent gain that they have captured the international community’s attention, focusing primarily on their teacher development efforts (Paine & Schleicher, 2011; Sclafani, 2008; Stewart, 2010; Wang et al., 2003; Van Zandt Allen,
Van Zandt Allen (2014) explained that education reform efforts in the countries with the highest scores focus on attracting, preparing, supporting, and cultivating good teachers (Stewart, 2010, p. 16).

Researchers have shown that these countries intentionally attract the highest performing graduates from secondary schools and universities (Paine & Schleicher, 2011; Sclafani, 2008), preparing them in rigorous master’s degree programs that emphasize content knowledge, provide extended clinical classroom experiences, and offer extensive professional development throughout their teaching tenures (Sclafani, 2008; Stewart, 2010; Van Zandt Allen, 2014). Van Zandt Allen (2014) explains that educators in China spend four of their induction years under the tutelage of master teachers. The extra investment of time, resources, and commitment and deliberate attention to creation and implementation of policy has paid off in student academic performances and improvement of these countries’ economic and social standards (Stewart, 2010).

Finland maintains a highly selective acceptance rate into teacher preparation programs and this level of selectivity has raised the standards and quality of candidates. It is socially perceived as a tremendous honor and highly regarded to be an educator in Finland (Paine & Schleicher, 2011). Singapore selects teachers from the top one-third of secondary school graduates. Stewart (2010) explained that a central focus of Singapore’s recent teacher development efforts is “that 21st century learners need 21st century teachers who not only possess 21st century literacies themselves, but also can create the learning environment that enable their students to develop such skills” (p. 18). Policy makers and educational leaders in Singapore work collaboratively to ensure that their policies are implemented in every school (Stewart, 2010).
In summary, researchers suggest that lessons can be learned from these high-performing nations (Paine & Schleicher, 2011; Stewart, 2010). Paine & Schleicher (2011) suggests countries must invest in “preparation and development of high quality teachers, while at the same time taking steps to elevate the status of the entire profession to a higher level of respect and regard” (p. 10). They must also raise the bar for teacher candidates by establishing guidelines for acceptance into programs and preparation processes. Some countries have centralized certification and teacher education processes and have rigorous screening and graduation criteria (Wang et al., 2003) and establish induction, mentoring, and continued education processes conducive to meeting educators’ learning needs. Finally, policy makers and practitioners must invest in time and resources in the process of developing new and existing teachers and compensate successful educators financially and with opportunities for career advancement (Paine & Schleicher, 2011).

**Developing Nations**

While some countries are making tremendous progress in developing their teaching forces and advancing their nations’ education systems, many developing countries are in the primary stages of development, still striving to expand access to primary and secondary schools (Stewart, 2010, p. 16) and struggling to staff classrooms with qualified teachers (Vegas, 2007). Financial constraints, untrained manpower ((Bhatti, 2010), and factors such as political instability have made it difficult for developing countries to develop their teacher workforces (Vegas, 2007). Rural areas particularly deal with neglect and deficiencies because of a lack of infrastructure and minimal access to universities and teacher training programs.

The World Bank defines a developing nation by its population’s poverty level and its access to public services as compared to developed nations. Nearly half of the world’s
population lives at or below poverty levels (Ivins, 2008). Vegas (2007) explained “developing countries have the fastest-growing populations of people age six to twenty four” (p. 222). The growth in school-aged students creates an immediate demand for more teachers. Vegas (2007) further explained that students in developing nations “have the lowest mean test scores in international assessment of students learning” (p. 220). An urgent need exists for further research, policy, and development of teacher programs in developing nations, particularly in rural regions where there has been minimal research (Mukeredzi, 2013).

Research conducted in developing countries focuses on different efforts being done to improve teaching. Vegas (2007) conducted a survey of strategies implemented by various developing nations to meet the demands of the growing school-aged populations with qualified teachers. Some nations attempted to meet financial constraints with such unconventional approaches as filling classrooms with less-qualified part-time, contractual, or assistant teachers. Other countries have experimented with incentive pay and bonuses to attract and keep qualified teachers or offered housing subsidies to induce educators to teach in rural areas (Vegas, 2007). Vegas (2007) provided an example of a Pakistani effort to build secondary schools in rural villages and develop local teachers who wanted to stay near home instead of migrating to cities. This model proved to be successful in attracting teachers to teach in hard-to-staff rural areas.

A study conducted in Malaysia explored institutional impacts and various formal and informal activities that contributed to teacher learning (Petras, Jamil, & Mohamed, 2012). Utilizing a Likert-type scale, the researchers gathered teachers’ opinions on the implementation of policy and the effectiveness of the overall professional development system in that country from 163 primary and secondary school teachers. The results revealed that teachers participated in informal professional learning activities such as networking, an informal collegial collaboration
that allowed teachers to discuss teaching ideas, lessons, students, and student work. However, Petras et al. (2012) explained that the teachers had low opinions of the effectiveness of the formal professional development in which they had participated. This study revealed dissonance between educators and organizers of formal professional development. The implications of this study reveal disconnect between policy, implementation, and teacher need. Further research is needed to assess the quality of formal professional development and student outcomes based on the professional development options around the world.

**Conclusion & Gaps in the International Teacher Preparation Literature**

The literature on teacher development on an international scale is sporadic, complex, and evolving with countries’ socio-economic and political conditions. Countries that have significantly improved their education systems have emphasized holistic approaches to teacher professional development beginning with pre-service recruitment to ongoing in-service development. However, similar themes are apparent in both bodies of literature discussed in this literature review. The theme that resonated in the both the U.S literature and international literature is the notions of situative learning and establishing cultures of collaborative learning for teachers within the school context.

It is apparent that policy makers, researchers, and practitioners must invest time and resources in the process of developing teacher development programs that will engage current and new teachers. Further research is necessary at every level of the teacher development process on the international level, in particular studying successful models. Research on professionalizing teaching is needed to look at recruitment, development, compensation, and opportunities for career advancement (Paine & Schleicher, 2011) in an effort to raise teacher quality. There is an absence in teacher development work and research in developing nations and
rural regions. The next section will funnel into Haiti, a region that had has been neglected in the research and in practice.

III. Literature on Teacher Development in Haiti

There is currently minimal empirical and theoretical research on the education system in Haiti (Allerdyce, 2011). A review of the current literary landscape revealed very few theoretical articles that discuss educational reform efforts (Doucet, 2012; Prou, 2009) but researchers do apparently have a growing interest in theorizing and providing suggestions regarding Haiti’s language paradox (Dejean, 2010; Hebblethwaite, 2012). These researchers understand that policies and efforts such as the Bernard reform must be intentionally implemented and supported for genuine changes to occur in the school system. There is an absence of theoretical and empirical research on teacher development in Haiti.

Theories and Educational Context in Haiti

Allerdyce (2011) proposed utilizing a democratic and dialogic theoretical framework to create education reform in Haiti, suggesting that Haiti’s education system requires “a sustainable model to train and educate Haiti’s teachers and students to become change agents on whose leadership Haiti’s advancement depends” (p. 35). Haiti currently exists in a state of dependency on outside agencies. Allerdyce (2011) observed that approximately 80% of Haiti’s social services are administered by international agencies, creating an over reliance on immediate aid that fails to provide the resources to create sustainability. A number of these agencies provide services in the education sector Allerdyce (2011) recommended that the reconstruction of the education sector be grounded in a dialogic model rather than the current hierarchal model, explaining that a dialogic model that aims to develop leadership capacity from within the system entails: (a) critical thinking through participatory reflective practices, (b) inquiry-based rather
than primarily knowledge- or fact-based pedagogical methods, (c) tolerance for alterity, or otherness, and (d) systemic valuing of exploration or discovery, a focus on seeking understanding rather than claiming knowledge Teacher development is a catalyst for education reform. Allerdyce (2011) suggested that education reformers in Haiti must understand that teachers in this dialogic model need to do more than disseminate information. Within this dialogic model, teacher development is inclusive, embedded in the culture, recognizes alterity, and requires cooperative dialogue (p. 43). Allerdyce contends these theoretical dialogic models would not only create education reform, but also ultimately alter the country’s political and economic climate.

**Education, Political & Economic Reform in the Literature**

Researchers Doucet (2012) and Prou (2009) share a similar sentiment with Allerdyce (2011), arguing that successful education reform will impact Haiti’s political and socio-economic climates. Nonetheless, Doucet (2012) and Prou (2009) suggested that previous education reform efforts such as the Bernard Reform failed. The Bernard Reform, among other things, promotes the instruction of Creole language in schools. Prou (2009) contended that the Bernard Reform failed because of “a lack of commitment, ownership, and political will on the part of foreign actors and local agents” (p. 30). Doucet (2012) built upon Prou’s (2009) contentions suggesting that three factors have contributed to the inadequate implementation of educational change efforts: (a) the obstructionist stance of Haiti’s power elite, (b) the paternalistic monopoly of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) performing state functions, and (c) the consequences of imperialistic projections of Eurocentric norms (p. 122). Doucet (2012) further contends that these factors create an education system that perpetually disempowers and disenfranchises Haiti’s most vulnerable populations, the youth and the poor (p. 122).
The current education system maintains the status quo and benefits three stakeholders: the Haitian elite, NGOs and western powers (Doucet, 2012). The Haitian elite perpetuates the status quo, by “perpetuating the colonially instilled beliefs of inherent superiority of their own group and consequently in the inherent inferiority of the other” (Doucet, 2012, p. 134). Ironically, both groups are racially categorized as Black and ethnically Haitian. The Haitian elite, however, stratifies society based on skin tone and economic and political standings. A successfully implemented education reform “to make quality education available to all Haitians, irrespective of social class or skin tone, would represent a massive threat to the very foundation upon which the elite have build and maintained their social position” (Doucet, 2012, p. 134). Therefore, education reform is not on the elite’s list of priorities.

The misery of the majority of the Haitian population further benefits the elite by maintaining its economic standing and also has proven to create a lucrative industry for NGOs and western powers (Doucet, 2012, p. 136). Though a number of NGOs and Western powers state that education development is their priority, their efforts to establish sustainability in the country has been minimal. Doucet (2012) points out that NGOs receive more funding from donors then the Haitian government, however, because of poor lack of standardization and oversight, much of the funding goes overhead and does not reach the people it was intended. In addition, the saturation of NGOs in the country, not only weakens the role of the central government, but also creates a false dependency on these organizations. NGOs are not sustainable or reliable models for educational development in Haiti (Salmi, 2000). The presence of NGOs and Western powers in Haiti has perpetuated Eurocentric values and beliefs (Doucet, 2012). The next section will explore how the influence of western powers has perpetuated the
status quo through Creole and French dichotomies. More specifically, language has played a role of contention, power and exclusion in schools and in society.

**Language Paradox**

All Haitians speak Creole (Kreyòl). However, much like the Creole-speaking population, the language itself has been marginalized and deemed a low-status and a low-class language (Doucet, 2012). French is the language of power and has been used in government, law, and education since Haiti’s independence in 1804. Changes to the Haitian constitution in 1987 recognized Creole as an official language of Haiti (Dejean, 2010). Ironically, the majority of Haitians does not speak, read or write French (Doucet, 2012). Hebblethwaite (2012) suggested that 95% of the population is monolingual Creole speakers and 80% of teachers do not have proficiency in French (p. 256). Doucet (2012) explained that the “…negative reactions to Kreyòl instruction among parents, teachers, policy makers, and other adult stakeholders in the education of Haitian children are a consequence of internalized racism and (unconscious) complicity with the imperialistic objective of western powers” (p. 141). The suppression of Creole must end to produce a class of educated members of society (Dejean, 2010; Hebblethwaite, 2012).

French-only instruction excludes Haitian students from education and fortifies class divisions (Doucet, 2012). This division has maintained two classes, a powerful elite minority and a majority who is unable to be productive members of society economically or politically and is also why reform such as the Bernard Reform emphasized the instruction of Creole in school. More recent governmental policies mandate all primary public school age students to attend school and that instruction in the primary grades be administered in Creole.

**Teacher Training in Haiti**
Historically, two kinds of institutions have trained teachers for Haitian primary school and secondary schools. Some teachers study in teacher training vocational colleges, while others attend Teacher Training programs at Haiti’s Universities and other private higher education institutions (Acosta, 2005, p. 50). Because of inadequate resources and a high demand for teachers, only 27% completed formal teacher preparation programs and earned teaching accreditations (Hebblethwaite, 2012). Though the policies exist to prepare educators; there are no systems of accountability to ensure that all schools have quality teachers. This has allotted space and opportunity for NGOs and other international agencies to establish their own teacher development programing in various parts of Haiti.

**Professional development efforts in Haiti**

In the absence of institutionalized locally based professional development efforts, various international organizations conduct teacher development programing in Haiti (Doucet, 2012). Teachers Without Boarders (www.teacherswithoutboarders.org), for example, is an international organization working with the Haitian Ministry of Education and the Organization of American States to implement a three-year professional development program for Haitian teachers. The goal of this program, which began in late 2013, is to work with Haitian teachers in Gonaives to improve their professional and classroom practice and help them become mentors and leaders in their schools. The University of Colorado Boulder, the University of Notre Dame and Howard University are among other U.S. academic institutions conducting teacher development programs as part of the effort to build teacher capacity in the country. Unfortunately, there is no research to support or measure the efficiency of these organizations’ efforts. It is this absence of literature on in-service teacher development that has propelled this study and will be discussed further in the following sections.
Conclusion

Further research is needed in this field of educating teachers in developing countries. As stated previously, there is currently minimal teacher development research in Haiti. The theoretical articles discussed in this section, reveal that researchers are in the infancy stages of analyzing and discussing the Haitian education systems and theoretical models for reform (Allerdyce, 2011), education reform efforts (Doucet, 2012; Prou, 2009), and the language issues that contribute to the lack of educational progress (Dejean, 2010; Hebblethwaite, 2012). Further research is needed in all aspects of the education system in Haiti. This study contributes to the literature by exploring how teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development.

Rationale and Focus of the Current Study

This study was initiated and driven by the current circumstances and the urgency of the work that needs to be done to improve instructional practices in Haiti. The literature reveals an absence of in-teacher development research in Haiti. It was rare to find research that included teacher voices on an international scale and the researcher did not find any studies that included teacher voice or perspective on teacher development in Haiti. The rationale of this study aim at contributing to the work on teacher development work in Haiti by first capturing the professional development experience of teachers. The bodies of literature discussed in this literature review lend themselves to the following research question and will create a funnel to understanding the educational landscape and need for improved teacher development in Haiti.

Research Question: The main research question of this Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) qualitative study is: How do teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development?
Implications for this Study & Conclusion

There is consensus in the international literature on teacher professional development that countries that have successfully implemented teacher development programs focus on developing programs with an emphasis on content knowledge, extended time spent in the classroom for clinical experiences for initial educators and extensive professional development throughout their teaching tenure. A commonality that was revealed throughout this literature review is that school based professional development and establishing collaborative learning environments have positive impacts on teacher learning. Furthermore, establishing professional development opportunities that allow teachers to be reflective, apply learning over a span of time also have positive implications for teacher learning. The implication of the literature for this study informs the researchers understanding of what previous research has contributed to the literature on in-service teacher professional development.

Additionally, this study has implications in the overall field on professional development nationally and on an international level and more importantly, for teachers in Haiti. Implications of the study with respect to PD in Haiti provide policy makers, practitioners and researchers with the teachers’ perception of professional development. This perspective helps to inform future decisions of possible ways to create and transform the professional development experience of educators in Haiti.

Furthermore, this study has implications for teachers participating in the study. Through the qualitative in depth interviews with the participants, this study requires teachers to be introspective and reflective of their professional growth and their educational experiences. This reflective process reinforces the importance of continued learning and professional development.
needed for teachers throughout their careers. The next section of this dissertation discusses methodologies the researcher utilized to conduct this research.
Chapter 3: Methodology

This interpretive phenomenological analysis (IPA) qualitative study is an in-depth exploration of a particular phenomenon, the teacher professional development experience for educators in Haiti. To contribute to professional knowledge and have societal impact (Ponterotto, 2005), I worked with practitioners gathering data to develop an understanding of the teachers; perspectives and experiences (Mohrman & Lawler, 2012). This study provides new information and knowledge contributing to ongoing scholarship about teacher professional development in Haiti, which is currently absent from the relevant bodies of literature as discussed in the previous chapter. The topics and themes that were reviewed in the literature review focused on: 1) research on teacher professional development in the U.S., 2) the teacher professional development internationally and 3) teacher professional development in Haiti and current efforts. These bodies of literature reveal that there is an absence of relevant research on teacher professional development in developing nations, particularly on in-service teacher professional development in Haiti. In effort to extend the literature a qualitative research design approach was apropos for exploring the following question that contributes to empirical research on in-service teacher development in Haiti.

Research question. The main research question of this IPA qualitative study is: How do teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development?

Research paradigm

Ponterotto (2005) defines a paradigm as “a set of interrelated assumptions about the social world which provides a philosophical and conceptual framework for the organized study of that world” (p. 127). Ponterotto (2005) also suggests that though qualitative research can emanate from multiple paradigms, researchers must state their own guiding paradigms, personal
orientations and methodologies (p. 132). The premise of this study and my worldview is driven by a constructivist paradigm and methodology driving this study is characterized by a constructivist-interpretivist paradigm. The three philosophical assumptions are ontology, epistemology and idiographic. These three assumptions and their implications and consequences for the methodology are discussed further from a constructivist perspective (Burrell & Morgan, 1979).

**Constructivists-interpretivists**

Constructivists-interpretivists understand that reality is created in the mind of individuals and adopt a hermeneutical approach, which searches for hidden meanings through reflective and dialectic interactions between researcher and the participants (Ponterotto, 2005). Ponterotto (2005) explained that constructivist-interpretivist studies are both emic and ideographic because their purpose is to understand individuals as unique and complex beings who exist in unique social-cultural contexts that are not generalizable. The ontological assumption that constructivists make is that there are many subjective realities “influenced by the context of the situation, namely the individual’s experience and perceptions, the social environment, and the interactions between the individual and the researcher” (Ponterotto, 2005, p. 130). It is through these dialectical transactional interactions that I established relationships with the teachers that let me understand their lived experiences. This transactional relationship is how epistemological assumptions are established from the constructivist perspective. Even though establishing relationships are important components of establishing the dialectic interactions, constructivists are aware that biases exist. On an axiological level, constructivists understand the researchers’ values and perspectives cannot be separated from the research process, hence constructivist practitioners acknowledge and honor the existence of the researcher’s biases and positionality
(Ponterotto, 2005). I as the researcher and described these biases through journaling and remained always aware of my role as the researcher.

**Role of researcher**

Researchers are also bricoleurs (Ponterrotto, 2005), drawing from various traditions and pulling pieces together to achieve their research goals. Creswell (2013) explained that in a qualitative approach the researcher is a central instrument (p. 45). The researcher may create and use instruments to collect data, however, the researcher also is immersed in the process from data collection to observing, coding, and analyzing participants’ responses in interviews (Creswell, 2013). The participatory researcher uses inductive reasoning and co-constructs with the teachers throughout the process to generate the research outcome. Furthermore, Ponterrotto (2005) suggested, the researcher's role is “transactional and subjective; the relationship with the participants is dialectic in nature, with the goal of inciting transformation in the participants…” (p. 131). In the role of participatory researcher in Haiti, I engaged as an advocate who contributes to and co-constructs the research outcomes with the teachers. My values and biases are grounded in social justice and the desire to improve the academic realities of marginalized people.

**Research Design**

IPA allows the researcher to develop an interpretive understanding of a phenomenon by examining how the participants make sense of major life experiences (Smith et al., 2009). IPA is grounded in three key principles: phenomenology, hermeneutics, and ideography.

This study explores and illuminates the common lived experience of Haitian teachers in professional development programs, more specifically, how these individuals make meaning of and perceive their professional development experiences. As discussed, there is an absence of
relevant literature on teacher development in Haiti. I drew upon IPA principles to capture how
the teacher participants make sense of their professional development experiences and how they
perceive these experiences contribute to their instructional practices (Smith et al., 2009). IPA is
the ideal form of qualitative inquiry, because it allows researchers to examine how to make sense
of the participant’s major life experiences.

The three theoretical perspectives that comprise IPA are phenomenology, hermeneutics
and ideograph. Phenomenology is the study of experience. IPA is considered phenomenological
because it explores experiences on their own terms, focusing on making meaning of conscious
experiences (Smith et al., 2009). Husserl, Heidegger, Merleau-Ponty, Sartre are four seminal
philosophers of phenomenology. Alexander (2006) explained that Husserl concluded we only
know what we are conscious of and we can only be sure of our thoughts and experiences. For
Husserl, phenomenology is concerned with meticulous examination of the human experiences
through intentional reflection and bracketing and finding how individuals might come to
understand the importance of particular experiences to elucidate their essence to others (Smith et
al., 2009). Sartre expands our understanding of phenomenology further, suggesting that humans
are self-aware and search for meaning, that the action of searching for meaning requires action
and making meaning (Smith et al., 2009). Creswell (2012) explained, “a phenomenological study
describes the common meaning for several individuals whom share lived experience of a concept
or a phenomenon” (p.76). These definitions meshed with the purpose of this study as the teachers
shared their lived professional experiences as.

The second theoretical perspective is hermeneutics, the theory of interpretation.
Heidegger, a student of Husserl, expands and grounds our understanding of phenomenology
(Smith et al., 2009). Heidegger is concerned with understanding phenomenology through a
Hermeneutics lens. Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty both stressed interpretive components of our understanding of the world. Merleau-Ponty’s view was that we understand our world through our bodies. The body is not simply an object in the world; it is our means of communicating with the world and interpretation (Smith et al., 2009). IPA is concerned with examining and interpreting particular lived experiences and considered double hermeneutics because the researcher is making sense of the participant’s reflection and sense making (Smith et al., 2009).

Finally, IPA is ideographic because it emphasizes the particular, focusing on the details and context of the experience. IPA focuses on two levels of details, the first requiring in-depth interviews and analysis (Smith et al., 2009) and the second requiring comprehension of how specified phenomena are understood by the individuals. I therefore conducted in-depth interviews, maintained a researcher journal and produced a systemic, in-depth, narrative analysis of the data.

**Research Tradition**

Ponterotto (2005) explained that methodology is the process and the procedure of the research. The constructivist-interpretivist embraces the relationship and dialectic interaction that exists between the researcher and participant. This form of inquiry is accomplished through in-depth, face-to-face interviews. Through these interviews the issue addressed in this study focuses on teacher professional development in Haiti. Qualitative research design utilizing an IPA research tradition lends itself to the topic and the research question being explored in this study.

Ponterotto (2005) defines qualitative methods as “a broad class of empirical procedures designed to describe and interpret the experience of research participants in a context-specific setting” (p. 128). Employing a qualitative research design allows the exploration of the meanings that an individual or groups attribute to a social problem grounded in an interpretive theoretical
framework. (Creswell, 2013). This research is best conducted using a qualitative approach because it is a complex problem that needs to be explored and there are voices that must be heard (Creswell, 2013, p. 48). Qualitative methods allow the voice of participants to be incorporated about particular experiences or phenomenon (Ponterotto, 2005). The study captured the voices and perspective of teachers in Haiti, which have historically been silence and systemically marginalized and absent in the current literature. Creswell (2013) states, “Qualitative inquiry represents a legitimate mode of social and human science exploration…” (p.6). In this study, IPA has been used to explore the professional development experience of the teachers and illuminate these experiences through narratives capturing teachers’ voices.

**Participants/Context**

IPA requires purposeful sampling because the participants provide insight on particular experiences (Smith et al., 2009). For this study, I utilized convenience sampling because the potential participants were part of a pool of 15 teachers who participated in the Haiti Legacy Project (HLP) professional development program. I identified and recruited nine teachers who were eligible and volunteered to participate. IPA suggests using small sample sizes because of the in-depth data analysis. Creswell (2013) suggest IPA sampling size can range between three to fifteen participants (p. 75). Smaller sampling allowed me to conduct a deeper analysis of the data provided by individuals who have experienced the specified phenomenon. The context is Arcahaie, a small semi-rural town.

I conducted open-ended and semi-structured interviews. Due to the hermeneutics and ideographic nature of IPA, I conducted an in-depth analysis of the interview of each teacher who shared a set of experiences in order to develop an understanding of the phenomena (Creswell, 2012).
Recruitment and Access

Once I received IRB approval from Northeastern University (see Appendix C), I traveled to Haiti with the Haiti Legacy Project (HLP) team to conduct the history professional development history and to conduct interviews for the study. The Curriculum Development Director from one of the HLP partner schools recruited fifteen teachers to participate in the HLP history professional development.

I had access to all fifteen teachers as potential participants for this study. Upon completion of the HLP professional development I asked anyone interested in volunteering stay after the PD to learn more about the study. I then distributed the translated Call for Participation Letter (See Appendix A) to the teachers, read the letter aloud with the potential participants, and answered questions about the study. The letter described the study, the requirements for eligible participants, and requested their participation. I scheduled dates and times in the following week to conduct individual, 90-minute interviews with the nine eligible participants who volunteered to participate.

Inclusion criteria

Eligibility for the study required participants with the following characteristics:

- Participants were teachers who participated in the HLP history seminar. Because of the hermeneutic nature of this study, the interviews were conducted with teachers who voluntarily participated in the HLP history seminar. I originally assumed that teachers participating in a content specific professional development seminar would be teachers who teach this content. I believe that history teachers play an integral part in maintaining, interpreting, and being transmitters of historical narratives. I aimed to develop an understanding of the teachers’
professional development experiences, however, not all of the participants who volunteered for the study were history teachers; a number explained that they had other reasons for participating in a history seminar. Some of the participants were both teachers and school administrators and desired to share information gleaned from the seminar with teachers in their respective schools. Others explained that they participated to learn their own history. Though they teach subjects other than history, they planned to share information they gathered with their colleagues and students.

- Participants were required to have at least two years of teaching experience. I interviewed teachers who had more than two years of teaching experience and background that they could refer to and share during the interview. The participants who met the inclusion criteria self-selected by volunteering to take part in the study by scheduling an interview time with me.

The table below shows characteristics of the teachers obtained during the interview. I utilized this visual to begin stratifying the initial data and become acquainted with the data the teachers provided. (Further details will be discussed in Chapter 4.)

**Table 1: Participant information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Age range/ Sex</th>
<th>Content *Additional</th>
<th>Grade level</th>
<th>Admin. Role</th>
<th>Dual profession</th>
<th>Schooling level</th>
<th>Other profession studied</th>
<th>IITT</th>
<th>CPD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Skyler</td>
<td>Mid 30s Male</td>
<td>Natural Science</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Teach pedagogy at Vocational School</td>
<td>Studying educational science &amp; obtaining teaching license</td>
<td>Went to law school. Did not finish. Changed mind while teaching</td>
<td>In progress</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rich</td>
<td>Early 50s Male</td>
<td>All content</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Assistant director</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Completed degree in educational science and phyiology</td>
<td>Studied educational science &amp; phyiology</td>
<td>Finished</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quinn</td>
<td>Late 20s</td>
<td>Math</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Work with two NGOs</td>
<td>Obtaining a license in</td>
<td>Studied French communication</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>development science and journalism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Late 40s Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All content</td>
<td>Director of school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Subsistent Farmer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studying</td>
<td>Studied educational science &amp;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>obtaining teaching license</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Stevie                        |                                   |
| Late 20s Male                 |                                   |
| Social Science                | Secondary                         |
| Director of pedagogy          | No                                |
| Studying                      | Studying educational science &     |
|                              | obtaining teaching license        |
| In Progress                   | Yes                                |

| Eli                           |                                   |
| Late 20s Male                 |                                   |
| Math                          | Secondary                         |
| No                            | Civil Engineer                    |
| Studied civil engineering     | Civil engineering                 |
| Yes                           |                                   |

| Joel                          |                                   |
| Early 50s Male                |                                   |
| Social Science                | Primary grades                    |
| Director of school            | No                                |
| Completed High school         | None                              |
| In Progress                   | Yes                                |

| Gabe                          |                                   |
| Early 30s Male                |                                   |
| English                       | Secondary                         |
| No                            | English Translator                |
| Obtaining                     | English                           |
| In Progress                   | Yes                                |

| Bobbie                        |                                   |
| Early 30s Male                |                                   |
| Social Science                | Primary grades                    |
| Director of school            | Agronomist, Politician, other     |
| Studied school administration | Journalism, Agronomy and natural resources |
| Finished                      | Yes                                |

**Gender**

As shown in Table 1, above, all of the teachers were male. This is due to social factors in Haitian society. The HLP professional development was scheduled on a Saturday, which is also market day in that region. When I asked the male teachers in the HLP workshop where all the female teachers were, they indicated that it was market day and the women were either selling merchandise or produce or they were purchasing products for their families. The teachers also explained that the majority of secondary school teachers are male and a higher percentage of female teachers can be found in primary schools. That the participant pool was all male created an opportunity to specifically capture the male experience.

**Informed consent**
Once the eligible participants self-selected to participate in the study, an interview was scheduled. I verbally reviewed the translated Informed Consent Letter (See Appendix B) prior to commencing each interview. I also allowed time for the teachers to ask questions and develop a deeper understanding of the research. After making certain the understood, I had them sign the informed consent form and began the in-depth, one-on-one interview.

**Interview location**

Initially, I wanted all interviews to take place at the HLP teacher development site, Musée Ogier-Fombrun. This is a historical museum, which has conference rooms and sufficient technology to conduct professional development trainings. However, for the convenience of the teachers only two of the nine interviews were conducted at the Musée Ogier-Fombrun. Mr. Fombrun, a 90-year-old gentleman strolling the lush green grounds and social bantering with visitors occasionally interrupted the first two interviews. The seven remaining interviews were conducted at a bed and breakfast style home located closer to the teachers’ homes. These interviews were conducted on a terrace outside of the home and recordings revealed background noise as children playing in neighboring yards, motorcycles and car traffic, and the singing from the church next door. I am fluent in Haitian Creole; therefore all communication, both verbal and written, was conducted in Creole.

In adhering to IPA methods, in-depth semi-structured interviews were completed using a detailed interview schedule. (See Appendix D). The interview times varied from 60 to 90 minutes. I recorded the interviews using my password-protected iPAD recording app and a traditional recording device for backup (see data collection section). After each interview I shared a debriefing statement with each teacher (See Appendix F), which discussed some initial
findings from the literature, as well as a brief synopsis of the interview to ensure accuracy. The teachers received a history book from the Haiti Legacy Project curriculum as a gift of gratitude.

**Ethical issues**

To protect the teachers, I submitted the Northeastern IRB Approval Application to the university and adhered to university policies. No potential participants or gatekeepers were contacted nor was data collected until I received written approval from the IRB office.

This study involved no procedures that placed human participants at risk. However, as Creswell (2013) suggests, ethical issues may arise in various phases of the research process. Therefore, I took particular measures to ensure this research used good ethical practices and maintained the confidentiality of each participant by using pseudonyms and taking other measures (See Confidentiality Section).

I was cognitive of the teachers’ positionality and, more specifically, my insider/outsider role with them. I was aware of the teachers’ voices and respectful of how they would be represented in the study (Creswell, 2013). Furthermore, I developed trust and confidence with the teachers to minimize any discomfort during our interactions. Additionally, the teachers were informed both verbally and through the consent form (see appendix B) that they are free to withdraw from the study at any time and can choose not to answer particular questions.

**Transparency**

I explained the purpose of the study to each teacher through the Informed Consent Form, as well as the teacher’s options as a willing participant. The form also explained that all information would confidential (See Confidentiality Section), that the teacher chose to volunteer for the study, can choose to leave the study at any time, and that there was no intention of harm through this study. I shared a debriefing statement and the data information from the research
study with the teachers as part of the co-construction and validation process (Creswell, 2013) in an effort to ensure transparency and eliminate power dynamics (See Trustworthiness, Quality and Verification section).

**Confidentiality**

The information on confidentiality was revealed both by verbal explanation and on the Informed Consent Form. I protected the anonymity of the teachers by assigning pseudonyms and developing composite representations of each individual (Creswell, 2013). Data remained confidential and was only accessible with the use of passwords by the principal investigator and me, the student researcher (see Data Collection section). All data were only used in my doctoral dissertation and potential future academic publications and presentations. Confidentiality will be maintained for all participants in all future potential publications.

**Data Collection**

Smith et al., (2009) explained that IPA requires rich, detailed, first-person accounts of participants’ experiences. Each one-on-one, in-depth semi-structured interview was conducted in person and audio-recorded using my password-protected personal iPad recording application. I also used a traditional tape recorder for backup and it was stored in a locked cabinet while the data was being translated and transcribed.

Interviews were scheduled for 90 minutes each, allowing time to establish rapport with the teachers and to give the teachers time to think, speak, be heard, and be understood (Reid, Flowers & Larkin, 2005). The 90-minute time blocks allowed the teachers to speak freely and reflectively about their experiences. Smith et al., (2009) suggests that IPA interviews should be perceived as conversations with a purpose, allowing the teachers to tell their narratives and share their experiences.
To maintain consistency across interviews, I created and utilized an interview protocol/interview schedule (See Appendix D). All initial and follow up questions can be found in Appendix D. Pseudonyms were assigned to all teachers and all interview data collected; additionally, I completed all translations and transcriptions of the interviews (see confidentiality section).

**Data Storage**

As stated in the confidentiality section, measures were taken to ensure anonymity of the teachers. This includes the process of gathering, storing and managing the data. All teachers have pseudonyms (see confidentiality section). I kept transcriptions, typed researcher notes, and typed memos confidential. Electronic files were encrypted and saved on my password-protected personal desktop and in my password-protected cloud storage account as a backup. Handwritten documents were stored in a locked file cabinet in my home office. Electronic files were stored and were encrypted and password protected, and only the Principal Investigator (advisor) and I had access. I conducted all translations and transcriptions.

Upon completion of the dissertation, all-hard copies of documents, identifiers and links to teachers’ identification were destroyed, all papers were shredded and all files were deleted. Remaining files are stored on my password-protected personal desktop and in a locked file cabinet and will be kept securely for three years following the completion of this study, as stipulated in the Northeastern IRB form.

**Data Analysis**

I translated and transcribed the in-depth interviews from Haitian Creole to English, maintained a researcher journal, coded the data employed NVivo software to generate themes
and produced a systemic analysis of the data utilizing IPA methods proposed by Smith et al., (2009).

**Translation and Transcription**

I have written and oral fluency in Haitian Creole, and I have work experience as a translator and transcriber. As I translated and transcribed, new ideas, questions, and problems emerged. I used the reflexivity journal to capture these thoughts. In addition, I emailed a few of the teachers to ask clarifying questions and the teachers responded. Upon completion of the initial transcription, I reviewed the audio to ensure the meanings of the teachers’ experiences were captured accurately. I found it challenging to translate specific phrases – proverbs, for example – and left these in Haitian Creole, translating the essence of their meanings parenthetically. For example, Stevie used a proverb when he explained the struggles many parents have paying tuition so their children to attend school consistently or attend university. Stevie explained that the parents sell merchandise at the market to make ends meet, therefore, “*Yo pa kroke makout twò wo, men kote men ou ka rive,*” “They do not hang their sack too high, *but where their hands can reach.*” This revealed the economic struggles many parents face they must choose to feed their children or send them to school. I was intentional about capturing the authentic voice of the teachers, sense making of their experience.

**Coding and analysis**

This next section focuses on the detail data analysis procedure that I adhered to in the coding and data analysis process as indicated in IPA methodology. IPA as a research method is in its infancy and Smith et al., (2009) explained that there is no single method for data analysis. The main suggestion for analysis requires researches to focus attention toward participants making sense of their experiences. This requires an iterative and inductive cycle. To reiterate,
IPA is idiographic focusing on the particular and understanding the details of the teacher’s experience analysis required in-depth, descriptive and detailed writing (Ponterotto, 2005). Reid, Flowers & Larkin (2005) elaborate, “the participants lived experience is coupled with a subjective and reflective process of interpretation, in which the analyst explicitly enters the research process” (Reid, Flowers, Larkin, 2005, p. 20). IPA is hermeneutic because it is concerned with interpreting and understanding a phenomenon from another person’s perspective and is double-hermeneutic because researcher must be intentional and cognitive that they are making sense of the participants’ sense making about the phenomena (Smith et al., 2009).

I employed the rigorous process and strategy for analyzing data as suggested by Smith et al., (2009). The inductive and iterative procedures of IPA are meant to allow the researcher to gain an insider’s perspective on the topic (Reid, Flowers, Larkin, 2005, p. 22). The following procedures allowed the analytic process to occur, and to establish the insider perspective and offer the interpretive account of the participants’ experiences (Reid, Flowers, Larkin, 2005, p. 22). They used procedures focusing on one transcription at a time, until step five, which allowed a cross-transcription theming process.

**Step 1: Reading and Rereading**

Smith et al., (2009) suggested that researchers immerse themselves in the data. To that end, I did all translations and transcriptions of the data. I listened to the audio recordings and reread the transcription in order to ensure accuracy of translating, become familiar with the data, and ensure the teacher was the focus of the analysis. I continued to use the researcher journal to document thoughts and naming biases. For example, while reviewing one of the interviews, I wrote, “how is it possible that this teacher is assistant director of school and a teacher, how does
he have time to do both? ” (Researcher Journal, 10/2014) This revealed my bias as I viewed the teachers’ experiences through the lens of a traditional American work structure.

**Step 2: Initial Noting**

The noting stage was broken into three discrete forms of comment or coding that could be extracted from the data: descriptive, linguistic, and conceptual. This level of noting allows for detailed interrogation of the data, focusing on what the teachers are saying and how they are saying it and beginning to capture conceptual underlying meaning. For example when I asked a participant whose pseudonym is Skyler (pseudonym) was asked why he became a teacher he stated, “I think that since I was a child, each time I saw how the teachers were teaching, I always hoped and asked myself why I couldn’t do the same thing one day.” My initial noting for this conceptual thought was, aspiration, vision to be a teacher, role models, always hoped to be a teacher, desire to be a teacher. Such initial noting’s lent themselves to the coding process that occurred in the following step.

**Step 3: Developing Emergent Themes**

IPA is an inductive coding approach that requires researchers to condense raw data into thematic summaries (Thomas, 2006). To accomplish this task, I utilized the NVivo coding program. Saldaña (2013) explained that “Coding is not a precise science; it’s primarily an interpretive act” (p. 4). In the inductive coding process, I identified and labeled specific categories and themes that emerged from the most popular codes. I also explored the connections to my reflexivity researcher journal because I was interpreting the teachers’ experiences. The double-hermeneutic nature of IPA made it possible for my researcher reflexivity journal to become part of the meaning making and theme generating process. Utilizing graphic
representations I gathered emergent and organized themes. As the example below shows, specific themes began to occur from one of the teachers.

Table 2: Coding Process with Single Transcription

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant quote</th>
<th>Overarching theme: Challenges in teaching</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>These schools do not have real criteria for who they accept or the age range. They accept everyone in every class. You can find someone who is 25 years old in the same class with an 11 or 12 year old.</td>
<td>Code: Over aged students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In my seventh-grade class I have 82 students in one course. If you are not a good leader of the class, you will have problems.</td>
<td>Code: Over populated classrooms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher notes: These challenges are complex. How do you prepare teachers to teach 85 students in such extreme age ranges? This requires system changes, policy to protect the integrity of the classroom and teaching and learning. How do the teachers differentiate their instruction to meet the needs are these learners in such extreme age range and in over populated classrooms?</td>
<td>Code: Teaching challenges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Need for system change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Differentiated instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over polluted classrooms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over aged students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Step 4: Searching for Connections Across Emergent Themes

Utilizing the tools and processes discussed in the previous step allowed “research findings to emerge from the frequent, dominant, or significant themes inherent in raw data…” (Thomas, 2006, p. 238). Each interview produced codes, and patterns and similarities began to arise. For example, Rich’s desire to make a difference in education resonated throughout the data.
At the beginning of the interview, Rich explained that he, “wanted to participate in the development of Haiti through education,” He attended school while teaching and worked in various educational roles, all contributing to education. He completed his schooling and pursued professional development programs. These segments of the data were coded, desire for self-improvement, and desire to improve education system. In addition, he dedicated himself to developing other teachers. He explaining, “We encourage them to develop their capacity.” This segment was coded improve colleagues’ teaching. This pattern and theme resonated throughout Richs’ interview. He went from continuously developing his own capacity to developing other teachers. This theme became an apparent pattern in other interviews in the next step.

Step 5: Moving to the Next Transcript

As discussed, IPA is idiographic and analysis therefore requires individual in-depth analysis of each transcription. I repeated the first four steps of this process with all teacher interviews to generate the themes that allowed me to engage in the last step and conduct a holistic analysis of the phenomena.

Step 6: Looking for Patterns Across the Data

Reid, Flowers & Larkin (2005) explain, “The exploration of one phenomenon from multiple perspectives can help the IPA analyst to develop a more detailed and multifaceted account of that phenomenon. This is one kind of triangulation…” (p. 22). After coding all nine of the interviews utilizing the NVivo coding program I then began to look for and generate patterns, similarities across the interviews. At this stage, I utilized the graphic representation and NVivo coding program to find themes and patterns across the teacher’s experiences and the researcher reflexivity journal. The following chart reveals how themes were generated looking across the transcriptions.
Table 3: Themes Emerging Across Transcriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quinn</th>
<th>Stevie</th>
<th>Joel</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>After philo (12th grade), the last class you go to university, I found myself in a financial constraint, my parents who were not able to pay university for me.</td>
<td>I found a need to help myself; I needed money to continue my educational studies and most importantly to take care of myself.</td>
<td>Normally in Haiti when you go to school and when you finish your studies, your parents aren’t always able to pay for you to continue your studies and pay university for you. Even when the student was the best in their classes, to continue their studies in the university you have to teach to earn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codes: Financial constraints, Desire to continue schooling</td>
<td>Codes: Financial constraints, Desire to continue schooling</td>
<td>Codes: Financial constraints, Teach to earn, Desire to continue schooling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 revealed an example of themes across the transcriptions. These teachers discussed the financial constraint that they faced upon completing high school. They shared the experience of wanting to pursue higher education degrees however, lacking the financial means to do so. They all began to teach in order to earn enough to pay for further schooling.

Once the coding process was completed and themes were generated, I wrote teacher profiles. The idiographic nature of IPA requires an emphasis on the details of the phenomenon, which can be done through teacher profiles, which creates thick and rich descriptions. This final stage of the process allows for emerging themes from all data sets to create the analysis and narrative about the professional development experiences of teachers in Haiti. The narrative writing was then produced and incorporates direct quotes and voices of the teachers to corroborate the themes. Table 4 shows the final themes and subthemes that emerged.
Table 4: Themes and subthemes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme 1: An opportunity for self-improvement</th>
<th>Theme 2: An avenue for improving students learning</th>
<th>Theme 3: An approach to contributing to colleague’s development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subthemes:</td>
<td>Subthemes:</td>
<td>Subtheme:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Completed classical education yet “they saw me like a child”</td>
<td>1. “Forming a child is transforming my country”</td>
<td>1. “We drank the Cola in Collaboration”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. “Desire to improve as an educator”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Trustworthiness

Creswell (2013) states, “validity is an ethical relationship with the research participant through such standards as positioning themselves, having discourse, encouraging voice and being reflective” (p. 249). To establish the accuracy, validity and quality of the study, I made my biases transparent, providing rich and thick descriptions of the teachers and their experiences and ensured instrument validity by using of the same interview questions and systemic analysis of the data. Triangulation established credibility in the findings.

Researcher bias can be an internal threat to study validity. It can be minimized through the transparency of the researcher’s positionality. The interviews, transcription, coding, and analysis of the data are all steps that researcher bias can impact because of “past experiences, biases, prejudices and orientations” (Creswell, 2013, p. 251). Being reflective of one’s positionality minimizes influences that can skew the data and findings. I was reflective while journaling and writing memos. Administering the same interview questions and systemic
analysis of the data supported reliability; reliability was ensured by the use of detailed researcher reflexivity journaling, transcribing, and coding measures (Creswell, 2013, p. 253).

Another validity strategy used in the writing process is rich, thick descriptions of the teachers, the setting, and their experiences, all of which supports transferability of the findings (Creswell, 2013). These descriptions provided a plethora of interconnected details (Creswell, 2013). Additionally, I was able to triangulate the data from various teachers and the researcher reflexivity journal. Corroborating data from various sources illuminates various themes and perspectives that emerged while providing validity to the findings.

**Reciprocity**

In an effort to avoid exploitive interactions, qualitative researchers must be intentional about engaging in reciprocal research. Reciprocity is conceptualized “as a relation of mutual dependence, action, or influence… a mutual or cooperative interchange of favors of privileges,…” (Ben-Ari & Enosh, 2012, p. 426). By this definition, reciprocity occurs in the dialectic nature of qualitative IPA research inquiry. As the researcher depends on the knowledge shared by the participants, the participant may have various reasons for sharing their experiences. For example, Ben-Ari & Enosh (2012) explained that participants may want to share their experience with an empathic listener; participants might feel justified or vindicated by knowing others might share their experiences; participants might use the research as their platform for voicing their marginalized experiences and discourse; participants may also utilize the study as a space to be reflective and make sense of their experiences; or participants might just want to help others who might share their same experience (p. 426).

For this IPA study, I was situated as a participatory researcher and able to engage in dialectical co-construction of knowledge with the teachers by establishing relationships, engaged
in discourse and established mutual interest. According to Ben-Ari & Enosh, (2012) explained “mutual interest, then, is the basis for understanding the inherent reciprocal nature of the exchange in research relations” (p. 425). Therefore, I focused on not only my relationship with the teachers but also on our shared relationship with the phenomena being explored. As indicated earlier in this chapter, I conducted a seminar in which the teachers in the study participated. The teachers indicated at various points during their interactions with me that they would like me to conduct history seminars with them and their colleagues in the future. Stevie suggested this research should be published and shared with the ministry of education. He further recommended that HLP should become institutionalized and made an integral component of seminars for Haitian teachers. Stevie among many of the teachers in the study showed appreciation for the seminar and proposed future occurrence.

Limitations

Qualitative research has requirements and limitations in the data collection and analysis process. The data gathered in this study were limited by the extent of some of the teachers’ access to professional opportunities. To counter this, Smith et al., (2009) suggest rich interpretations and descriptions, which created transparency, embedded in the current literature in order to facilitate transferability.
Chapter 4: Research Findings

The problem addressed in this study focuses on in-service professional development in Haiti. This is significant because the literature revealed an absence of both initial and in-service teacher professional development programs in the country, leading to a lack of qualified teachers. The absence of in-service professional development programs can ultimately perpetuate other larger societal problems.

This chapter begins with five profiles of the nine teachers, offering their personal narratives to provide context for three themes: (i) the opportunity for self-improvement, (ii) the avenue for improving students learning through content knowledge and instructional practice, and (iii) an approach to contributing to colleagues’ development. These profiles were chosen because the teachers’ experiences represent the themes, address the research question offer a variety of experiences and perspectives. This is followed by an in-depth exploration of the three themes, which address the research question, How do teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development?

Vwa Pwofesè yo (Teacher Voices)

The next section elucidates the perspectives and experiences the men so generously shared. They initially expected to pursue different careers but ultimately chose to dedicate their lives to education. I was particularly moved by their motivation and desire to improve themselves for the greater good of their students and their colleagues.

Skyler

Skyler grew up working the land with his father; his mother was a merchant. His family did not have the financial means to send him to university once he completed philo (12th grade). Skyler began teaching to take care of himself and send himself to school. He initially took law
courses at a university in Port-au-Prince, while teaching science in a local secondary school. Port-Au-Prince is a 50-minute drive south of Arcahaie. After a few years, he realized that he should take science content courses and entered a university program that prepared him to teach. He is working on obtaining his teaching license at a university in Port-Au-Prince. Skyler, much like many teachers in Haiti, became a teacher by circumstance but really grew to enjoy it. His students and their parents give him gifts and his graduates treat him with high regard. He explained that the most enjoyable part of teaching is when his graduates pass the national exams. They return to thank him and their families appreciate him. While I was conducting the interview with Skyler at the museum, a number of people who worked there stopped to greet him. He explained proudly that many of these people were his graduates.

Travay li. Skyler is a natural science teacher in two secondary schools. He is in his mid-30s and has been teaching for 15 years. In addition to teaching natural science, Skyler teaches pedagogy and a didactic course in a vocation school to adults in order to earn a living doing what he loves and supplement his income. He is in the process of studying educational science and obtaining his teaching license. Skyler explained that he was motivated to study educational science and to pursue seminars to improve his content knowledge in science and improve his instructional practice. He was passionate about the success of his students and was proud of his contributions to their achievements. He changed his career path from law to educational science and participates in various seminars as a way to improve students learning by improving his content knowledge and his instructional practices.

He indicated that he first thought of teaching high school, after successfully tutoring his classmates, particularly in math and science. He explained that he has an aptitude for teaching.
Skyler loves people and is passionate about teaching. He smiles and pointed to his former students as he stated, “Yo kembe m’ jenn,” “Teaching keeps me young.”

**Pèspektiv li.** “We come from an archaic culture that tortures children and forces them to memorize everything,” Skyler explained. It is the desire to improve the educational experiences of young people that keeps Skyler in the classroom, because teaching in Haiti does not pay well.

Skyler compared the two schools where he teaches, one private school and the other religiously affiliated. Skyler contended that private classrooms are overcrowded and have many over aged students, which makes it difficult to maintain control of the class and teach the various age ranges. “You can find someone who is 25 years old in the same class with an 11- or 12–year-old, he pointed out. This problem has many reasons, but Skyler indicated that the school leader simply wants the numbers and it does not matter to him if the children learn. This year Skyler has a course with 82 students. The problem of over aged students is because many students lack financial resources to attend school continuously. The religious school, on the other hand, does not allow the class sizes to get over 25 students and there are not as many older students. The school is strict with the admissions process and Skyler finds that the smaller and controlled class size allows space for instruction and student academic success.

Skyler gave two reasons for his frustration with larger classes and overage students: allowing them in is unethical and that he was not prepared to teach such large numbers. He developed techniques to reach the over aged students and to keep the attention of large groups of students over time and with the help of his initial in-service classes. Skyler stated that courses since he begun teaching have helped him improve both his content knowledge and pedagogical skills. He enjoyed the courses he took in school, especially pedagogy and didactic courses because they teach him how to prepare lessons and teach various grade levels.
Skyler also participated in seminars where he learned other techniques and skills that ameliorated his teaching. Over the years, he has participated in a few seminars the government offered in Port-au-Prince. Unfortunately, these seminars are only offered a few times a year, with a limited number of seats available. He stated one of the things that he learned well at one of the government seminars is how to prepare lessons and he does not leave the house without them. Skyler has administered a seminar with 20-30 teachers and said he plans to continue teaching and working because he enjoys it.

Skyler maintained a pleasant demeanor throughout our interview; however he has strong opinions about the schools’ policies and clear ideas of changes that need to be made. He was particularly frustrated with class sizes and the overage students. Skyler explained that this is a problem that permeates schools all over the country.

Rich

Rich started teaching upon competing high school at age 21. Rich decided to enter education after failed attempts to enter medical school. Upon entering an educational science program, Rich simultaneously taught elementary school and, briefly, secondary grades. He realized secondary school was not for him when the students and other teachers taunted him for looking and being so young. “I was extremely young,” he explained. “The other teachers said you were too young; we confuse you with the other students.” Although he laughed as he told this story, it really impacted his teaching outcome and choice to teach elementary school.

Over the past 20 years, Rich has taught elementary school intermittently while completing his degrees in educational science and psychology. He also worked in other educational capacities, including a job as an inspector of eight schools in Port-au-Prince where he served as the bridge between the mayor and school leaders. He inspected the schools “to
ensure they were meeting the mayor’s expectations,“ collected data and supervised the school leaders and teachers. After gaining experience in these schools, Rich became an assistant director in one of the highest performing schools in his region.

**Travay li.** Rich has worked as a school administrator and teacher for the four years in a private school funded by a foundation that is in the U.S., Canada, and Europe. The structures, funding, and resources available in this school are rare in Haiti.

Rich explained that he entered education because,

It was appealing for me to participate in the development of my country. The base of a country’s development is education, particularly in Haiti where education is in a catastrophic state. They need human resources in this domain. That is what motivated me to go into education.

Rich pursued a degree in educational science and then psychology because of his interest in human development. He saw a correlation between education and psychology. Rich also conducts professional development seminars and teaches education courses for teachers in his school and at a teacher vocational school.

**Pèspektiv li.** Rich shared his frustration with the traditional education system that forces students to memorize instead of learning to think critically, suggesting that change must begin by providing teachers with alternative approaches to teaching. Rich said he invests much of his time in developing teachers. He works with teachers to “provide alternative teaching methods to analyze, develop their own understanding and be reflective.” Rich explained that, unfortunately, this is not the norm across the country.
Based on his experience many teachers in the country are not prepared to teach, Rich said. To be qualified to teach, he continued, educators have to know the content and have to have gone through training that is focused on the content. Rich stated,

Once you’ve learned it, you don’t master it for yourself, you master it for your ability to teach it. You have to be able to manipulate the material. Then you have to know the class in front of you not only as a collective, but also individually. You have to be able to capture students’ attention and create a healthy environment for them to learn.

Rich reflected that he expected to see greater improvements in the education system in his lifetime. He states, “It seems like nothing’s been done, on the contrary things have gotten more difficult…for me in terms of personal satisfaction someone can say I made a lot of efforts.” Rich emphasized that in his current role as assistant director of his high-performing school he has really improved the quality of education it offers.

Rich is an extremely eloquent and astute individual. Though he was humble in his reflections, Rich has made tremendous contributions to the education system in his region. Other educators and community members spoke very highly of him he is highly regarded as an educational leader in that region. He has extensive work experience and has invested time in course work and seminars in education and psychology, which make him dually qualified to teach and lead a school.

Quinn

Quinn is in his late 20s and has been teaching for eight consecutive years while studying French communication and journalism, and then developmental science. Quinn stated, “I found myself in a financial constraint with my parents who were not able to pay university for me.” He used teaching to help pay for obtaining his license in developmental science. Quinn explained
that developmental science focuses on such development initiatives as planning international enterprises and that he has learned how to write development plans and institute a developmental project for organizations and the government. Quinn stated that he enjoys teaching; plans to teach even after he graduates and gets a different position in a different sector. Quinn stated that he would like to work for an in a developmental capacity with an NGO in his hometown. Even though teaching was a means to obtaining a degree in a different domain, Quinn explained that he has an aptitude for teaching and has become passionate about both teaching and the success of his students. Quinn participates in seminars to improve his teaching and to learn alternative and progressive methods of instruction.

Travay li. Quinn works as a secondary school math teacher at three schools. In addition, he works with two organizations and is completing his studies in developmental science. Though Quinn expects to work in a different sector upon completing his schooling, he reflected that he has grown to love teaching. “I never thought I would get to the point where teaching would be part of me,” he explained. After completing a four-year program in developmental science, Quinn is approaching graduation and has decided to continue teaching in at least one school for two hours a day while he takes on his new career. “If I don’t teach, I think there will be a piece of me missing,” he stated, elaborating that he loves the relationships he is able to foster with the students and their parents.

Quinn shared a story from high school when he began to develop his vocation as a teacher; he would help his peers, “I was able to explain literature, social science, history, and biology and really develop their understanding of the material,” he explained, adding that “when the teacher explain something in class, I understood, then I would get home and find groups of students who didn’t understand the way I did… The material really stuck with me because I was
able to teach it.” He realized early in his life that teaching was a possible career choice because he was good at teaching his peers.

Quinn said he “has an aptitude to learn, and an ability to teach what I learned.” Though he never attended a formal teacher preparation program, he participated in numerous seminars held by schools at which he teaches. Quinn explained that the seminars contributed to his ability and skills to teach. He continued saying, “experience helps, from day to day if I did a lesson today I can improve a few things, my students teach me also, from today to tomorrow I improve my approach.”

Pēspektiv li. Quinn explained that he does all that he can to be useful and develop his community, especially the education sector. His teaching goal is to help improve the larger society by contributing his skills to children but, unfortunately, the teaching conditions do not always align with his goals. There are about 70 students per class at one of the schools in which he teaches and Quinn understands that these are poor conditions for teaching and learning. “This is something that pains me; the normal class should have 20-25 students,” he stated. In addition to large class sizes, Quinn explained that there are students in his classes who are overage. “In the secondary grade you find the range 14 to 20 years old in one class, explaining that the lack of regulations and resources in the country allow schools to follow their own guidelines. To make a profit, private schools, in particular, admit everyone.

Quinn’s self-confidence resonated in his answers, during out interview. He is confident in his intelligence and ability to teach and lead others. His role in the community and the NGO that he works for places Quinn as a leader in the region. I had the opportunity to interact with Quinn beyond the interviews when he helped organize a neighborhood-cleaning day and a march for mental health awareness. Quinn was instrumental in coordinating and executing these activities
for the town. Quinn studied developmental science because he wants to motivate and influence his community on a larger scale.

**Bobbie**

Upon completing high school, Bobbie studied journalism in a university in Port-au-Prince. He started teaching elementary school at age 19 while in school. Bobbie reflected that though he was not paid enough while teaching, members of the community encouraged him to keep teaching because they thought he was doing a good job. He realized he had a true vocation for teaching. Although he was not getting paid consistently at that time, his students’ parents gave him gifts like homemade peanut butter and crops that they grew.

Much like the other teachers, Bobbie initially began teaching to pay for completing university. However, Bobbie’s path was more unique. Because of his altruistic and gregarious nature, Bobbie rallied a group of friends locally to fund and open an elementary school in one of the most rural sections of the region. “Pa t ‘gen ase plas pou elèv yo nan zòn nan,” “This region did not have enough seats in their elementary schools,” Bobbie stated, Bobbie is passionate about maintaining the integrity of this school in his region.

**Travay li.** Bobbie has been a teacher and the director of this school for eight years. He elaborated that he and his friends founded the school because they felt that there were too many children in their area who did not attend school and there were not enough seats in the existing elementary schools. Bobbie decided he would study school administration to learn how to efficiently run the elementary school. He stated, “I got a diploma because I developed a love for education… I wanted to perform better. I wanted to learn more about maintaining a school.” One theme that resonated throughout Bobbie’s interview was his persistence and continual desire to improve as a leader and a teacher.
Bobbie plays multiple roles in his community and works at several jobs to earn a living. Bobbie explained that upon founding the school he decided he had to also be a teacher. “I was aware there aren't a lot of people in the community who have the capacity to teach, therefore I became a teacher in the school,” he stated. Though Bobbie never attended a vocational school or a university program to learn to teach, he started participating in seminars when he started teaching. Bobbie reflected that initially he was not prepared to teach. He had an academic foundation but did not have the formal preparation to be a teacher. He explained that it is through these seminars he has been able to improve his instruction after a few years.

**Pèspektiv li**

Bobbie admitted that though he has worked in the education field for many years he has been disappointed with the country’s progress. He explained there are not enough good results. Bobbie elaborated on this point stating that the traditional rote teaching methods do not take the child into consideration. Bobbie stated,

The child’s environment, meaning, as a teacher you give your time, but the student doesn’t have documents, no books, those are the first things, they have no materials to work…Another thing, the child doesn’t eat sometimes, they are tired and can’t learn. These are some problems that don’t allow you to get the results that you need as a teacher.

Bobbie blamed and criticized the government’s lack of support for its citizens for these problems. The school that Bobbie founded has eight teachers who are not all high school graduates. Some completed 12th grade, others the 11th, and a few who completed only the ninth grade. Bobbie explained that that problem exists all over the region. His school does not have the funding to pay teachers who graduated from university or a vocational school; these teachers are professionals and require more money. Neighborhood parents, mostly subsistence farmers cannot
afford to pay for their children to attend school. Bobbie solved this problem by hiring local people who “have the capacity to read, comprehend, and write well, they can pronounce, and speak well. They aren’t timid.” Bobbie explained that if the person meets these criteria it becomes his responsibility to host seminars and develop them as teachers. He administers seminars for about 150 teachers all over the region, including the eight in his school. He explained that he begins the school year with seminars “focusing on pedagogy that teaches them how to plan, teach and implement the content.” Bobbie elaborates,

Well, first as director in the school, before school starts I hold seminars for the teachers and after the seminars I provide them with resources to do the work. I conduct observations, and give them notebooks to plan their lessons. I help them plan lessons and I do seminars. I check the notebooks and observe the lessons to make sure they respect the principles that I teach. I encourage them to use books to make sure they complete their knowledge.

In addition to hosting them in school-based seminars he encourages his teachers to improve their teaching by participating in other seminars in the region. Bobbie believes that in this way teachers should be able to learn to prepare lessons, execute them, and teach and prepare exams to evaluate student learning.

In addition to running an elementary school and teaching Bobbie explained, “I work in many domains. I am a consultant, I work in emergencies, if there is an earthquake, floods or other emergency, I evacuate the people and treat the people till they get to a doctor. Bobbie explained that he had also studied agronomy and worked on various natural resource projects in his town. I am also a tree planter. I have little trees that I grow and sell them for people to plant
in other places.” Bobbie explained that he also works as a tree planter to reforest his region. He teaches his students and the community about the importance of tree planting.

Furthermore, Bobbie does consulting for numerous organizations in the education field evaluating low performing schools.

I plan their seminars, and I do research to help them find documents and resources. I help them start and structure the school year. When I have time I supervise and provide feedback and I produce plans for the school to function well.

Bobbie explained that he does these various jobs not only to earn a living but, more importantly, because he wants to improve the education system in his region.

Ultimately, Bobbie is passionate and works in many capacities that improve the conditions of the region. He discussed his efforts to reforest the mountains, teach literacy to adults, and work as a consultant for various schools in the region to create school improvement plans and lead seminars for their teachers. Bobbie has a great vision for himself and for his town, explaining that he wants to work with the people in the rural regions to support ecological development and the sustainability of the agriculture sector. He believes this can be achieved by providing access to quality schools in the rural regions. During our interview, Bobbie discussed his desire to run for political office. He is amiable and candid and I think he would be a great servant leader in the town’s local government.

**Stevie**

Stevie is in his late 20’s and initially became a teacher for financial reasons because his family could not afford university tuition. “Yo pa kroke makout twò wo, men kote men ou ka rive,” Stevie stated. He understands his family did its best getting him through high school. He wanted to continue his studies in developmental science so he started teaching to earn money.
Stevie attended university where he studied developmental science. Though he did not attend school to study education, Stevie reflects that he loves teaching and improving his community.

Stevie told a story about working with his peers in high school, stating,

I take pleasure in sharing what I know and sharing my experiences with other people…When I understand something that the teacher taught and they don’t understand I participate with them in a sort of activity as a work group after class.

Stevie explained that these experiences in high school set the stage for him to teach when he graduated and reflected that he found a joy in doing this work to be able to help and teach others in the community. A few of the other teachers explained that Stevie was the leader of their tutoring group. To succeed as students, they formed study groups and took turns reciting lessons. When one doesn’t understand something, the others take turns teaching each other. They competed with one another in class for who will be first, second, and so forth in exams. Stevie always came in first, he had the highest scores in the class, and his peers could not understand how he always did this. Stevie explained that he understands how he learns and would study in ways that supported his learning style. As an adult, Stevie has worked to support his students’ and colleagues’ success by transferring this understanding to them. He recently returned to school to study educational science in support of his role as director of pedagogy.

**Travay li.** Stevie is a social science teacher and director of pedagogy. He has been teaching since September 2009. He teaches in two schools to earn a salary that can help support his academic pursuits in university. Stevie teaches social science; in addition, Stevie teaches pedagogy in a local school. He explained that when he first started teaching he learned through trial and error. He stated, “It was with time and experience that I've improved and learn to teach social science.” The first few years of teaching Stevie utilized his old notebooks and the methods
his teachers used, acknowledging that those content and teaching approaches did not resonate with the students. “Concepts that I used to teach were all theoretical, they stayed in the air,” he stated. Stevie explained that he participated in a few seminars that helped him understand that there are actual techniques to teaching. “When I went to seminars I started to understand, for example, how to write a lesson. Now I know that before I enter a classroom I have to have a lesson and a connection for the students.” In addition, Stevie stated that he also learned to capture the student’s attention. He reflected that these experiences help him to teach better.

Stevie has returned to school to study educational science because he has obtained a position as director of pedagogy, saying that he has had success in this position, “there’s some stability in the school, the parents trust me and they are making testimonies about me during family meetings.” Stevie stated that the director of the school commended him on his ability to successfully meet the requirements of the position, saying, “you can learn, you are intelligent, you enter the classes and do supervision, you do teacher evaluations, you review the lessons, you welcome parents, you do all of these things well.” He believes that if he completes his university training in education, he would be a great director of pedagogy and perhaps one day director of a school.

Pèşpektiv li

Stevie explained not enough teachers learned to teach by completing vocational teacher training school or studying content and pedagogy in university. There are teachers who completed vocational teacher training school., “These are the people who should be teaching,” he stated. Stevie complained that too many teachers had not ”There are some who didn’t even finish 11th grade, there are others who finished sixth grade and are teaching primary grades.” It is their
lack of formal training that motivated Stevie’s desire to provide training and seminars for his colleagues and teachers.

Stevie reflected on his experience as director of pedagogy, explaining that he encourages and work with the teachers. He established a collaborative culture where the teachers learn to work with one another and to expect his support. “I spend time in the class to see how they work with the students. I take notes from time to time, and keep records. I look at how they work and look for things they need to improve,” Stevie noted. He also provides feedback and holds seminars for his teachers explaining that this provides alternate approaches for some of the teachers maintain traditional approaches to teaching and through his own training he is able to provide alternative approaches for his teachers.

I also ask them to improve how they discipline the students. Some make the students stand for a long time or they put them on their knees for a long time or beat the students… I tell them there are other solutions to encourage the student to study. If you have candy for example, you can give it to the students who know their lessons with the best notes to encourage them. The ones who don’t know the lesson, you can talk with them, have them repeat the lesson, or stay after class to learn the lesson. All of these are measures that can encourage student learning.

Stevie indicated that he encourages the teachers to participate in other seminars outside of the school and to share what they learned with their colleagues. Additionally, Stevie explained that he counsels teachers to attending vocational school or university and obtain their teaching licenses.

Overall, the teachers in this study shared specific constraints in life that impelled them to become educators. However, they all have proven to be remarkable individuals who pushed
against the social constraints and continued their educational pursuits, while developing a love for teaching and for the students. Furthermore, these men indicated that they understood their roles as educators have larger societal impacts. Many worked to attain teaching licensure and participated in seminars to improve themselves, alter their instructional practice to improve learning, and to provide support to their colleagues. The following section further illuminates these points.

**Themes**

*He who learns, teaches*—*Ethiopian proverb*

Saldaña (2013) explained “a theme is an abstract identity that brings meaning and identity to a recurrent (patterned) experience and it variant manifestations. As such, themes capture and unifies the nature or basis of the experience into a meaningful whole” (p. 176). This study reveals three themes that encompass the teachers’ personal, academic and professional experiences, and how they perceive their professional development: (a) an opportunity for self-improvement, (b) an avenue for improving students learning, and (c) an approach to contributing to colleagues’ development.

**Theme 1: Opportunity for Self-Improvement**

In this study, all of the teachers were motivated toward self-improvement. Throughout their interviews, the teachers discussed the importance of continual academic and professional growth. They perceived teaching and professional development as a means to advance and progress. The subthemes that resonated with in of their experiences and contribute to this theme are: completed classical education, yet “they saw me like a child,” teach to earn, and a desire to improve as an educator. The teachers explained that to have a seriousness of purpose in their lives and careers, they worked hard to complete high school and utilized teaching as a means to
continue their educational development and improve their financial circumstances. Their love of teaching propelled their desire to improve as educators. They were all goal-oriented and sought to be successful at what they were doing. All of the educators grew to love teaching and continued to pursue schooling and seminars that would improve their content and instructional practice.

**Completed Classical Education, yet, “They saw me like a child.”**

The teachers perceived their high school experience as an integral part of the process that led them to begin teaching. All but one of the teachers graduated high school before beginning to teach, but they explained that this was not always the norm for teachers, particularly in rural regions. Bobbie elaborated on this point stating,

> I have eight teachers in my school. Not all are finished with the 12th grade. Not all the teachers are at the same level… There are some who didn’t reach 12th grade, or the 11th grade; there are some who only got to the ninth grade.

For the educators, completing what they referred to as a classical education was a crucial marker for beginning to teach, Gabe explained one challenge that he faced his first year teaching was that he had not completed the 12th grade when he took his first teaching job. Gabe stated, “I had a problem because I had not finished at least the 12th grade so that the school could recognize me as someone who is prepared to teach.” It was imperative for him to complete this level of schooling. All of the teachers expressed similar sentiments about the importance of completing their high school educations. They shared a desire to be recognized and respected, at the bare minimum, as individuals who could teach any grade level because they completed all of their classical schooling.
Another problem they encountered by starting to teach at such young ages was the way their colleagues and students perceived them. The teachers all said they encountered problems with students because they were so young when they began teaching. They were ridiculed by the students and at times belittled by their colleagues. Bobbie explained, “Well, I have to tell you, when I first started teaching children, you can look at me physically I am small, I was 19 years old. I had students my age and older than me, taller and bigger than me. Eli shared the same frustration, stating, “Well a difficulty that I had was during my first year teaching removing the idea from my students’ minds that I was a child. They saw me like a child.” They regarded these experiences as further motivation to continue their education and enrolled in university courses in Port-au-Prince.

“Teach to Earn”

The participants became teachers for multiple reasons and through different avenues. However, the data shows that financial hardship was one resonating issue that initially propelled many of the teachers into the classroom. Quinn came to the realization that upon graduating from high school he could not immediately enter university, as he wanted because his family was unable to pay for him to pursue higher education.

Joel shared the same sentiment when he finished 12th grade,

Well, normally in Haiti when you go to school and when you finish your studies, your parents aren’t always able to pay for you to continue your studies and pay university for you. Even when the student was the best in their classes, to continue their studies in the university you have to teach to earn.

Stevie concurred, explaining, “I found a need to help myself. I needed money to continue my educational studies and most importantly to take care of myself.” The teachers came to the
realization that they not only had to become self-sufficient but they also had the desire to continue their academic pursuits.

Stevie further elaborated, that teachers in Haiti teach for one of three reasons: financial need, a pastime, or to help a colleague. He explained that the financial need arises when students graduate from the 12th grade and are then able to earn a living. Bobbie elucidated how this contributes to larger problems in education,

My academic experience did not prepare me; there were things I was lacking. Teaching is not a lottery, not anyone can teach. That is why we have a big problem in Haiti. People teach due to circumstances. It is their plan B. The person enters education because they have nothing else to do. They do not always enter education because they have an objective nor do they love education. They teach because they finished 12th or 11th grade and they don’t have anything to do.

The teachers explained that students who live in rural areas have very few career options once they finish high school. If their families own land, they can become subsistence farmers and merchants. Others drive taxis or motorcycles or become teachers. Stevie further explained that when he finished school in 2006, driving taxis was not as popular in his town. Much like the other teachers, he felt obligated to find a means to generate income. He decided to become a teacher because he needed to earn a living and always enjoyed sharing what he knows with others. Most of the educators shared the desire to improve their own economic conditions. Teaching allowed them the time and the means to further their schooling.

“Desire to Improve as an Educator”

Some of the teachers first used teaching as a means to afford university and study other careers. They had to teach at multiple schools and have duel careers to earn a living. They all,
however, grew to love teaching and have all been teaching for over five years. It is while teaching that they began to see the need to participate in Initial In-service Teacher Training (IITT). “I didn’t have a professional preparation to be a teacher,” Bobbie stated and he therefore took classes at a university in Port-au-Prince and participated in local seminars to develop content knowledge and pedagogical skills. The local seminars were hosted by non-profit organizations, private individuals who have had formal training, a few schools, or external organizations from different countries. Stevie explained an alternative perspective,

I don’t have to go to vocational school, because I did other studies, much further. This August I graduated from a university. I studied agronomy. I am now a student of developmental science at a university. In the courses that I have followed, and my competence level, I think I’m really armed to work in a school. As long as I know how to prepare lessons and I understand what the ministry of education wants with the curriculum, I’m prepared to teach.

Though all of the educators indicated that they developed a love for their work as teachers, they were not all motivated to participate in the initial teacher-preparation process. Some chose to participate in seminars to further their content knowledge. However, changes in government policies now mandate teachers to participate in formal academic programs. Joel explained, that the Ministry of Education took a census of the education workforce. The next step is requiring that only people who studied educational science at university or those who attended a vocational teacher education school can teach. It is unclear how this mandate will be enforced in the next few years.

Content Knowledge
Though many of the teachers initially studied something other than education at university, some altered their studies and attended an IITT while teaching to improve their content knowledge. Skyler explained that he changed his mind while in law school and decided to attend an IITT program because of the work he was doing as a teacher.

I wanted to go to a school that had more focus on the content that I am teaching, that is why I went to a university in Port-au-Prince and I took educational science. I was teaching natural science. That required me to attend a school that had rapport with natural science. Then I did the natural science option, which aligned with what I was working in. I am working on getting a license now.

Skyler further explained that he was able to specialize his focus in natural science. He explained that he particularly appreciated the fact that he had access to natural science professors who helped him delve into the content. In addition to appreciating the content mastery, he made the distinction and expressed the importance of learning how to teach the material.

**Developed a love of teaching**

Some of the educators attended IITT while teaching because they grew to love teaching. Bobbie explained, “At that time I was teaching, I grew to love teaching so I studied at the same time. I got a diploma because I developed a love for education.” Likewise, Quinn found that he grew to love teaching and that was not what he was expecting when he started. He also felt like teaching had become a component of his identity that he could not live without. Joel echoed these sentiments. He did not initially intend to remain a teacher; he was using teaching as a means to study economics. Joel explained, “However, I stayed in education through love, the love I have for it, without love you can’t teach. The love made me stay in education.” Though
Joel did not return to school to study IITT, he participated in many seminars in order to improve his instructional practice.

**Returning to the Researcher Reflexivity Journal**

In summary, all of the educators discussed the importance of completing high school to be recognized as someone who can teach. They also used the salary they earned teaching as a way to pay for continuing their higher education. Most of the teachers began their university experiences studying something other than education, however, they all developed an affinity for teaching that drove them to want to improve their instructional practice. Some changed their majors in university to focus on education because they developed a love for teaching.

As the researcher I was initially perplexed by how they could fund their higher education from teaching and how they found the time to attend school while teaching in multiple schools. This revealed my Western view of teaching schedules and the work and the time demand required of teachers in the United States. However, I learned from them that though teaching does not pay well, their teaching schedules allow them time to teach at multiple schools, have dual careers, and take courses at the universities in Port-au-Prince. Some of the teachers explained that they give six hours a week to each school and teach at two or three schools to earn enough to live and pay for a few university courses.

Another idea that revealed my Western lens was the notion that someone who did not complete high school can get a teaching job. I found myself mentally passing judgment. I wanted to see their lesson plans and observe the classes. I am a former teacher and I know the complex body of content and pedagogical understanding required to teach well. I felt overwhelmed and wondered what could be done to begin to develop teachers who had not completed the ninth grade. What does it mean for teaching and learning and how does the teachers experience impact
the student academic outcomes? The teachers had similar thoughts and it was these questions that propelled many of them to participate in IITT and seminars. They wanted to improve the teaching and learning that occurred in their respective classrooms.

**Theme 2: Avenue for Improving Student Learning**

In addition to personal growth, it was imperative to the teachers that they help their students succeed. “I do everything I can do to be useful and develop the community in terms of the education. The goal of my work is with the children; it is how I will improve not only instruction but education,” Quinn stated. All the teachers said they measured success by whether their students passed the yearly national exam. They utilized IITT and seminars to improve their instructional practice for the purpose of helping their students. The subthemes here are: (a) “Forming a child is transforming my country” and (b) Alter the traditional rote methods of instruction and practice. To clarify: The teachers perceived experience in participating in IITT and seminars as helpful in improving teaching and learning and they utilized these learning experiences to move away from the rote, traditional methods of instruction.

**“Forming a Child is Transforming My Country”**

Many of the educators discussed the importance of improving instructional practice for a purpose beyond themselves, for their students. Bobbie explained that he became a teacher and founded of a school because there were too many children in his community who did not go to school. Joel shared a similar sentiment, stating,
I feel that the process of forming a child is transforming my country and it's transforming the tomorrow of my country. And it's also an experience where, even if I may have problems at home, when I get to school I forget my problems and I'm able to just give myself to my students and really help them.

The desire to improve the educational experience of others motivated many of the teachers to attend IITT or participate in seminars. A few explained that they’d taught for a few years, they realized that their lessons remained theoretical and students were not learning. Stevie explained, “For the first year I had some content, terms, concepts that I used to teach, but they were all theoretical, they stayed in the air.” Some reflected that after a few years of experiencing failure they decided to attend IITT or participate in seminars. They felt they gained a more profound understanding and were able to be better teachers.

**Higher education**

After they began teaching, many of the teachers began to see the importance of participating in IITT or seminars in order to ameliorate their instruction and improve student-learning outcomes. The teachers described their experiences in IITT as crucial to helping them to develop tools to teach their students. Skyler related that as someone who is already in the field teaching he found the courses relevant and interesting. Skyler explained that he had good professors who supported his learning and “Thanks for that, now I can transmit the information to my students.” The teachers discussed the importance of learning content and learning how to best convey their learning to their students. The process of teaching and learning became transparent.

Skyler explained further,
I participated in two great courses that are really important in the education field that focused on pedagogy and didactic. For example, there was didactic communication and didactic of the content. The didactic of the content is mostly teaching you about how to prepare a lesson.

Similarly, Bay explained that before he participated in IITT he did not have a sense of how people learned but since he started his program in educational science at university, he developed a better understanding of how children learn and the importance of favorable learning environments.

Rich had a similar reflection about the courses that contributed to his instruction. “To be qualified to teach a content, you have to know the content, if it is social science, or mathematics, you have to have formation that is focused on the content,” Rich noted. He elaborated on the point: “Once you have learned it, you don’t master it for yourself, you master it for your ability to teach it.” Rich discussed specific courses that helped him improve as an educator. Rich talked in depth about a special education course and how that shifted his perspective on to encourage students to learn. Rich stated,

All students do not learn on the same rhythm, they are not all good on the same material. The student can be good at one material and learn quickly and other material can take a lot of time and energy to learn, but if you tell them they performed two out of 10 you can discourage all of their efforts.

The teachers reflected on various pedagogical understandings they learned from participating in IITT. They agreed that knowing and understanding the need to know the learners in front of them is vital. Many of the educators discussed the need to create an environment in which their students can learn. Rich reflected that his belief that teachers must continue learning
and participate in courses that allow them to master content and learn how to ensure students are learning.

A few of the teachers discussed the various learning styles of students. They revealed that their course work helped them understand various learning styles and approaches. However, it is unclear how or if accommodations are made for the various learners. Eli was able to illustrate how he struggles with students who are behind academically. He provided an example of a student, who was substantially behind,

I had a child who just came from primary school and he couldn’t do division, he needed a calculator to do basic division. There are many students like that. They give me problems. When students are behind I have to spend time and go back and teach them the skills that they don't have an order to be able to move forward. Sometimes you have to go back all the way. You know, when you have a program that you're following, you know every day you have specific things that you need to do. But if the student doesn't have the skills, he can't move forward. You have to go back and teach the foundation, without the base or the foundation you don't have anything.

Eli explained further that he learned to teach the students where they are, committing extra time to teach them remedial skills and fill in the foundations they lack. For cases like these, he augmented the instruction by adding an additional 30 minutes of his unpaid work time to his teaching schedule in an effort to help students improve their academic levels. Eli said he has had some success with this, however he did not mention if or how he alters his instruction or makes accommodations to his practices to help students who are behind.

“Alter the traditional rote methods of instruction and practice”

All of the teachers did not participated in IITT. Quinn explained that,
When it comes to methods, I never took four years of study in terms of pedagogy. The schools at times hold seminars for the teachers. Outside of the aptitude that I developed naturally, the seminars that I’ve participated in has improved my ability or skills for me to teach.

Quinn participated in seminars sponsored by the schools when a new textbook is released and the teachers receive training on how to utilize the resources. The companies that publish the books provided the trainings. Bobbie has more experience in seminars and searches for them. He stated, “I wanted to learn how to teach well, therefore each time there is a seminar I spend my own money to participate in these seminars.” Though the teachers did not specify how much they spend on seminars, they did say that most teachers do not earn enough money to participate. Bobbie further explained,

Since I teach primary grades, the seminars cover global topics. Primary school teachers in Haiti teach everything. Therefore they have seminars that have global content. Math, social science, natural science, they also cover pedagogy. They cover lesson-planning, objectives, in order to teach the students better. They help you use your time more efficiently. If you're supposed to teach something in 30 minutes, but you spend 3 hours, but after the seminars you then have the capacity to do the lesson in 30 minutes, then you can evaluate the students learning, and assess that the work that took hours was a waste of time and you can effectively teach in 30-35 minutes. You have more results.

The educators reflected on how some of the seminars they have participated in contribute to improving their instructional methods. They explained that good seminars could help refine their work and provide clarity in their instruction. Bobbie stated,
I used to do everything all that once and there was no clarity in instruction. My students had difficulties learning. The seminars have helped me to clarify... I know how to evaluate the students. Even if I have 20, 30, 40, 50 students I have the capacity to control the classroom.

Bobbie referred to classroom management and student engagement when he stated that he is able to control any class size. He shared that he initially had difficulties transmitting information to students, however, after participating in a few seminars he learned new tools to ensure teaching and learning occurred fluidly. Bobbie provided examples of the tools that he learned in seminars and ways to create engaging lessons and activities to capture his students interests.

Many of the participants discussed some seminars they participated in that ameliorated certain aspects of their instructional practice. Stevie explained that when he started teaching, he used routines he remembered from his teachers, he utilized his old notebooks and the methods his teachers used to teach him. Stevie stated,

The second year I took a couple seminars that help me understand how to teach... I started to understand, for example, now I know that before I enter a classroom I have to have a lesson and a connection for the students. I also learned that I have to capture the students’ attention.

In addition to learning the foundations, the teachers explained that some of the seminars shifted them away from traditional methods of teaching.

They noted that the traditional method of instruction is memorization. Bay clarified, saying that the teachers would give the students’ notes or a lesson to memorize, expecting them to recite the notes the following day. He learned at a seminar that by giving students fewer notes
and providing time for the children to practice what they are learning will help them learn and retain the information. Bay used French instruction as an example, suggesting that instead of asking students to memorize a list of verbs, the best teaching and learning approach would be to create opportunities for the students to practice using these verbs.

Others explained that they learned techniques to bring lessons alive for students. Some indicated they utilize poetry to capture student attention while others use music, theater, or other forms. Bobbie explained that,

It wasn't until I started teaching that I started participating in seminars and learning how to teach. The trainings that I received allowed after two or three years, for me to learn more and for me to improve my instruction.

Bobbie explained that when is teaching about history he brings in artifacts and dresses up and reenacts history scenes. These are ideas and tools that he collected from seminars he attended over the course of his career.

**HLP History Seminar**

Prior to conducting the interviews, I conducted a history seminar for the teachers. The seminar focused on providing the teachers access to historical resources online and to teach them how to bring their current history curriculum to life. All of the educators in this study also participated in the HLP history seminar. During their interviews the teachers discussed the importance of learning history. Even teachers who did not teach history believed it is important to learn history for themselves and to teach their students. Rich explained, that you cannot know a culture without knowing the history, he stated, “I will be sharing this information with my staff”. Quinn, had similar sentiments explaining, that the HLP seminar was a great initiative to help teachers learn and grow. Quinn related,
I think that it's really great when teachers really want to grow and make a difference in education and to really do this you have to start with history. History plays an important role in the esteem of a person. To do this you have to begin with history. This makes a huge difference and helping teachers helping students understand who they are, where they came from and where they are going in the world and what they represent in the world. They are simply going to say, I was born, I lived, I died. But to truly make a difference and have the development that you want, the child should grow up with their history and to know the importance of their history and that they have and are part of a family, a community and a country.

The educators explained that they participated in the training because they wanted to learn more history. Stevie was moved by the activities conducted in the HLP training, Stevie explained, “I learned quite a bit of information and I took notes that are going to help me with the work that I'm going to do,” Stevie explained. Stevie reflected that through this seminar he learned how to find ways of making history more impactful and resonate with the students. Joel shed light on the importance of teaching students their history,

Well yes I found this training very useful…. I'm able to apply a lot of the instructions that I got from there. Social science should teach the student to love their country and themselves. There are things that we have in this country, if you don't love it and everybody will want to leave, then that way you won't have a country. So what we've learned, we have to apply them and will make everything valid and we contribute to the students in that sense.

Bobbie explained that as an elementary school teacher he teaches the student about, “their identity, their origin, how they came here, their heroes, Haiti’s independence, and how they got
their freedom.” Bobbie stated that is important at early ages for Black children learn to be proud of their color and their contributions, and importance in the world to give them a sense of pride and value. Bobbie reflected that he is always in search of ways to improve his instruction and expand what he knows. In addition to improving their instruction, the teachers developed and learned new approaches to content alternative approaches to discipline.

**Caring relationships with students**

The educators discuss discipline and approaches to addressing student behavior and supporting their emotional needs. Gabe explained that he realized that when parents are not there, the teacher becomes the parent. Gabe referred to the fact that the parents are not physically in the classroom; therefore there are related particular measures teachers have to take to make sure that students follow instruction. This begins with how you interact and engage with the students. The traditional methods of discipline were corporal punishment or asking a problem student to leave the school for the day or even indefinitely. Quinn explained that after participating in a mental health seminar for teachers, he approached discipline and his students in a drastically different way. Quinn explicates,

Now I have a better understanding of my students, especially after the seminar for mental health, on the approaches that I can use to engage the students. I saw the differences between older approaches of discipline and engaging in conversations with the students. Quinn shared an example of a student who challenged him and he reflected on his growth after the seminar.

There was a student in the ninth grade that always performed well, however, in the 10th grade, I noticed her grades were deteriorating. She was giving 20%. I asked, “What’s wrong, you are growing up, and do you have a boyfriend distracting you?” That is when I
learned that her mother had died and that was the cause of her change. And her financial situation had deteriorated, she was living in a family member’s home and she had to leave her home. All these things had made her not able to learn or perform. It was after this that I attended a week in the teacher training on mental health, it was then I learned about paying attention to the students, how they perform, how they used to perform, and paying attention to changes. I saw that I was doing a bad job and it changed my approach to how I work and engage with students.

Quinn reflected that he has a different level of care when engaging when students and his is much more attentive. Quinn explained that he now understands that, “The students are fragile, their brains are fragile, and anything can impact their comportment, their results, and their sentiments. This seminar was helpful.” Some of the teachers discussed the success and usefulness of the mental health trainings that they now have new tools and approaches for supporting students with academic and behavior challenges.

**Critique of seminars**

Though they all shared positive experiences and growth in seminars, the teachers also revealed their frustrations. As they discussed their understanding of their students learning needs, they also reflected on their own needs as learners. They all shared similar critiques of the seminars, explaining that not all seminar leaders take into consideration how they learn as adults and neither do they consider the resources they have as teachers in their respective schools. Eli explained that he believes the person conducting the seminar should know how to engage the people, who are participating, to ensure they are learning. Eli continues to elaborate,
As for seminars in Haiti I don't think that they take into consideration how the teachers learn. If these places exist I don't know about them. A lot of times it's when the exams come, that's when people are paying attention to what the teachers are doing.

Quinn shared a similar perspective, stating, “They have a global approach, they don't take into consideration how each individual learns…” Stevie reported that he found the individuals conducting the seminars “rush with the time that they have and with the amount of the students in the trainings, they are not able to adhere to everyone’s learning. They speak and at times they ask questions for you to speak. They are lecture and you have to write notes.” Gabe said that he has had a few trainings where his learning needs were taken into consideration. However, Gabe continued, there were other seminars “where they just give you a paper with information, and that's it and it's not very concrete.”

Though the teachers shared similar critiques, they continue to participate in seminars in hope of learning for themselves and their students, and to support the growth of their colleagues. The teachers also noted that the seminars are offered arbitrarily and that there are no institutionalized structures in place to ensure that all teachers have access to them. It should be made clear that these teachers’ experiences are not the norm across the country. This group of teachers seeks out seminars and uses their own funds to participate.

**Returning to the Researcher Reflexivity Journal**

To summarize this theme, the teachers all want to improve their instructional practices for the purpose of improving the learning outcomes of their students. They all explained they participated in either IITT or in seminars was to ameliorate their instructional practices. Many explained that these learning experiences, particularly in seminars, altered their rote traditional methods of instructions and disciplinary approaches.
I was moved by how affectionately they talked about their students. Even though two of the teachers discussed leaving education all together because the pay is so poor, they stated that they would continue teaching for at least two hours per week because they love the relationships and the impact they can have. The remaining seven stated they would always teach, even when they are directors of schools and hold other titles in education. They seemed to come to life when they shared positive stories about their interactions with students. One of them related how happy he is when he sees his graduates in the neighborhood and they tell him they passed the state exam or they were admitted to university. Another teacher told a story about a trip to Miami when he ran into a graduate. This student took him shopping and purchased cologne for him to thank him for all of his hard work and dedication. He said that it was not the gift that moved him, but the idea that he has students who were impacted by his work.

It was clear they understood that as teachers they played a larger role in society. They appeared to be revered in their community as leaders and people with wisdom, though some of them still look very young. A few of the teachers even discussed their desire to run for office. I understand that they did not initially aspire to become teachers because the pay is so poor, however, they all found something more profound in the career that propelled their desire to master the art of teaching and contribute to the growth of their colleagues.

**Theme 3: Approach to Contributing to Colleagues’ Development**

The final overarching theme that emerged was that the teachers utilized what they learned to contribute to their colleagues. They all recognized a need to collaborate and support the improvement of teaching and learning in their schools. Despite the fact that they teach in multiple schools, five of the nine teachers also work in administrative capacities. They all reflected on their own growth and the importance of improving their instruction to meet their
students’ learning needs and, in addition, many of the educators were critical of their colleagues desired to support their growth and teaching practices. Skyler explained, “We need to improve our system, we are lacking qualified teachers.” There were two sub-themes that resonated with their desire to contribute to their colleagues; first, most of the teachers discussed the importance of collaboration and, second, they wanted to build capacity by reinforcing their colleagues teaching abilities.

“We Drank the Cola in Collaboration”

Most of the teachers experienced tutoring and collaborating with peers as early as in high school. Stevie stated, “I take pleasure in sharing my knowledge.” They developed a collaborative culture in high school to support the success of everyone in their peer groups. The educators perceived that their education experiences during their classical years contributed to their desire to become teachers and to continue learning. They explained that that is when they developed a sense of helping others. All of the teachers spoke about their years in high school saying that the experience of tutoring peers motivated their desire to become teachers. They discussed their roles as tutors for their peers and enjoyed the experience of teaching others. Stevie explained, “I was used to helping kids that were smaller than me since I started school. I take pleasure in sharing what I know and sharing my experiences with other people.” The teachers related that they worked with students in lower grades and created work groups and competed among themselves as peers. Stevie explained,

When I understand something that the teacher taught and they don’t understand, I participated with them in a sort of activity as a work group after class. And in my language I help them understand. Since then, some of them call me professor.
Eli was part of this work group and both corroborated and elaborated on Stevie’s experience in these work groups. He elaborated,

"Entering teaching is something that is in my blood since I was in the ninth grade. It is something that influenced me and really impacted me since I started working with peers in my own classrooms as a student."

These work groups, had multiple outcomes for the teachers. They served as tutors for each other and studied together; they competed among each other and they motivated one another and held each other accountable. Most of the teachers explained that their exposure to teaching commenced with these work groups. Eli explained that they all worked hard studying at home so that they would be prepared to teach the group the lesson the following day. He explained further, “Among us there was a competition to show what we're learning. We all had a conviction to learn and this conviction a lot is to go far.” The teachers began also with a conviction to support the learning of others. This continued into adulthood.

"The teachers need help"

Many of the teachers discussed the importance of collaborating and sharing what they are learning with their colleagues for the greater good of society. Rich explained that,

"It was appealing for me to participate in the development of my country. The base of a country’s development is education, particularly in Haiti where education is in a catastrophic state. They need human resources in this domain."

Rich was motivated to get into education and continues to be motivated to develop the human resources in his own school. Upon completion of each seminar, Rich conducts workshops where he shares the content with his colleagues. Rich participated in a mental health training for teachers. He stated, “I thought it was important work. I had a plan in my mind to conduct a
seminar like this with my teachers…” Rich teaches and is the assistant director in a school that is unique in Haiti because all the teachers hold teaching licenses. In addition, Rich works with his faculty to continuously provide access to seminars.

Nevertheless, this is not the norm in the country. Rich explained that many teachers do not participate in IITT or seminars because of financial constraints and a lack of access. Rich stated, “It is expensive for professionals working in education in Haiti.” Bay supported this point by stating, “The way they pay teachers does not allow you to participate because you have to pay.” Many teachers explained that many of their colleagues do not teach well and need to participate in more seminars. This is why they take it upon themselves to conduct trainings.

Quinn explained,

I think a number of them need content; just the same a lot of them need methods and pedagogy. I remember a seminar that I took, which focused on how to teach well you have to have a formula, MMV material, method, verb. Some of them have the content, but they don't have the method and do not have the verb; some have the content, they don't have a method or the language to teach; others can talk, but they don't have any content and don’t have any method of pedagogical understanding. I think that you need all three of these and teachers need to develop all three of these in order to really be informative and impactful in their instruction.

The teachers reflected about the various teaching challenges that their colleagues encounter. Skyler explained that he believes his colleagues, “are minimalists. Some teachers are dogmatic and stick to what is in their heads, it’s, “Yes, Amen.” They do not aim to improve or augment their instruction.” He continued, saying, “There are even people who do not want to prepare for their lessons. It is rare. That is a big problem for the schools.” Stevie expounded on
the challenges, explaining that the teachers need help. “Many of them are people who did not go through vocational school or university… there are people who just teach after 12th grade, there are some who didn’t even finish 11th grade, there are others who finished sixth grade that are teaching primary grades, what they call the first foundational cycle.” It is these realities that motivate them to establish collaborative practices with their colleagues to help improve the teaching and learning that occur in their respective schools.

**Capacity Building**

Due to the fact that the educators work in dual roles, they are able to counsel and support colleagues. For example, in addition to teaching in two schools, Joel is director of a third school. Joel clarified how he supports his teachers,

> I want to always improve or ameliorate their instructional practices. I like to have them participate in more seminars. The seminars provide a lot of content and material that improves how they teach and gives them more technique to teach. They really need that.

Similarly, in addition to teaching, Stevie works as a director of pedagogy. He explained that he tries to counsel and provide guidance for his teachers who had not attended a vocational school or university. Stevie stated that some of the teachers heeded his counsel; others do not because of financial constraints. The educators explained that they try to find various resources for their teachers. Rich has the university that he attended in Port-au-Prince do presentations for his teachers so they can learn about the programs they offer. However, the teachers would have to travel to Port-au-Prince for these programs. Rich related,

> Last week there were two teachers that requested additional seminars than what we offered. The director and I reflected on this, however the government in our town has no valid structure to send them for additional training. I wouldn’t say that nothing like this
exists in the country, because the university I studied in Port-au-Prince had valid structures. However, our town would benefit from a university that had educational science and provide additional seminars…. The teachers also suggested that they would do distance learning, we offer them Internet access at the school, but the teachers do not have Internet 100% of the time.

As already discussed, the teachers in Rich’s school have either licenses to teach or diplomas. Bobbie has a more common experience in his school. Bobbie explained that the teachers in his school “have had no training and no courses.” He said he would like to help them improve their instruction by giving them time to do seminars and, conducting demonstrations for them, as well as allotting time for them to visit other schools. Similarly, Bay explained that in collaboration with a pastor of a local church he sent two of his teachers on two separate occasions to participate in a seminar that was happening in a Baptist church in Fermat. Bay explained,

There were two teachers who went to that, they retransmitted it with the other teachers in a day of pedagogy. We did this twice. We made sure these teachers are able to work to retransmit their new knowledge with their colleagues. We ask the teacher to do something to show they are making an effort.

Retransmitting information was one way that Bay worked to reinforce the capacity of his teaching staff. Bay seeks out seminars to which he sends his teachers and indicated that he uses his own funds to allow them access. He explained that he conducts training for his teachers. Bay provided an example of a time when he provided pedagogy training for the teachers in his school. He prefers to utilize a participatory teaching method and he teaches the teachers to use the student’s background knowledge. Bay stated,
The students didn’t come empty and they are not an empty vessel. They should start with what the students know, asking questions about what you're going to teach. For example, there are different types of trees and you could ask the student, “Do you know any trees that produce fruits?” and the student can say, “Yes, mango and coconut,” and you could then take that to teach the formal term of the fruit tree. And so, building on this student’s knowledge will help them learn these things for life. This way the student will help you do the course and then they are actually learning this for life, instead of you giving them a list and then you giving them things to memorize and they won't hold it.

Bay explained that when he is doing observations of teachers he is looking for this approach because this is what he taught them to use. Bay utilizes the knowledge that he gained from seminars and his roles as director of school to provide training for his teachers. Bay explained that he closes school for a day and utilizes those school days to teach teachers about various approaches that support student learning.

Returning to the Researcher Reflexivity Journal

In conclusion, many of the teachers explained that their experiences are exceptions in their region. Many of the teachers they work with have not graduated high school and even less have attended university or a vocational school. They shared the belief that in order to improve the country’s school system they need teachers who have gone through formal training. Many of the educators developed a sense of collaboration that started in high school and they all shared an understanding that they needed to collaborate with colleagues. Many of the teachers believed they needed to help to reinforce their colleagues teaching capacities for the greater good.

I was moved by their desire to help one another learn. Many of the teachers shared a joke that they all drink the cola in collaboration. Additionally, they shared a conviction to help each
other. Though they do not have much, they shared everything with each other. It was pleasant to hear how after each seminar they hosted trainings for others to disseminate the information they gathered. Haiti is a place that the people will give you the shirt off their backs and share their last meal with strangers. My bias is clear -- We are a giving and altruistic people.

**A 4-Year-Old Hurt My Feelings**

In Haiti, the term *blan* can describe the color white, a white person, or a foreigner. I have always perceived myself as a Haitian living in America. However, upon conducting a seminar in Haitian Creole and then conducting this study in Haitian Creole, I heard my accent for the first time and was referred to as a *blan*, a diaspora Haitian. These references were made as lighthearted jokes, however, they were eye-opening. The people I identified with perceived me as an outsider, not only to the town but the culture. As painful as that was, the most stunning moment for me occurred as I walked down the street and a little girl pointed at me and said, *Look at the blan!*" I was shocked that I could look like an outsider. She couldn’t have been more than 4 years old, yet she immediately recognized there was something different about me. This experience made me hyperaware of my interactions, my voice and how I appear to them. Although, I was Haitian born, however my experience growing up and being educated in the U.S. provided a different experience that was immediately recognized by the locals and the teachers participating in my study. In stating this, the lens through which I presented the data and conducted the analysis in this chapter cautious and maintained both the authenticity of the participants and that of the Haitian-American female researcher making sense of the participants’ sense making.
Terminology

Initial In-service Teacher Training

It is imperative to distinguish between Haitian teachers’ levels of experiences of teachers in Haiti. In this chapter, I coined the term “Initial In-service Teacher Training” (IITT) referring to the process that teachers experience in vocational teacher education schools or in universities. In the Haitian context, preliminary training while the teacher is already on the job, in contrast to U.S. models of teacher training in which teachers must complete prerequisite courses before begin teaching. It is important to make this distinction because this is an alternative model to teacher development and lends to the teachers experience.

Some of the teachers commenced an IITT program while teaching, while others utilized teaching to help fund their studies of other topics at university. Rich explained, “I entered a university that prepares people to get a license in educational science or you can get a diploma in school administration.” Similarly, Bobbie stated, “I grew to love teaching so I studied this at the same time. I got a diploma because I developed a love for education…I wanted to perform better… I thought it was important to learn more about the profession”. Likewise, Rich stated, “I chose to get a license in educational science, I spent three years studying.” Upon completion of the IITT process, the teachers obtain a license if they choose to complete four years of course work or a diploma after three years of course work.

The teachers explained that government regulations require anyone teaching to have a teaching license. Unfortunately, there are few measures of accountability to support this government mandate. Stevie related that the Ministry of Education conducted a census throughout the country in September 2014 through which all teachers were registered. They provided all unlicensed teachers provisional status and gave them two years to obtain their
permanent teaching licenses. The new policy mandates teachers to participate in formal training programs, however there remain no accountability measures to support this policy.

**Continued Professional Development**

Continued professional development (CPD) is what the teachers call seminars they attend in addition to their course work in IITT or in lieu of formal courses. The term seminar is used in reference to CPD. The teachers explained that domestic and foreign non-governmental organizations; private individuals and organizations; and the Ministry of Education administer the seminars in which they have participated. Teachers who attended vocational teacher education schools or university administer some of the private seminars and charge fees for attendance. The Ministry of Education hosts a few seminars each year for educators teaching in public schools. Unfortunately, spaces are limited for those trainings and they operate on a first-come- first-served basis. The teachers shared that there are a number of NGOs in the region that host seminars they have attended, some of which also charge fees. Seminars are held during summer break and other vacation weeks throughout the year.

The teachers explained that they choose to participate in IITT and/or seminars while teaching to improve their instructional practices and develop content knowledge. There is no measure of accountability requiring teachers to participate in any form of training or professional development and completing seminars does not lead to any certification or contribute to formal qualifications.

**Conclusion**

Though the teachers acknowledge that their teaching has improved from participating in seminars they shared similar critiques of the seminars as discussed in the themes section. Bobbie explained, “Well, the seminars, the people who are doing the seminar lack lots of tools and
resources. “Jan yo pran la, se konsa yo ba ou’l,” “They teach how they learned.” The teachers explain that at times, however, there are individuals and schools that have more resources and are more progressive in the way they conduct the seminars. They may have access to technology, or expose the teachers to other methods of instruction.

The key take-away from this chapter is that the teachers perceived professional development on three levels: for personal growth, as a way to improve their own teaching and learning; and as a way to support their colleagues’ improvement. In the final chapter I have conducted an analysis of that data utilizing CRT and adult learning theory to frame the discussion. In addition, the implications for this study, limitations and suggestions for futures studies will be discussed.
Chapter 5: Analysis, Implications and Recommendations

Professional development research has been the focus of research studies for decades (Penuel, et al., 2007); while some of these are about teacher’s beliefs, most have emphasized the implications of teacher’s choices of professional development options (Morewood & Bean, 2009). There is an absence of research on teachers’ perception of professional development and the impact it may have on student learning (Morewood & Bean, 2009). In addition, there is an absence of research on teacher development in Haiti. This study’s focus on Haitian teachers’ perspectives and experiences offers a new perspective to the existing literature, theory, and practice. Existing literature on education in Haiti is in its infancy, often focusing on the language dichotomy and implications of educational reform efforts (Allerdyce, 2011; Dejean, 2010; Doucet, 2012; Hebblethwaite, 2012; Prou, 2009; Salmi, 2000) and concerning the country's low literacy levels (Cohen 1995; Salmi, 2000). In this study, I asked teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti to reflect on their perceptions of becoming educators and the professional development process. Though this is a new topic in the context of Haiti, it can be compared to existing literature that explore teacher experience and perceptions of professional development in other countries, including the U.S., other developed nations, and developing countries with similar socioeconomics as Haiti.

This study aimed to examine, how teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development. The themes that emerged elucidated that the teachers perceived it as: (a) an opportunity for self-improvement, (b) an avenue for improving students' learning through content knowledge and instructional practice and (c) an approach to contributing to colleagues’ development. The teachers’ reflective experiences create a description that contributes to a larger narrative on teacher development, particularly in
developing nations. In addition, the findings inform educational practice in Haiti, focusing on what teachers experience and how teacher development can be improved at the local and national level. This chapter provides an analysis of the data, focusing on contributions of the study to the existing literature and explaining the findings within the constructs of Critical Race Theory and Knowles (1972) theory of andragogy. The implications, limitations of the study, and suggestions for future research are discussed.

**Contributions to Research**

**An Opportunity for Self-Improvement**

From the first theme that emerged in this study, it can be posited that teaching is a lifelong learning journey for the teachers that commenced with high school. The finding indicates that the teachers perceived teaching and professional development as an opportunity for self-improvement. This means they are self-motivated and driven to succeed as educators based on extrinsic and intrinsic factors. This lends support to the literature on teacher motivation (Sinclair, 2008; Bullough & Hall-Kenyon, 2011) and provides an understanding of what motivates teachers in a Haitian context. Although extrinsic factors may have driven them into teaching, there are intrinsic motivators that keep them teaching; they have found teaching to be a favorable career choice and they have grown to love their work with their students. These intrinsic motivators influence their desire to participate in Initial In-service Teacher Training and in seminars. While teaching was initially a career of convenience, the participants perceived it as an opportunity for self-improvement.

**External Teacher Motivation**

Hargreaves & Shirley (2012) indicated that teaching is a lifelong profession, which requires rigorous training, not a short-term engagement. To support their learning needs, teachers
must be dedicated to inquiry, an ongoing learning journey (Hargreaves & Fullan, 1992). This journey takes an inquisitive teacher along untrammelled and unpredictable paths (Syed, 2008, p. 1). The teachers in this study have gone through challenges to improve their financial conditions, complete university training, and improve as educators. Joel explained a challenge,

> Normally in Haiti, when you go to school and when you finish your studies, your parents aren’t always able to pay for you to continue your studies and pay university for you. Even when the student was the best in their classes, to continue their studies in the university, you have to teach to earn.

I was unable to find existing research linking teaching and the notion of improving financial conditions. The financial hardships and obstacles presented as external motivators that propelled the teachers into careers in education. However, there is a growing body of literature linking educational development, professional development, and teacher motivations (Van Duzor, 2011; Sinclair, 2008).

Existing literature on teacher motivation emphasizes that teachers are intrinsically and altruistically multi-motivated to become teachers and to improve their instructional practices (Sinclair, 2008). In a study conducted by Bullough & Hall-Kenyon (2011) the teachers perceived their craft as a calling and identified completely with their work. The teachers in that study were motivated and therefore “invested in their own learning and growth and became increasingly effective in the classroom” (p. 135). Although the teachers in the Haiti study did not have initial training, they all were motivated toward self-improvement and they have pursued long-term, self-motivated training experiences. While there are extrinsic factors that inspired the participants in the Haiti study to become teachers, including financial need and the lack of other career options, they have grown and remained dedicated to teaching because of internal
motivators.

**Context**

It is important to clarify that this study initially intended to capture the teachers’ experience and perceptions of their in-service professional development involvements. In the traditional, American context professional development is a process that teachers participate in while teaching and it is assumed that teachers have completed their initial teacher development training or attained a bachelor's degree in an accredited college or university. As discussed in Chapter 2, the standard teacher development process follows a linear format: initial acceptance into teacher preparation programs, academic training, an internship or practicum, graduation, certification through an assessment process, in-service professional development and advanced certifications (Evans, 2002).

The data in this study revealed that in a Haitian context the process is different. As discussed in Chapter 4, some of the teachers experienced initial teacher development training simultaneously to teaching. In addition, some of the teachers discussed their high school experiences as integral parts of their academic development process. One of the teachers had not completed education beyond high school, while other teachers experienced seminars for teacher development, offered somewhere other than university because their university training focused on other subjects. The teachers shared an evolutionary educational experience, meaning they learned as they went along. This is why the finding discussed in the previous chapter spans the teachers’ educational experience, commencing with high school, expanding with IITT, and continuing to progress through seminars.

All of the teachers discussed the importance of completing high school and began teaching to have the financial means to complete university training. It is important to first
understand the larger context of Haitian society to grasp why the teachers emphasized the completion of high school. Some of the teachers explained that because of financial constraints and a lack of access to quality schools, some people in their region could not pass the national final exams and complete high school. To place this point in a larger context, only 65% of the Haitian population of approximately 10.1 million is literate (Brown & Brown-Murray, 2010). This indicates that approximately 35% of the population either has not attended or has had minimal access to quality primary education. Though they had obstacles to overcome, study participants grew to love teaching and continued to pursue schooling and seminars that improved their content and instructional practice.

**Teaching is a Favorable Choice**

It is conventionally understood in many countries, including the U.S., teaching is perceived as a poorly paid and un-respected career path. Though teaching does not pay well in Haiti, teachers are revered as leaders in the community. A study conducted by Lam (2012) found that educators saw teaching as a safe haven and they found internal satisfaction in teaching. Much like this Haiti study, the respondents in Lam’s (2012) study found teaching a favorable choice and a secure career option. The teachers in the Haiti study explained that their teaching schedules allows time to teach in multiple schools or to pursue dual careers to earn sufficient money to pay for their university training and support their lifestyles. Though they grew to love teaching, these were the initial extrinsic motivators that drove them into this career path. As mentioned in Chapter 4, the teachers reported that students who reside in regions like this rural area have very few career options once they finish high school. If their families own land, they can become subsistent farmers and merchants. Others drive taxis or motorcycles or become teachers. When compared to other occupations available in the region, teaching was the most
promising and favorable. This was similar to the participants in Lam’s (2012) study where the participants also shared their frustrations of the lack of opportunities available to them.

The teachers in this study grew to love teaching and were driven by intrinsic motivations that propelled their desire to commit to teaching, obtain their teaching license, earn a diploma or participate in seminars. As expressed in Chapter 4, Bobbie explained, “I grew to love teaching so I studied at the same time. I got a diploma because I developed a love for education.” Likewise, Quinn found that he grew to love teaching, not what he was expecting when he began teaching. In addition to being motivated to participate in seminars and IITT for their personal growth, the teachers wanted to improve as educators for altruistic reasons, to improve student learning. Similarly, the participants in Lam’s (2012) study expressed their love for teaching and found internal satisfaction in their craft.

An Avenue for Improving Students Learning

The teachers explained that they grew to love teaching and love the relationships they develop with students. Additionally, the teachers understand that they have a larger societal impact as educators. They are inspired by this love and understanding of the importance of their work to participate in seminars and IITT. This finding suggests that the teachers desire to improve their own instructional practices for the purpose of improving student learning. It means the teachers are aware of what they need to learn and aspire to increase their own learning to apply their new knowledge in the classroom for the purpose of their students’ academic success. This study adds to literature that focuses on teacher motivation (Sinclair, 2008; Bullough & Hall-Kenyon, 2011; Van Duzor, 2011) and teacher as learner (Borko, 2004; Darling-Hammond, 1998; Kayler, 2009; Petrie & McGee, 2012). The teachers reflected on their learning in IITT or in seminars and how those experiences affected their instructional practices.
Intrinsic Teacher Motivators

Quinn explained, “I do everything I can do to be useful and develop the community in terms of the education. The goal of my work is with the children; it is how I will improve not only instruction but education.” Similarly, Joel stated, “I feel that the process of forming a child is transforming my country and it's transforming the tomorrow of my country.” It can be inferred that the teachers in this study are motivated by their love of their students, their roles as educators and their belief that they have a greater impact as educators and in society. In a study, Sinclair (2008) found that the intrinsic motivator that propels teachers to teach is that they “expressed a love for children or working with children…” (p. 88). Incidentally, it is the same motivator that drives the educators in this study to improve their craft. These studies reveal that teachers share a desire to provide service for others and produce a larger societal impact through their instruction. The teachers were inspired to improve their instruction by participating in IITT and in seminars.

In this study, the teachers utilized their own financial resources to attend IITT or to participate in seminars through which they could improve the quality of their instruction. It can be assumed that they held themselves accountable to search for resources to address their students’ and their own learning needs. Similarly, Syed (2008) found that teachers draw upon specified knowledge to perform their duties, finding, “In the performance of their duties, they hold themselves accountable to the highest possible standard-addressing their students' and their own evolving learning and teaching needs” (p. 2). A few of the teachers in this study reflected on how their instructional practice failed in their first years of teaching because they had not attended an initial training program or any seminars. Stevie explained that, “For the first year I had some content, terms, concepts that I used to teach, but they were all theoretical, they stayed
in the air.” The teachers came to the realization that they required specific content knowledge and pedagogical skills to perform the duties. The teachers saw the importance of continued learning and took the initiative to improve. In agreement with this finding, Van Duzor (2011) suggested that teachers have a desire to facilitate and improve content learning for their students. This motivates them to apply what they learn in professional development to their classrooms. Similarly, in this study the teachers looked for perceived learning needs of their students, they sought learning opportunities, and incorporated and transferred their new knowledge in the classroom. Overall, the intrinsic motivators that propel the teachers in this study to attend IITT or seminars include their love for their students, the understanding that they have a greater impact as educators, and their desire to meet the learning needs of their students.

**Teacher as learner**

Rich reflected about the courses that he participated in that contributed to his instruction, “To be qualified to teach a content, you have to know the content, if it is social science, or mathematics, you have to have training that is focused on the content.” He further elaborates, “Once you have learned it, you don’t master it for yourself, you master it for your ability to teach it.” This can be situated in the body of literature placing teacher as learner. As indicated in Chapter 2, Borko (2004) asserted that, “from a situative perspective, teacher learning is usefully understood as a process of increasing participation in the practice of teaching, and through this participation, as a process of becoming knowledgeable about teaching” (p. 4). Bobbie searched for seminars stating, “I wanted to learn how to teach well, and therefore each time there is a seminar I spend my own money…” Bobbie elaborated that he initially had difficulties transmitting information to students. However, after participating in a few seminars, he learned new tools to ensure teaching and learning occurred fluidly. The findings in this study suggest that,
through participating in IITT and seminars the teachers improve their content knowledge and are able to develop deeper pedagogical foundations, then their instruction and perception of student learning increases.

**Student Learning**

The literature suggests that there is much to learn about the impact of teacher professional development on instruction and student learning outcomes (Borko, 2004; Doherty & Hilberg, 2010; Evans, 2002; Penuel et al., 2007). The teachers in this study reported that participating in seminars their instructional practices improved and so did student learning. Student achievement is measured by passing the national exams at the end of the school year. Bobbie explained, “I sent 14 students to the government exam and only two didn’t pass. Everyone thought I was a great professor.” Joel shared a similar experience,

> We have sent a number of children to the government exams over the past six years and the results were always good. The first time there was about 90% of my students who had good results... Last year I had 96% of my students who had good results. I sent 61 students and 55 had good results and six didn’t pass.

Bobbie and Joel indicated that their students’ successes are a result of their dedication to ensuring that they improved their instruction by participating in seminars. Rich relates information he learned from a seminar,

> When the teacher is working with a child, there are other factors involved in teaching. It is not only the teacher and student. There is the environment, the content, the methods, the student’s family, home environment, and the school’s environment.

Rich elaborated on the complexities of teaching; he has been able to transfer this knowledge to his classroom practice and to his school. Many of the teachers explained they
learned various techniques to bring lessons to life for students to learn. Additionally, the teachers discussed how participating in seminars provided them alternative methods of instruction and replaced the traditional rote methods of instruction. Similarly, as indicated in Chapter 2, researchers are exploring the “linkage between the design and conduct of professional development and subsequent improvement to both teacher practice and student achievement” (Penuel et al., 2007, p. 922). A study conducted by Morewood & Bean (2009), indicated that the teacher participants perceived professional development as a means to increase student achievement. Much like Morewood & Bean (2009), this study demonstrated that the teachers perceived that they were able to transfer knowledge gleaned from the professional development seminars to their classroom practice and experience positive student learning outcomes. These are self-reported studies, and further research is recommended to explore how the teachers apply their new knowledge and to link teacher learning to student performance measures. The teachers explained that they not only applied their new knowledge to improve student learning but they also shared their knowledge with their colleagues.

An Approach to Contributing to Colleagues’ Development

From the final theme in this study, it can be inferred that the teachers shared a profound understanding of the importance of collaboration and that they wanted to build their schools capacity by reinforcing their colleagues’ teaching abilities. The teachers perceived professional development as an approach to contributing to colleagues’ development. This means that, in this context, learning is a social enterprise and it can be concluded from the data that the groups’ interests were prioritized over the individuals. The findings link to the existing literature on professional learning communities (Garet, Porter, Desimone, Birman, & Yoon, 2001; Kayler, 2009; Morel, 2014; Musanti & Pence, 2010; Nelson, 2009). Nelson (2009) explained one of the
aspects of professional learning communities is that it “provides sustained opportunities for teachers to engage dialogically as learners and build pedagogical and disciplinary knowledge” (p. 55). Though this was not done in a formal or institutionalized format as it would be done in the U.S., many of the teachers in this study created opportunities to engage in activities that lend to ameliorating their instruction and improving student learning.

It is also important to understand that Haiti is a collectivist society; there is a pervasive orientation toward family, community, and group thinking (Kim, 2009, p. 565). This collectivism can be seen throughout the culture. *L'Union fait la Force* (*Union Makes Strength*), for example, is the motto on the Haitian Flag. In the rural parts of Haiti, the day-to-day interactions and labor are completed through what Haitians call a *Konbit*, meaning working together. This is an aspect of Haitian society that is Afro-centric and emphasizes the communal supports. In a *Konbit*, a cooperative interaction that can be observed on all levels, from working the land, to helping neighbors in need, sharing food and other provisions, rearing children communally, even mourning and celebrating as a collective. Haitians learned this from childhood and it can be observed in the teachers’ reflections about their adolescent years. Many of the teachers explained that during high school they collaborated with peers and this continued throughout their careers as teachers and school leaders. They intentionally share knowledge and support each other’s learning.

**Sharing Knowledge**

Wenger, Dinsmore & Villagómez, (2012) conducted a study, which found that teachers’ core beliefs impacted their daily actions and professional knowledge growth. An example of one of the core beliefs that the teachers shared in that study was, “We expect that we will collaborate for professional development, since all of us view teaching as important intellectual work” (p.
While this is comparable with the belief of the teachers in this study, it can be argued that they have an even more urgent and critical need to establish collaborative practices with their colleagues. Stevie illustrated the challenges of his colleagues,

Many of them are people who did not go through vocational school or university… there are people who just teach after 12th grade, there are some who didn’t even finish 11th grade, there are others who are finished sixth grade that are teaching primary grades, what they call the first foundational cycle.

It is such realities that encourage the teachers to establish collaborative practices with their colleagues to help improve the teaching and learning that occur in their respective schools. Many of the teachers explained that once they participated in a seminar, they return to the schools with the resources and recreate the seminar for their colleagues.

Bay explained that he recently sent two teachers to participate in a seminar; he had them retransmit it with the other teachers during a day he designated as a day of pedagogy. Bay stated, “We made sure these teachers are able to work to retransmit their new knowledge with their colleagues. We asked the teacher to do something to show they are making an effort.” Retransmitting information was one way that Bay worked to reinforce the capacity of his teaching staff. Bay seeks out seminars to which he can send his teachers and specified that he used his own funds at times to allow them access.

Collaborative Culture

Learning communities create a space for teachers to collaborate and learn from colleagues. In this study, some of the teachers reflected that they conduct classroom observations to provide feedback to their colleagues; recreate seminars for their colleagues; provide mentorship and counsel for each other; visit other schools to expand their repertoires; and share
resources with each other. Bobbie explained that the teachers in his school have no formal training; many had not graduated high school. He related that he helps them improve their instruction by leading seminars for them, conducting demonstrations or modeling instruction, and allotting time for them to visit other schools. The teachers in this study explained that these activities are done as a collective to support the growth of the school and the larger learning community. In a similar study conducted by Kayler (2009), the teachers self-reported they value peer expertise; they appreciated the opportunities to learn practical knowledge from colleagues; they enjoyed the opportunity to engage in critical dialogue with peers; and they grew as experts in content and theory as they co-facilitated their own sessions.

Wenzlaff, Wieseman & Che (2004) conducted a study which focused on the ways teachers engaged in a collaborative culture can learn from one another as colleagues. The findings of this study “propose that a cohort-based graduate program that is personalized and responsive to teachers' needs promotes meaningful learning and a sense of empowerment” (Wenzlaff, Wieseman & Che, 2004, p.113). Although the teachers in the current study had not participated in a graduate program, there are other parallels that can be drawn. The teachers created and existed in cohort models that began during their high school years and are intentional about maintaining learning communities in their careers.

The teachers in this study saw a need to build capacity in the school and in the larger community. This knowledge base and ways of working with each other is part of Haiti’s collectivist culture and the professional learning community practices the teachers in this study have learned from participating in IITT and seminars over the course of their careers. They utilize the knowledge gleaned to enhance the collective. Much like the Haiti study, Wenger, Dinsmore & Villagómez, (2012) explain, “community is a key term with respect to collaboration
as well” (p. 9). Similarly to this study, those teachers discussed their beliefs that their teachers and the leadership of their schools have a responsibility to their neighborhoods and town.

The overall conclusion that can be drawn from this theme in the study is that the teachers work together to share ideas, provide feedback to one another, recreate seminars for each other, and work together for the common goal of improving teaching and learning. Musanti & Pence (2010) explain the importance of collaborative learning, stating, “It is at the core of communities of practice involving co-construction of meaning and mutual relationships through a shared enterprise” (p. 74). While this study concurs with various bodies of literature, some of its findings explore new concepts. This is the first study that asked Haitian teachers in a semi-rural town to share their perspectives on their professional development. The findings reveal that the teachers in this semi-rural town in Haiti are self-motivated and driven by both extrinsic and intrinsic factors to be quality teachers and seek to improve their crafts as educators. The teachers in this study have participated in IITT and other seminars in hope of improve their teaching and their students’ learning outcomes. Finally, as members of a collectivist society, the teachers inherently aim to enhance the larger community by sharing what they learn in IITT and seminars with colleagues.

**Theory of Andragogy**

It is important to review how the findings in this study add to aspects of theory of andragogy. Knowles (1972) explained that the term andragogy is derived from the stem of the Greek word “aner” meaning man noting that though there is no clear-cut separation from children and adult learners, it is important to differentiate the assumption made in pedagogy and those of andragogy. In addition, Knowles (1972) suggested, “the assumptions of andragogy apply to youth as they mature, and that they, too, will come to be taught more and more
andragogically” (p. 34). Knowles posits that andragogical theory has five main assumptions: (a) changes in self-conception, (b) the role of experience, (c) readiness to learn (d) orientation to learning and (e) motivation to learning. Previous studies have utilized the theory of andragogy when discussing the development and administration of professional development programs for educators (Guskey, 2002; Huber, 2011) and to explore the use and usefulness of continuing professional development (Muijs & Lindsay, 2007). In this study, the theory of andragogy provides a frame for the adult learning experience. This section focuses on how this study contributes to these assumptions.

(A) Changes in self-conception.

Andragogy is concerned with “…the point in which individuals achieve a self-conception of self-direction” (Knowles, 1972, p. 34). This suggests that there is a stage in life when people move from being dependent and become self-directed learners. These learners are self-directed and internally motivated. This study supports this assumption in regard to the first theme discussed in this chapter. The teachers engage in IITT and/or seminars because they perceive these experiences as opportunities for self-improvement. Furthermore, they are self-motivated and driven to succeed based on extrinsic and intrinsic factors. The teachers revealed a change in self-conception that began as early as high school and continued throughout their professional careers. The teachers are self-motivated and take intentional steps and required actions when learning in hope of improving themselves and their instructional practices.

(B) The role of experience

The second assumption posits that as people mature they acquire and “accumulate an expanding reservoir of experience that cause them to become an increasingly rich resource for learning, and at the same time provides them with a broadening base to which to relate new
learning” (Knowles, 1972, p. 35). This suggests that the reservoir of knowledge serves as background information that can be built upon as adults engage in seminars and to further their academic pursuits. Because the teachers in this study were teaching at the same time they pursued IITT and engaged in seminars they were able to apply their experiences as teachers and their background knowledge to learn the new materials.

Jackson (2009) explained “learners find meaning in what is being taught and being able to apply the new information to examine previous experiences” (p. 21). Many of the teachers indicated that as they engaged in the course work or in seminars, they were able to connect it to and reflect about their experiences. For example, Quinn reflected on an experience he dealt with poorly when one a student’s grades and behaviors began to deteriorate. Quinn explained that while participated in a mental-health training for teachers he was able to be reflective and connect what he was learning immediately to his teaching experiences and experienced growth and transformation in how he engaged with students. He was able to tap into his reservoir of knowledge and experience and apply it to the new information.

(C) Readiness to learn.

The third assumption of andragogy is “that learners are ready to learn those things they need to because of the developmental phases they are approaching in their roles” (Knowles, 1972, p. 35) in their profession and personal contexts. This assumption posits that adults return to school or engage in seminars voluntarily based on extrinsic and intrinsic motivators centered on their current requirements of their lives. This study supports this assumption because some teachers explained that after the first years of teaching they came to the realization that their new roles required further learning. Stevie explained, “For the first year I had some content, terms, concepts that I used to teach, but they were all theoretical, they stayed in the air.” The teachers
pursued IITT and/or seminars because they were in roles that required them to learn specific content and pedagogy.

(D) Orientation to learning

This forth assumption posits that adults tend to have a problem-centered or performance orientation toward learning (Knowles, 1972), that there is an immediate need to meet the life requirements that propel the adult to learn. This study supports this assumption. Many of the teachers indicated they were not prepared to teach when they obtained their first teaching positions. Some teachers said that they engaged in IITT and/or seminars because, as they taught their first few years, they realized they needed to improve their methods. The problem of poor instructional practices motivated their desire to learn. For example, Skyler reported that he attended IITT to learn science content and learn how to teach science because that was his job. He wanted to improve his content knowledge and instruction.

(E) Motivation to Learn

As the theory of andragogy evolved, Knowles (1980) added the motivation to learn as the fifth assumption, elaborating on the notion that adult learners are internally and intrinsically motivated to learn because of life circumstances and needs. All three of the overarching themes support this assumption. The teachers were motivated to learn on multiple levels. They were motivated by a desire for self-improvement, both personally and professionally; they were motivated by the desire to ameliorate their instruction in hopes of improving students learning; and they are motivated by their desire to contributing to colleagues’ development. More specifically, the teachers were driven to learn to address and solve problems in their personal lives, their professional lives, their students learning, help their colleagues, and overall improve their collective experience.
These assumptions have major implications for curriculum and professional development of adult learners and, in our case, teachers. Theorist suggests adult learning should be a process of mutual and self-directed inquiry (Zmeyov, 1998). The role of the facilitator is to help the learning take place, not to be a transmitter of knowledge (Schuster, 1987). The application of the Knowles (1972) theory of andragogy allows the adult to be a full participant in the quest for a new knowledge through reoccurring cycles of investigation, activity and reflection (Schuster, 1987).

**Collectivist learning.** Theory of andragogy is an individualistic approach (Amstutz, 1999) and does not directly consider collectivist perspectives. This study revealed layers in the teachers’ experiences that the theory fails to address. It does not directly consider the notion that learning in a real context is a social activity influenced by the setting and context of the person and situation (Amstutz, 1999). As previously discussed, Haiti is a collectivist society and the data revealed a major component motivating the teachers to learn was the desire to improve themselves for the enhancement of the collective. They emphasized that they participated in IITT and/or seminars to improve student outcomes and/or to support the development of colleagues. Amstutz (1999) explained it is important to recognize the centrality of the cultural context that the learning takes place (p. 25). This study expands the theory of andragogy by proposing a spectrum that should be used to frame adult learning that is inclusive of cultural factors. Another cultural factor that must be explored is the colonial legacies that are embedded within the fabric of Haitian society, which will be discussed further in the following section.

**Exposing Colonial Legacies through Critical Race Theory**

It is important to explore stories and frameworks that provide new insights and broaden understanding of a phenomenon. This study contributes to the assumptions of Critical Race
Theory (CRT), expanding its use on a global, pan-African scale.

As stated in Chapter 1, CRT is appropriate for the study because it brings to light the silencing, exclusion, and marginalizing of people of the African diaspora that occurs throughout history. It should be noted that the Haitian national identity is majority Black and are part of the African Diaspora. The five tenets of CRT are (a) counter narratives, (b) the permanence of racism, (c) whiteness as property, (d) interest convergence, and (e) critique of liberalism. The first two tenets, counter narratives and the permanence of racism, are both applied as the theoretical and analytical frameworks for this study. The teachers reflected on their perceptions of their experiences in becoming and being educators. I utilized their reflected experiences and the researcher reflexivity journal to explore how the colonial legacies are embedded in fabrics of Haiti’s culture. The application of CRT reveals and exposes implicit and explicit racism and how it has impacted the experiences of the teachers holistically.

My goal in this section is to expand CRT’s umbrella and apply it in a pan-African global context to address colonial legacies in a Haitian context, by exposing the transformations of racism. Gillborn (2006) supports the notion that CRT tenets should be expanded to research beyond North America. Through the counter narratives, this study contests and resists the popular mainstream stereotypes of Haiti and offers a narrative that has been excluded and silenced in history. These colonial legacies limit the experiences of teachers and contribute to the perpetual marginalization of people of the African diaspora. Furthermore, counter narratives serves as a framework for analysis of teachers' narratives and experiences.

We Are a Proud People: Counter Narratives

Haiti and the Haitian people have been depicted by negative images in textbooks (Wigginton, 2005) and in popular mainstream media (Creamer, 2011) for decades. Creamer
(2011) illustrates the root of one of these images,

On August 14, 1791, the slaves of French Saint-Domingue rose up and defeated the three world powers of the era, the French, the British, and the Spanish empires. They declared their independence as a Black nation in 1804, becoming the first nation in the Western Hemisphere to gain its independence without the aid of a major colonial power. The Haitian Revolution permanently eradicated the ‘docility stereotype.’ In the Southern United States, it also inspired fear among slave owners resulting in severe anti-Black repression justified with the new stereotype that portrayed Blacks as ‘innately violent. (p. 5)

This shared stereotype for Blacks across nations has marred Haiti. It has maintained the popular narrative of Haiti as violent, corrupt and dysfunctional. These are just a few labels that arose after the Haitian Revolution has remained stagnant in popular media over the decades. The most recent stereotypes dominating popular discourse is that Haiti and the Haitian people are poverty stricken, backward, and illiterate.

This study provides an alternative narrative from the perspective of Haitian educators that counters these stereotypes. For example, Bobbie reported, “I teach my students about their identity, their origins, how they came here, their hero’s, Haiti’s independence, how they got their freedom.” Bobbie explains the significance of his students knowing their histories, stating, “It is important at early ages that Black children learn to be proud of their color and their contributions and importance in the world to give them a sense of pride and value.” The teachers sought out seminars such as the HLP to learn and create a counter narrative for their students. I have found there is emphasis on the teacher’s identity, and the development of their awareness of self as educators and a pride in knowing their history as Black people in the world. During the seminar
the teachers emphasized the importance during the seminar of not only learning their own history, but also being able to teach it to their students and their colleagues for collective growth.

The teachers also discussed the importance of developing themselves, their students, and their colleagues. It is important to note that it was clear throughout the interviews that the teachers are cognitive of themselves and their roles as educators. The emphasis placed on improving the self for the greater good revealed how aspects of their identity and self-perception contradicts and counters the negative mainstream depictions of Haitians in popular media. As early as high school, the teachers developed positive self-images as people who are capable of learning and impacting the growth and development of others. Quinn explained that he has “an aptitude to learn, and an ability to teach what I learned.” All of the participants reflected about themselves as learners both as students and as teachers. However, they prided themselves on not learning for the sake of learning, but rather to improve their students learning. Rich explained, “Once you’ve learned it, you don’t master it for yourself, you master it for your ability to teach it.” The teachers were not only proud of their own growth and accomplishments as teachers, but also found pride in their students’ learning and accomplishments. They all shared their joy when their students passed the national exams or enter university. These successes are reflections of who they are as educators. Quinn elaborates, “I do everything I can do to be useful and develop the community in terms of education. The goal of my work is with the children; it is how I will improve not only instruction but education.” They have a profound understanding of their identity as educators who contribute to the larger society.

Rich explained that he has a desire to develop his country and understands that the base of a country’s development is education. Rich took ownership and responsibility in his role and identity as an educator contributing to his students, colleagues and the larger community and
takes pride in the work he has done with the teachers in his school. Rich explained that his school hosts seminars for their teachers. They discuss topics such as pedagogy, learning environment and different learning styles. Rich elaborated,

The teachers become aware and have discussions. They are not alone working on weakness and competence. When we discuss weaknesses, we work on improvement and they share their strengths. In addition, we have the teachers understand in the education field we have to always continue growing.

All of the teachers discussed the importance of contributing to their colleagues to build capacity in their schools and larger community. They joked, “we drank the cola-collaboration”, however this notion of working communally for the greater good is an embedded part of their collective identity. They found pride in building and growing together.

My experience while conducting this study differed from stereotypes previously discussed. I felt safe and welcomed throughout my stay and I was moved by the teachers’ openness and willingness to share. At the end of each interview, the teachers all requested that I return with my colleagues to conduct more seminars. Moreover, the teachers’ leadership and selfless desire to support the development of their students and others was impressive. These educators empowered themselves to seek out seminars and courses in effort to improve their students’ learning and to conduct trainings for their colleagues. The findings in this study suggest that a different narrative exists for the Haitian people in Haiti.

Exclusion of Histories

The teachers in this study participated in a Haitian history professional development seminar that I facilitated, the Haiti Legacy Project (HLP). It became apparent during this workshop that many of the teachers were not history teachers, nor were they social science
teachers. The teachers explained that they chose to participate in this seminar because they wanted to learn their history and intended to share the resources with their colleagues in their schools.

Another teacher explained the French wrote the history books he used when he was a student. He wanted to have access to other perspectives on his history. Trouillot (2012) suggests that even Haitian historians play by the rules of the Western guild (p. 66). The histories written in history books often exclude and silence African histories and leverage Eurocentric histories. The teachers discussed the importance of learning their history, sharing with colleagues, and teaching their students. Bobbie stated that it is important that Black children learn at an early age to be proud of their color and their contributions and importance in the world to give them a sense of pride and value.

Though many of the teachers did not speak directly of race and racism, it can be inferred from their interest in HLP there is an awareness that should be explored in future research. It is important to reiterate that the teachers in this study identify with being Black. Although, the majority of the Haitian population is Black, the legacies of colonization, have created internalized racism that permeates the culture and creates a marginalized class.

**Permanence of Racism**

As explained in Chapter 1, the tenet permanence of racism argues that racism is an embedded part of our society (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001, p. 7), enmeshed in the fabric of our social order. A goal of CRT, therefore, is to reveal and expose that racism (Ladson-Billing, 1999, p. 231). In the Haitian context, the permanence of racism in Haiti can be traced to the country’s colonial roots, its foundations, the development of Haitian society, and, in the modern times, through colorism.
Colorism

In addition to the exclusion of histories, the legacy of colonization is the entrenched and ubiquitous colorism that permeates Haitian society, revealing the permanence of racism in Haitian society. Haiti is a majority Black society. As explained in Chapter 1, colorism is “the allocation of privilege and disadvantage according to the lightness or darkness of one’s skin” (Burton, Bonilla-Silva, Ray, Buckelew & Hordge, 2010, p. 440). Fanon (1986) elaborates,

If western civilization and culture are responsible for colonial racism, and Europe itself has a racist structure, then we should not be too surprised to find this racism reflected in the discourses of knowledge that emanate from this civilization and that they work to ensure that structural dominance is maintained. The seeds of inferiority of the non-West are already laid in the first chapter of history that the others have compiled … (xv)

One of the seeds of colonization in Haiti is the pervasiveness of Colorism. A consequence of colonization is an embedded desire to mimic the colonizer; in the case of Haiti today that is Western culture. Fanon (1986) illustrates how colonization is lived day-to-day and entrenched in culture,

The wearing of European clothes, whether rags or the most up-to-date style; using European furniture and European forms of social intercourse; adorning the Native language with European expressions; using bombastic phrases in speaking or writing a European language; all these contribute to a feeling of equality with the European and his achievements. (p.15)

It is important to note that the teachers in this study did not discuss this notion of colorism; this framing is done using the researcher reflexivity journal entries based on the interviews. I maintained a journal in which I captured observations and thoughts that lent context
to how I, the researcher, made sense of the teachers’ experiences. All of the teachers are Black men, living in a semi-rural town, and from lower socio-economic backgrounds. Many of the teachers described the need to travel to Port-au-Prince, a 50-minute drive, to have access to university or participate in most seminars. This creates a geographic limitation that hinders access to seminar opportunities. The teachers also described financial constraints that kept them from attending a university and discussed the limited access they had to career options.

Their experiences revealed a polarization of the elite class from the masses, resulting in the existence of a dual society with stark divisions in social, linguistic, political, educational, economical and geographic sectors. As discussed in Chapter 2, the Haitian elite maintains the status quo, by “perpetuating the colonially instilled beliefs of inherent superiority of their own group and consequently in the inherent inferiority of the other” (Doucet, 2012, p. 134). Doucet (2012) explains that the elite maintains the status quo because allowing true access would represent a massive threat to the very foundation upon which the elite have built and maintained their social position. The struggles that the teachers shared reveal how colorism indicators impacts and can deter access to education, school, employment, and other societal advantages. The permanence of racism in Haiti permeates these colonial legacies and remains stagnant and apparent in daily interactions and activities. This study revealed the experiences of nine teachers who dealt with financial hardships, geographic, educational and social obstacles. Their struggles are heightened because they do not belong to the lighter-skinned tone Haitian elite class, the holders of power and wealth.

In summation, Delgado and Stefancic (2001) explain that the unique voices of color all have different histories and experiences with oppression. Through the interviews and researcher reflexivity journal, I identified colonial legacies that impede the marginalized teachers in this
semi-rural town from full access to educational opportunities and economic growth. As discussed in the themes section of this chapter, the fact that the teachers did not have access to higher education because of financial constraints; that they had to travel to the closest urban center to attend the university; and that they did not have promising career choices are factors that contribute to marginalization occurring in this context. Furthermore, this study creates space for counter narratives, which allowed the voices of teachers in a semi-rural town of Haiti to be captured and their experiences to be narrated. These experiences will contribute to improving teacher development practices on a local, national and global level.

**Contributions to Practice and Practical Implications**

The teachers in this study faced particular challenges similar to many peoples’ experiences as they become teachers and develop as educators. The teachers shared stories, for example, that revealed financial constraints and a lack of immediate access to higher education and seminars. It is important to consider other teachers who share similar socio-economic and geographic constraints. The following are ways this study can inform and impact practice at a local and national level.

**Implication for Practice**

Providers of seminars must take into account the semi-rural context and the complex factors that impact teachers and impede their access to IITT. In addition, they must provide seminars that offer a full spectrum of information for teachers who have not completed high school. The seminars should also ensure that a program is a good fit for the teachers, their schools, and a semi-rural community. This can be achieved by first surveying the teachers, because they know what they would like to learn. Many of the teachers suggested that I return with my colleagues to provide history seminars, to improve both their content knowledge and to
teach different pedagogical techniques to teach history. Additionally, the seminar providers must take into consideration the complexity of teachers’ experiences. The providers should be prepared to address and meet the needs of the spectrum of teachers, including teachers who have completed IITT and teachers who have not completed high school. This spectrum must be taken into consideration when preparing seminars for educators.

NGOs.

Many seminar providers are non-governmental organizations (NGOs). It is strongly suggested they work in collaboration with local government, universities, and the vocational schools to create and maintain a streamlined way to provide teachers with initial and ongoing development. The perpetual poverty of the majority of the Haitian population benefits NGOs that work in various capacities in the country, with no government oversight. Although a few NGOs claim that education development is their priority, their efforts to develop teachers and establish sustainability in the country has been minimal. As stated in Chapter 1, NGOs receive more funding from donors than the Haitian government (Doucet, 2012). This study brings to light, the lack of sustainable organizations in this region focused on teacher development. NGOs that intend to provide professional development services in Haiti must move away from paternalistic Western practices in to build real capacity in the country. This can be done on many levels by embracing the culture’s collectivist cultural practices and establishing partnerships with educators and school leaders. The teachers revealed their desire to learn for self-improvement, for student learning, and for collegial development. The data from this study suggests that NGOs can develop sustainable models by working to develop the local teacher leaders to ultimately lead and run the NGOs regionally. These teachers have the ability and desire to work with their colleagues and improve instructional practices throughout the region. This study informs the
practice of NGO’s by providing a context of the teacher experience and needs in order to inform their actions.

Although HLP is not an NGO, it has the potential of falling into similar dependency models. There are two levels of HLP. The organization’s online website provides educators access to a plethora of resources that can enhance their own learning. HLP seminars are open and offered to a group of local teacher leaders. These teacher leaders receive training and access to online Haitian history resources and curriculum with which they can train the educators in their respective schools. This teacher development model is one of many that can be instituted to contribute to capacity building.

Additionally, the Ministry of Education can support the local government and teacher vocational schools to create educational access for teachers in rural regions. School leaders and administrators can be taught to understand teacher needs and the importance of providing access for teachers to participate in ongoing seminars. One model is developing teacher leaders as groups of individuals who can lead their colleagues at a regional level or by creating school-based teacher-learning models. Another can be to establish mentorship models. Mentoring occurs organically, however, institutionalizing this model would also benefit teacher instruction. The study reveals that the teachers are already working together organically, however, more formalized and structured collaboration would contribute to the improvement of instructional practices on a larger scale.

The local branch of the Ministry of Education can be empowered to support the school leaders and their teachers by providing access to seminars locally and frequently. The local government can play a central role in institutionalizing teacher development programing in rural regions by bringing guest professors, lecturers, and other experts to the regions. Finally, more
teacher vocational schools can be established in rural regions to develop the local population of teachers. These schools can work in collaboration with the local government and other agencies that provide teacher seminars and coursework.

**Implication for Policy**

Educational reform is necessary and should support and streamline the teacher development pipeline. As discussed in chapter 2, Wang et al., (2003) suggest a seven-step policy model of teacher supply that policy makers and practitioners should take into account: (a) policies effecting entrance into teacher education, (b) policies affecting teacher education curriculum, (c) policies affecting completion of teacher education, (d) policies entry level certification, (e) policies affecting hiring, tenure and compensation, (f) policies affecting professional development, and (g) policies affecting advanced certification (p. 14). In the case of Haiti, the majority of the current teaching force has not undergone formal training; therefore policies to ensure their development should take precedence. The Ministry of Education can establish policies articulating who is qualified to teach; establishing and maintain certification processes; and maintain accountability measures to ensure the teacher seminars and programs are of high quality. Unfortunately, this study concludes there are currently no existing systems of accountability to reinforce policies, nor are there financial supports in place to support individuals who demonstrate the propensity and the desire to become educators. Establishing scholarships, grants, or financial aid programs would support the development of a teaching force.

**Implications for Research.**

Educational research in Haiti is in its infancy. Researchers are encouraged to explore the various levels of the teacher development process. This study focused on the teachers’ perception
of their experiences, however it does not exhaust the possibilities of teacher experiences. For example, teachers in other regions of Haiti, female teachers, and teachers who completed a vocation program all have different experiences. This lends to the limitations of this study and suggestions for further research.

**Limitations and Recommendations for Future Research**

This self-reported study met with various limitations. While capturing the experience of nine teachers is an appropriate and ample for an IPA study, it represents a small and unique portion of the teaching population in Haiti. All of the teachers were high school graduates, which is not the norm for teachers in rural regions in Haiti. Their socio-economic background was also not diverse, as this study was conducted in a semi-rural region of Haiti where all of the teachers dealt with similar financial constraints. Therefore, the findings of this study cannot be generalized to the entire country. Capturing the experiences of teachers in a city or a more affluent region of the country, or delving deeper into a rural region, may contribute other experiences for future studies and get us closer to generalizability.

Though measures were taken to ensure gender diversity, all of the teachers in this study were male. This is due to social factors in Haitian society. The recruitment occurred at the HLP seminar, which was scheduled on a Saturday. The teachers explained that it was Saturday market day, and the women were either selling merchandise or produce, or they were purchasing products for their families. The teachers also explained that the majority of secondary school teachers are male; a higher percentage of female teachers can be found in primary schools. Because of these gender roles and family obligations, the participant pool was all male; creating an unintended self-selection that demonstrates the male experience. Further research is needed in order to capture female teachers’ experience.
The teachers were all high school graduates and many had completed or were in the process of completing their university training. Research to understand the experience of teachers who had not completed high school would have been more indicative of the rural teachers’ experience. Capturing the experiences of teachers who completed a vocational training would also further the dialog.

It would also be beneficial to understand the teacher experiences through classroom observations and capturing how they apply their knowledge. Although more research is needed to understand the complex experience of educators in Haiti, the findings in this study provide a foundation for further research on teacher experiences, the application of teacher learning, and the implication on student learning. This study captured the teacher experiences and cannot speak to actual student learning; the connection between student learning and teacher learning should be explored further in future research. Ultimately, assessing these studies can lead to understanding how the vocational training, university training, or seminars impact student academic outcomes.

**Conclusion**

This IPA study was designed to explore how teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development. The themes illuminated that the teachers perceived professional development as (a) an opportunity for self-improvement, (b) an avenue for improving students learning through content knowledge and instructional practice and (c) an approach to contributing to colleague’s development. It can be concluded that the teachers had both intrinsic and extrinsic motivators that propelled them to becoming teachers and, ultimately, to invest in their development as educators. Additionally, the teachers in this study revealed a desire to learn and grow as professionals to contribute to the academic successes of their students.
and their colleagues. While this study adds to various bodies of literature, its findings are new in that it captures the voices and experiences of teachers from a rural region in Haiti. Although the teachers in this study reveal self-motivated growth and desire to improve, the amount of access to these resources is minimal. Without major alterations and improvement to the current realities it is not likely that major economic or societal advancements will occur in Haiti. The implications of these findings suggest that teachers need more access to IITT and seminar opportunities in rural parts of Haiti. It is imperative that practitioners and educational leaders use research to inform policies and practices to strategically develop learning opportunities for the teaching force.

**Post Script Positionality: Scholar Practitioner**

As a scholar practitioner, I will continue to reciprocate all that Haiti and the teachers have given me by continuing my work with the HLP, by publishing, and by continuing to create spaces for their voices. This study has a larger meaning and important real life implications for the future of education in Haiti. I will return to Haiti to share my findings with the teachers, their school leaders, the community, and the policy makers. I aim to share the implications for policy with policy makers in Haiti because there is an urgency to improve the way teachers are trained throughout the entire country. Additionally, I will continue to work with HLP and the Haitian teachers to develop the Haitian history curriculum in collaboration with the Haitian teachers and conduct seminars for teachers. It is important that scholar practitioners understand that they are in the space of privilege, utilizing the language of the privilege to create social change. In this space, I am privileged to create space for the teacher voices and to work as an ally to improve the current realities of education. The only time we hear about Haiti and the Haitian people are when something negative happens. However, as this study revealed, there is much more depth to the
Haitian people. I will continue to create counter narratives and create space for these experiences.
Appendix A

Letter of Inquiry Participants

October 11, 2014

Greetings!

My name is Sarah-Jane Quessa a doctoral student at Northeastern University. As part of my research I am conducting interviews with teachers about their professional development experiences. You are invited to participate in this study because of your role as a teacher and your participation in the Haiti Legacy Project. I am working with Dr. Nicolas on the Haiti Legacy Project as the Curriculum developer for the Haiti Legacy Project.

I am interested in understanding how teachers in Arcahaie, Haiti experience and perceive professional development. Though initially I am interested in your experiences, I hope this study will lend itself to further studies about how professional development benefit teachers’ instructional practices and the professional development needs in your community. I am conducting semi-structured interviews with local teachers who are participating in the Haiti Legacy project. In order to participate in the study you must be a history teacher and have taught for at least two years and is interested in participating in the study.

If you are eligible and are interested in participating please let me know. We will sit down together and I will further explain the project, the details of the consent form and answer any questions you may have. Once you agree to participate I will ask for both a written and a verbal consent from you. Your participation in this study would include you participating in an interview with me for approximately 90 minutes.

Participation is confidential and participants may withdraw from the study at any time.

If you have any questions, they may contact me at quesssa.s@husky.neu.edu or Call -33383747 (Haiti number)

Sincerely,

Sarah-Jane Quessa
Doctoral Candidate at Northeastern University
Appendix B

Consent Form

Northeastern University, College of Professional Studies
Name of Investigators- & Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters, Sarah-Jane Quessa
Title of Project - Voices of Haitian teachers: Teacher perception of professional development in Haiti

This Informed Consent Form has two parts:
- Information Sheet
- Certificate of Consent
You will be given a copy of the full Informed Consent Form

Part I: Information Sheet
Introduction

Informed Consent to Participate in Research Study

You are being invited to participate in a research study conducted by Sarah-Jane Quessa, doctoral candidate at Northeastern University. This form will tell you about the study, but the researcher will explain it to you as well. You may ask any questions that you have. When you are ready to make a decision, you may tell the researcher if you want to participate or not. You do not have to participate if you do not want to. If you decide to participate, the researcher will ask you to sign this statement and will give you a copy to keep.

In this document you will find the purpose of this study, the procedures and benefits and risks of your participation. You can contact the principal investigator, Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters if you have any questions that may arise about this project. As we go through this information should you have questions, please stop me and I can explain further and answer any questions.

Why am I being asked to take part in this research study?

Participant Selection
You are being invited to take part of this research because you are participating in the Haiti Legacy Project; in addition you are a local history teacher and have been teaching for at least two years. Your experience as a teacher can contribute to our understanding and knowledge of the teacher development experience of teachers in this region.

Your participation in this research is entirely voluntary. Choosing to participate will not have any bearing on your job or work related evaluations.
Why is this study being done?

Purpose of the research
We know that quality instruction is a vital component in producing successful student outcomes. Continuous and relevant in-service teacher professional development is one way to work toward providing quality instruction for students. The purpose of this research is to understand how teachers in your town experience and perceive in-service professional development. We are asking you to be reflective about your experiences participating in professional development. Understanding your experiences will help to inform future planning of professional development opportunities and further research.

What will I be asked to do?

Type of Research Intervention
If you decide to take part in this study, we will ask you to sign this consent form and participate in a semi-structured (one on one) interview, which will be scheduled for 90 minutes.

Procedures
We would like you to help us learn more about your experiences participating in an in-service teacher professional development. You are being invited to participate in this research project. If you accept you will be asked to participate in a one-on-one interview. You will also be asked to share or suggest any visual artifacts that articulate your experience as a teacher in this town and your experience participating in professional development.

Once you understand and sign this form we will schedule an interview at a time that is most convenient for you. Interviews will be conducted at the Haiti Legacy Project training site and will be conducted by myself, Sarah-Jane Quessa. If you do not wish to answer a particular question during the interview I will move on to the next question. Only the interviewer will be present during the interview. You will be assigned a pseudonym and all information recorded will remain confidential, only the interviewer, Sarah-Jane Quessa will have access to the information documented during the interview. The interview will be audio-recorded. The audio file will be kept on Sarah-Jane Quessa’s password protected personal laptop and password protect cloud file as a backup. All recordings will be destroyed after the data has been transcribed and analyzed.

Where will it take place and how much of my time will it take?

Place & Duration
The research will take place over a one-week period at the Haiti Legacy Project professional development site in Arcahaie, Haiti. Once you have agreed to participate in the study and sign this consent form I will schedule a time at your earliest convenience for the interview to take place. The interview will take no more than 90-minutes. You may receive a follow-up phone call for clarification.

**Will there be any risk or discomfort to me?**

**Risks**
This study poses no ethical risks. However, you may be asked to share personal and confidential information or you may feel uncomfortable talking about some of the topics. You do not have to take part of or answer any questions that make you feel uncomfortable. You can choose to skip any questions during the interview and do not have to provide a reason for why you are refusing to answer particular questions.

**Will I benefit in being in this research?**

**Benefits**
There is no direct benefit to you for participating in this study. However, participating in this study will provide you with the opportunity to share your experience about the in-service professional development you have participated in. Furthermore, participating will help us understand your experiences and this may help inform the future professional development experiences of the larger teaching community.

**Who will see the information about me?**

**Confidentiality**
The student researcher will protect your anonymity by assigning you a pseudonym. Your part in the study will remain confidential. All information that you share through the interview will remain confidential and will only be accessible with the use of passwords by the student researcher (Sarah-Jane Quessa) and the Principal Investigator (Dr. Billye Sankofa). All data gathered will be used for the student researcher’s doctoral dissertation, and potentially future academic publications and presentations. Confidentiality will be kept for all participants in all potential publications.

**Sharing the Results**
Everything that you share will remain confidential and nothing will be attributed to your name. The information that we gathered from this research will be synthesized and analyzed and shared with you and your community before it is available to the public.
Participants will receive a copy of the initial findings through email within one month of the interview. You will have one week to provide feedback about the validity, accuracy and request modifications and alterations to the data.

**What will happen if I suffer any harm from this research?**

There is no foreseeable harm from participation in this research.

**Can I stop my participation in this study?**

**Right to Refuse or Withdraw**

Your participation in this study is completely voluntary. If you choose to volunteer for this research your job or job-related evaluations will not be affected in any way. Even if we begin the study, you may quit at anytime and your job will not be impacted. At the end of the interview you will be granted the opportunity to review your statements and you can request modifications or removal of any parts. You can also review my notes and correct or change any misunderstandings.

**Who can I contact if I have any question of problem?**

Who to Contact

If you have any questions, you can ask them now or at anytime. If you wish to ask questions later, you can contact Sarah-Jane Quessa at Quessa.s@Husky.neu.edu or Dr. Waters Sankofa at b.sankofawaters@neu.edu or Dr. Nicolas from the Haiti Legacy Project at 33383747

Who can I contact about my rights as a participant?

This proposal has been reviewed and approved by Northeastern University IRB, which is a committee whose task it is to make sure that research participants are protected from harm. If you wish to find about more about the IRB, contact Nan C. Regina, Director of Human Subject Research Protection, 960 Renaissance Park, Northeastern University, Boston, MA 02115 Tel. 617-373-4588 Email: n.regina@neu.edu. You may call anonymously if you wish.

**Will I be paid for my participation?**

**Reimbursements**

For your participation in the study you will be gifted a book from the Haiti legacy project.
curriculum. This is a token of appreciation for your time and completion interview.

**Will it cost me anything to participate?**

There are no costs for participating in this study.

You can ask me any more questions about any part of the research study, if you wish to. Do you have any questions?

**Is there anything else I need to know?**

All necessary information has been disclosed.

**Part II: Certificate of Consent**

**I agree to take part in this research**

I have read the preceding information. I have had the opportunity to ask questions about it and any questions I have asked have been answered to my satisfaction. I consent voluntarily to be a participant in this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Print Name of Participant</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature of Participant</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature of the person who explained the study to the participant above and obtained consent</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Printed name of above</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*I consent voluntarily to have the interview audio-recorded:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature of participant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C

IRB Form

For NU IRB use:

Date Received: ________________ NU IRB No. ______________
Review Category: ________________ Approval Date ______________

Application for Approval for Use of Human Participants in Research

Before completing this application, please read the Application Instructions and Policies and Procedures for Human Research Protections to understand the responsibilities for which you are accountable as an investigator in conducting research with human participants. The document, Application Instructions, provides additional assistance in preparing this submission. Incomplete applications will be returned to the investigator. You may complete this application online and save it as a Word document.

If this research is related to a grant, contract proposal or dissertation, a copy of the full grant/contract proposal/dissertation must accompany this application.

Please carefully edit and proof read before submitting the application. Applications that are not filled out completely and/or have any missing or incorrect information will be returned to the Principal Investigator.

REQUIRED TRAINING FOR RESEARCH INVOLVING HUMAN SUBJECTS

Under the direction of the Office of the Vice Provost for Research, Northeastern University is now requiring completion of the NIH Office of Extramural Research training for all human subject research, regardless of whether or not investigators have received funding to support their project.

The online course titled "Protecting Human Research Participants" can be accessed at the following url: http://phrp.nihtraining.com/users/login.php. This requirement will be effective as of November 15, 2008 for all new protocols.

Principal Investigators, student researchers and key personnel (participants who contribute substantively to the scientific development or execution of a project) must include a copy of their certificate of completion for this web-based tutorial with the protocol submission.

*************************************************************************
Certificate(s) Attached
*************************************************************************
X Certificate(s) submitted previously – on file with the NU’s Office of Human Subject Research Protection
A. Investigator Information

Principal Investigator (PI cannot be a student) Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters

Investigator is: NU Faculty X NU Staff Other

College: Choose an item. Northeastern University College of Professional Studies

Department/Program Education (EdD Doctorate Program)

Address 20 BV College of Professional Studies, Boston MA 02115

Office Phone 617-390-3852 Email b.sankofawaters@neu.edu

Is this student research? YES X NO If yes, please provide the following information:

Student Name Sarah-Jane Quessa Anticipated graduation date June 2015

Undergrad MA/MS PhD AuD X EdD DLP Other Degree Type

College: Choose an item. Northeastern University College of Professional Studies

Department/Program Education (EdD Doctorate Program)

Full Mailing Address 3600 Mystic Pointe Drive #1717 Aventura, Fl. 33180

Telephone Primary Email Quessa.s@husky.neu.edu

Cell phone 617-785-3287 Secondary Email squessa@me.com

B. Protocol Information

Title: Voices of Haitian teachers: Teacher perception of professional development in Haiti

Projected # subjects 6-10

Approx. begin date of project 9/22/2014 Approx. end date 3/1/2015

It is the policy of Northeastern University that no activity involving human subjects be undertaken until those activities have been reviewed and approved by the University's Institutional Review Board (IRB).

Anticipated funding source for project (or none) None

Has/will this proposal been/be submitted through:

- NU's Office of Research Administration and Finance (RAF)
- Provost
- Corp & Foundations
C. Will Participants Be:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Will Participants</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children (&lt;18)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeastern University Students?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutionalized persons?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prisoners?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitively Impaired Persons?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non or Limited English Speaking Persons?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People Living outside the USA?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnant Women/Fetuses?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other? (Please provide detail)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Does the Project Involve:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does the Project Involve</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blood Removal?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigational drug/device?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audiotapes/videotapes?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please answer each of the following questions using non-technical language. Missing or incomplete answers will delay your review while we request the information.

D. What are the goals of this research? Please state your research question(s) and related hypotheses.

The goal of this research is to develop an understanding and knowledge about teacher development in Haiti. The purpose of this study is to understand how teachers in Haiti perceive their professional development experiences.

Research question:
- How do teachers in a semi-rural town in Haiti experience and perceive professional development?

E. Provide a brief summary of the purpose of the research in non-technical language.

The purpose of this research is to understand how teachers in Haiti experience and perceive professional development. The information learned from the semi-structured in-depth interviews in this study will hopefully inform policy makers, practitioners and other individuals about how best to use teacher development in order to invest in education reform in Haiti. If the findings reveal that there is a deficiency in the teacher’s experiences, this study will inform and ameliorate practice and encourage future studies on in-service teacher professional development.
F. Identify study personnel on this project. Include name, credentials, role, and organization affiliation.

- Principal Investigator - Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters, Ph.D.; Northeastern University faculty located in Northeastern University College of Continuing Studies – will have minimal access to data

- Student Researcher – Sarah-Jane Quessa, MAT, CAGS; Curriculum Consultant for the Haiti Legacy Project. Doctoral (EdD) student in Northeastern University College of Continuing Studies. Will conduct all interviews.
  - All interviews will be transcribed and translated by the student researchers (Sarah-Jane Quessa) from Haitian Creole to English.

- Professional Translator – To be confirmed. The translator will translate the Call for Participation Letter, the Consent Form, Research Schedule and Debriefing Statement from English to Haitian Creole.
  - The Translator will not have access to the participant data, the student researcher will transcribe and translate all participant data from Haitian Creole to English.

G. Identify other organizations or institutions that are involved. Attach current Institutional Review Board (IRB) approvals or letters of permission as necessary.

The Haiti Legacy Project. No IRB is required for this organization.

H. Recruitment Procedures

| Describe the participants you intend to recruit. Provide all inclusion and exclusion criteria. Include age range, number of subjects, gender, ethnicity/race, socio-economic level, literacy level and health (as applicable) and reasons for exempting any groups. Describe how/when/by whom inclusion/exclusion criteria will be determined. |

Eligible participants will be history teachers who taught for at least two years and have volunteered to take part in the Haiti Legacy Project history in-service teacher professional development program.

The researcher intend on recruiting 6-10 participants who meet the eligible criteria and consent to participate in the study.

| Describe the procedures that you will use to recruit these participants. Be specific. How will potential subjects be identified? Who will ask for participation? If you intend to recruit using letters, posters, fliers, ads, website, email etc., copies must be included as attachments for stamped approval. Include scripts for intended telephone recruitment. |
Eligible participants will be selected from a pool of teachers who are participating in the Haiti Legacy Project (HLP) history teacher professional development program in Arcahaie, Haiti.

Upon the student researcher receiving IRB (see appendix C) approval from Northeastern University, the student researcher will travel to Haiti to conduct the interviews for the study. The Curriculum Development Director, from the HLP partner school will connect the researcher with teachers participating in the HLP history professional development.

The student researcher will have access to the teachers participating in HLP PD and they will be potential participants for this study. The researcher will give the teachers who are participating in the HLP history professional development the translated Call for Participation Letter (see Appendix A). This letter describes the study, requirement for eligible participants and requests their participation. The student researcher will identify 6-10 eligible participants who are willing to volunteer to participate in the study.

What remuneration, if any, is offered?

All participants in this study will receive a history book from the Haiti Legacy Project curriculum.

I. Consent Process

Describe the process of obtaining informed consent*. Be specific. How will the project and the participants’ role be presented to potential participants? By whom? When? Where? Having the participant read and sign a consent statement is done only after the researcher provides a detailed oral explanation and answers all questions. Please attach a copy of informed consent statements that you intend to use, if applicable. Click here for consent form templates.

If your study population includes non-English speaking people, translations of consent information are necessary. Describe how information will be translated and by whom. You may wait until the consent is approved in English before having it translated.

The eligible volunteers who choose to participate in the study will receive a translated Informed Consent form (see Appendix B) to sign. A professional translator (to be confirmed) will translate the Informed Consent form from English to Haitian Creole.

In addition, the student researcher (SQ) will be engaging orally with the participants in Haitian Creole (the native language). The student researcher will verbally explain the Consent form. This will ensure that the participant understand the study and the content in the consent form. Additionally, all questions that the participants have will be answered in Haitian Creole.

The above steps would ensure that all participants would provide both written and verbal consent. Consent will be recorded.
If your population includes children, prisoners, people with limited mental capacity, language barriers, problems with reading or understanding, or other issues that may make them vulnerable or limit their ability to understand and provide consent, describe special procedures that you will institute to obtain consent appropriately. If participants are potentially decisionally impaired, how will you determine competency?

A professional translator will translate the consent form from English to Haitian Creole to ensure accuracy in translation of the document. Furthermore, the student researcher will orally explain the content of the consent form in Haitian Creole to participants to ensure they understand the content in the consent form.

*If incomplete disclosure during the initial consent process is essential to carrying out the proposed research, please provide a detailed description of the debriefing process. Be specific. When will full disclosure of the research goals be presented to subjects (e.g., immediately after the subject has completed the research task(s) or held off until the completion of the study’s data collection)? By whom? Please attach a copy of the written debriefing statement that will be given to subjects.

A debriefing statement (See Appendix E) will be given to the participants immediately after the interviews are completed.

**J. Study Procedures**

Provide a detailed description of all activities the participant will be asked to do and what will be done to the participants. Include the location, number of sessions, time for each session, and total time period anticipated for each participant, including long term follow up.

Participants will participate in a semi-structured in-depth interview, which will be conducted by the student researcher in person.

The one-on-one semi-structured in-depth interviews will take 90-minutes to complete. The interview questions will allow participants to focus on and be reflective on who they are as teachers, current context and the meaning of their professional development experiences. No more then a combined total of 90 minutes of time will be required of participants. Interviews will take place at the Haiti Legacy Project site in Arcahaie, Haiti. Furthermore, the teachers will be asked to share suggested visual artifacts that exemplify their experience as teachers in this town and their professional development experience.

The data will be translated and transcribed by the student researcher. The initial coding will be emailed to the participants within one month of interviews. The participants will have a week to provide feedback about the validity and request modifications and alterations to the data.
Who will conduct the experimental procedures, questionnaires, etc? Where will this be done? Attach copies of all questionnaires, interview questions, tests, survey instruments, links to online surveys, etc.

The student researcher (Sarah-Jane Quessa) conduct all one-on-one interviews. Every step of the research process will be conducted in person in Arcahaie, Haiti at the Haiti Legacy Project professional development site. The interview schedule (see appendix D) is attached.

**K. Risks**

Identify possible risks to the participant as a result of the research. Consider possible psychological harm, loss of confidentiality, financial, social, or legal damages as well as physical risks. What is the seriousness of these risks and what is the likelihood that they may occur?

This study present minimal risks to the participants. However, participants will have the slight risk of discussing personal information, which may contribute to slight (non-physical) discomfort. Loss of confidentiality is also a possible risk.

Describe in detail the safeguards that will be implemented to minimize risks. What follow-up procedures are in place if harm occurs? What special precautions will be instituted for vulnerable populations?

Safeguards will be implemented to minimize participant discomfort and ensure confidentiality. Participants will be informed in Haitian Creole orally and in the translated consent form that they are free to decline from answering any questions and can request to move to the next question. In addition, participants will be told in Haitian Creole orally and in the Consent Form (Appendix B) that they can withdraw from the study at any time to minimize risk of discomfort.

Measures to ensure confidentiality (see section L) include assigning pseudonyms to all participants, in addition only the student researcher and the principal investigator (Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters) will have access to all materials and data. All electronic files will be encrypted and kept on the researcher password protected personal laptop and password protected cloud file as backup.

**L. Confidentiality**

Describe in detail the procedures that will be used to maintain anonymity or confidentiality during collection and entry of data. Who will have access to data? How will the data be used, now and in the future?

The information on confidentiality will be revealed both in verbal explanation in Haitian Creole and the translated informed consent form. The researcher will protect the anonymity of the
participants by assigning pseudonyms and developing composite representations of each individual.

All data gathered will remain on the students password protected personal laptop. All handwritten documents will be stored in the student researchers locked file cabinets in the student researchers home office. Data will remain confidential and will only be accessible with the use of passwords by the principal investigator (Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters) and the student researcher (Sarah-Jane Quessa).

All data gathered will be used for the student researcher’s doctoral dissertation, and potentially future academic publications and presentations. Confidentiality will be kept for all participants in all potential publications.

How and where will data be stored? When will data, including audiotapes and videotapes, be destroyed? If data is to be retained, explain why. Will identifiers or links to identification be destroyed? When? Signed consent documents must be retained for 3 years following the end of the study. Where and how will they be maintained?

As stated in the confidentiality section, measures will be taken to ensure anonymity of the participants. This includes the process of gathering, storing and managing the data. All participants will be assigned pseudonyms. All information will remain confidential and will be disclosed only with the participant’s expressed written request/ permission or as required by law. The interviews will be recorded using Audio Memos on the student’s personal ipad and a traditional tape recorder for back up. Transcriptions, typed researcher notes and typed memos will be kept confidential and saved on student researchers personal desktop and on student researcher’s cloud storage account as a backup. Any hand written documents will be stored in a locked file cabinet in student researchers home office (3600 Mystic Pointe Drive #1717 Aventura, Fl. 33180). Electronic files will be stored and will be encrypted and password protected, and only the Principal Investigator (Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters) and the student researcher will have access.

The student researcher will conduct all translation and transcriptions of interviews. Upon completion of the dissertation all-hard copies of documents, identifiers and links to participants identification will be destroyed; additionally all papers will be shredded and all files will be deleted. The sign consent form will be stored in a locked file cabinet in the student researchers home office for three years following the completion of this study as indicated this Northeastern Application for IRB approval form.

M. **If your research is HIPAA-protected, please complete the following:**

**Individual Access to PHI**

Describe the procedure that will be used for allowing individuals to access their PHI or, alternatively, advising them that they must wait until the end of the study to review their PHI.

N/A
**N. Benefits**

**What benefits can the participant reasonably expect from his/her involvement in the research? If none, state that. What are potential benefits to others?**

There is no direct benefit to the participants in this study. However, upon completion of the interviews the participants will be provided a book from the Haiti Legacy Project curriculum. Furthermore, during the interviews the participants will have an opportunity to be reflective about their experience in in-service professional development that they have participated in and how these experiences influence their instructional practices.

On a larger societal scale, this study will benefit future teacher developers and researchers who are interested in improving teacher professional development experiences and this may help inform the future professional development experiences of the larger teaching community.

This study benefits the student researcher (Sarah-Jane Quessa) by contributing to the completion requirement of the EdD (Doctor of Education) program at Northeastern University and informs future studies and publications.

**O. Attachments**

*Identify attachments that have been included and those that are not applicable (n/a).*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Copy of fliers, ads, posters, emails, web pages, letters for recruitment *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Scripts of intended telephone conversations*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Copies of IRB approvals or letters of permission from other sites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Informed Consent Form(s)* (see our templates for examples)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Debriefing Statement*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Copies of all instruments, surveys, focus group or interview questions, tests, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Signed Assurance of Principal Investigator Form (required)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>NIH Human Subject Training Certificate(s) (required if not already on file at HSRP)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Approved forms must be stamped by the IRB before use*

**P. Health Care Provision During Study**

Please check the applicable line:

---

_N/A_ I have read the description of HIPAA “health care” within Section 4 of the Policies & Procedures for Human Research Protection. I am not a HIPAA-covered health care provider and no health care will be provided in connection with this study.

---

_N/A_ I am a HIPAA-covered health care provider or I will provide health care in connection with this study as described in Section 4 of the Policies & Procedures for Human Research Protection. This health care is described above under “Study Procedures,” and the Informed Consent and Health Information Use and Disclosure Authorization form will be used with all prospective study participants.
If you have any questions about whether you are a HIPAA-covered health care provider, please contact Nan C. Regina, Director, Human Subject Research Protection at n.regina@neu.edu or (617) 373-4588.

Completed applications should be submitted to Nan C. Regina, Director, Human Subject Research Protection with the exception of applications from faculty and students of the College of Professional Studies, which should be submitted to Kate Skophammer, IRB Coordinator for CPS.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nan C. Regina, Director</th>
<th>CPS applications only</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Northeastern Univ., Human Subject Research Protection</td>
<td>Kate Skophammer, IRB Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>360 Huntington Ave., Mailstop: 960 Renaissance Park</td>
<td>Northeastern Univ., College of Professional Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston, MA 02115-5000</td>
<td>Phone: 617.390.3450; <a href="mailto:k.skophammer@neu.edu">k.skophammer@neu.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone: 617.373.4588; Fax: 617.373.4595</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="mailto:n.regina@neu.edu">n.regina@neu.edu</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The application and accompanying materials may be sent as email attachments or in hard copy. A signed Assurance of Principal Investigator Form may be sent as a scan, via fax or in hard copy.
Appendix D

Interview Protocol/ Questions

Part 1: Introductory Protocol

Thank you for agreeing to participate in this interview today. The goal of this interview is to learn about your perspective and experience in various professional development opportunities since you have been a teacher. Over the next 90 minutes I will be asking you a series of questions about your experience since you have been a teacher. There are no right or wrong answers. Everyone has a different experience and perspective. I want to hear from you and how you feel about these experiences. Anything you say during the interview will be kept confidential.

I am asking your permission to audiotape this interview because I do not want to miss your comments. I will be the only one listening to this interview. I will also be taking notes. All recording and notes will be destroyed once I am through analyzing the data. You will be assigned a pseudonym to protect your anonymity and any reports resulting from this study will not have any comments, names or anything that would identify you. More specifically, I will not share your responses with other teachers or the director of your school. Do you have any questions?

Please write your email address in the consent form in order to get a copy of your data.

I would like to begin recording, is that alright with you? The audio recording has begun.

To meet our human subjects requirements at the Northeastern University, participants have to read, sign and verbally agree to the Consent Form. The Consent Form for this study 'Voices of Haitian teachers: Teacher perception of professional development in Haiti’. You are being asked to participate in one interview focused around your teaching and professional development experiences. There are no foreseeable risks or discomforts to you for taking part in this study, and there are also no direct benefits to you for participating in the study.

As already stated, everything you say will remain confidential. Only the researchers will know that you have volunteered to participate in this study. I will use pseudonyms on any reports or publications based on this research. You do not have to participate and you can refuse to answer any question. Even if you begin the study, you may withdraw at any time. You will receive a book from the HLP curriculum upon completion of this interview. If you have any questions about this study you have the contact information for me as well as the Principal Investigator is listed, and contact information is also listed for the Director of Human Subject Research Protection at Northeastern University should you have any other questions about your rights in this research (and you can call that person confidentially, if you wish).

Do you have any additional questions or concerns about the interview process or this form? Do you give your verbal consent? Great, thank you.

This interview will last 90 minutes. Do you have any questions at this time?
**Part 2: Interview Protocol**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions:</th>
<th>Follow up/probing questions:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Background information: Who are the teachers?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Can you tell me the story of how and why you became a teacher? | What was your motivation to becoming a teacher?  
Is teaching what you expected it to be? |
| Can you tell me about the academic experience and the process that you went through to become a teacher? | What was this program or experience like? What did you do?  
What is the highest level you completed in school? |
| What are the stages in the process of becoming or qualifying to be a teacher in your town/school? | Did you feel prepared to teach history?  
Did you feel prepared to teach your grade level after going through this process? |
| Why did you become a history teacher? | Can you tell me about a history course that you took in your training process?  
Why is history important? |

**What is the school context?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions:</th>
<th>Follow up/probing questions:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Can you tell me about your current school? | How many students are in your school?  
How many students are in one of your classes?  
What is it like to be a teacher in your school?  
How long have you worked in this school?  
What is the culture of your school like?  
Is your school public or private?  
What is the demographics of the students in your school? |

**Teaching information: What is their teaching experience?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions:</th>
<th>Follow up/probing questions:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How long have you been a teacher?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Can you tell me a memorable story about your teaching experience? | What do you find easy, fun, exciting?  
What is your best teaching experience or moment? |
| Can you tell me a story about a challenge you had teaching? | What is your worst teaching experience?  
What do you find challenging or difficult?  
What do you do to overcome these challenges? |
| Can you tell me about a history lesson or unit that you taught? | |
| Do you also work in a leadership position in your school? | What other content have you taught?  
What grade levels have you taught? |
| What do you do to improve your teaching practice? | What is your role?  
Do you encourage teachers to participate in professional development? |

**Professional development experiences and perception**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions:</th>
<th>Follow up/probing questions:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do you think all teachers need to participate in professional development?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think professional development is useful?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What kind of learner are you?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do you think PD can impact your teaching?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How can PD impact your student’s experience?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can you tell me about the professional development experiences you have</td>
<td>Did these PD experiences cater to your learning needs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>participated in since you began teaching?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who administered this professional development?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How long was it? Was it concurring?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What were they about- (content development, pedagogy)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can you tell me about a history PD that you’ve participated in?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What was this experience like?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think it is important for you to learn history?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have you ever traveled to another country for professional development?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is so, where, what did you do? How was this experience different or</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>similar to the PD you have experienced here?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does your school leaders (principals) provide professional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>opportunities?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they encourage teachers to participate in professional development?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If so, what kinds of PD?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have you ever participated in planning or leading a PD?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If so, please tell me about this experience?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haiti Legacy Project</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why did you participate in the Haiti legacy project?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What do you think about the Haiti legacy project PD experience?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was it useful? Is it applicable?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How will you apply the information gathered from that PD in your</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>instruction?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future PD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What kind of professional development would you like to participate in</td>
<td>How would this improve your instructional practice and student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the future?</td>
<td>learning?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What kind of professional development experience do you think the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teachers in your school would benefit from?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visuals: Please provide suggestions of visuals or artifacts in this</td>
<td>Explain what these visual or artifacts mean to you and your</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>town that articulates your experience as a teacher and your professional development experiences.</td>
<td>experiences</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix E

Debriefing Statement

Dear Participant,

Thank you for your participation in this study. Your participation was very valuable to achieve the goals of this study.

There was some information about the study that was not disclosed with you prior to the study because they may have impacted your answers and skewed the data. The goal of this study was to develop an understanding of how teachers in your town experience and perceive in-service professional development. Based on prior research, we expected to find that participants might have had minimal access to in-service professional development. We did not disclose the background research so that we can learn about your experiences in in-service professional development.

In this study you were asked to participate in an in-depth semi structured interview. The interview questions allowed us to discuss your in-service professional development experiences and how you perceive these experiences.

Your participation is not only appreciated by the researcher but understanding your experiences will help to inform future planning of professional development opportunities and encourage further research on this topic. We hope this clarifies the purpose of this study. It is important that you do not discuss this research with anyone else until the study is complete.

If you have any questions about this study, please contact us.

Sarah-Jane Quessa email: Quessa.s@husky.neu.edu, Dr. Billye Sankofa Waters email: b.sankofawaters@neu.edu

Nan C. Regina, Director of Human Subject Research Protection email: n.regina@neu.edu

Thank you!

Sarah-Jane Quessa
Reference


*Critical Race Theory: The Cutting Edge*, 71-79.


Burrell, G., & Morgan, G. (1979). *Sociological paradigms and organizational analysis*


http://www.jstor.org/stable/3699853


educational research. *Compare, 38*(5), 525-538.

doi:10.1080/03057920802351283


doi:10.3102/0028312038004915


doi:10.1016/S1574-0692(06)02016-2


Haitipartners. (n.d) Retrieved from Haitipartners.org


Jackson, L. D. (2009). Revisiting adult learning theory through the lens of an adult
learner. *Adult Learning, 20*(3-4), 20.


doi: 10.1007/s11159-010-9183-7


doi: 10.5465/amp.2011.0141


National Center for Educational Statistics (NCES) 2011-2012


doi:10.1080/03057920050034101


doi:10.1080/13598660801971658


Teachers Without Boarders (www.teacherswithoutboarders.org)

The Haitian Constitution, 1987, Article XXXII


doi: 10.1177/1098214005283748


Young, E. Y. (2011). The four personae of racism educators’(mis) understanding of
individual vs. systemic racism. *Urban Education, 46*(6), 1433-1460.

doi: 10.1177/0042085911413145
